

24

BRIEFING PAPER NO.

PILdAT

JUNE 2006

BRIEFING PAPER

FOR PAKISTANI PARLIAMENTARIANS

Strengthening Democracy and Democratic Institutions in Pakistan

www.pildat.org

How can Parliamentarians
make an effective
contribution?

Gender-Responsive Budget

PILdAT
Pakistan Institute of
Legislative Development
And Transparency

24

BRIEFING PAPER NO.

PILdAT

JUNE 2006

BRIEFING PAPER

FOR PAKISTANI PARLIAMENTARIANS

Strengthening Democracy and Democratic Institutions in Pakistan

How can Parliamentarians
make an effective
contribution?

Gender-Responsive Budget

www.pildat.org

PILdAT
Pakistan Institute of
Legislative Development
And Transparency

PILDAT is an independent, non-partisan and not-for-profit indigenous research and training institution with the mission to strengthen democracy and democratic institutions in Pakistan. PILDAT has been actively engaged with building the capabilities of elected Legislators towards a better discharge of their functions of Legislation, Representation and Oversight. PILDAT regularly conducts training/briefing workshops and sessions for Legislators belonging to the National and Provincial Assemblies as well as the Senate. As a non-partisan political research institution, PILDAT regularly prepares well-researched briefing/background papers and Case Studies for Pakistani Parliamentarians, Parliamentary Staff, citizens at large and politicians on a wide range of issues.

PILDAT is a registered non-profit entity under the Societies Registration Act XXI of 1860, Pakistan.

©Pakistan Institute of Legislative Development And Transparency - PILDAT

All rights reserved. Any part of this publication may be reproduced or translated by duly acknowledging the source. This book is provided gratis or sold, subject to the condition that it shall not, by way of trade or otherwise, be lent, re-sold, hired out or otherwise circulated without the publisher's prior consent in any form of binding or cover.

First Published: June 2006

ISBN:

969-558-021-1

978-969-558-021-9

Typeset in Swiss

Printed by: Son Printers, Lahore

Price: Rs. 100

With Support From

UK Government's Global Opportunities Fund through the British High Commission, Islamabad

Published by



Pakistan Institute of Legislative Development and Transparency

No. 7, 9th Avenue, F-8/1, Islamabad, Pakistan

Tel: (+ 92-51) 111-123-345; Fax: (+ 92-51) 226-3078

E-mail: info@pildat.org; URL: www.pildat.org

CONTENTS

Abbreviations and Acronyms

Foreword

Profile of the Author

Introduction	07
Budgeting for Equity	
Sex and Gender	
Why a Gender Perspective in the Budget?	
What are Gender Responsive Budgets?	
Assessment of Gender Responsiveness of the Budget	
Gender Analysis of the Budget	
Initiatives to Support Gender Responsive Budgeting in Other Countries	10
Best Practices in Gender Responsive Budgeting	
Achievements of Gender Responsive Budgeting Initiatives	
Lessons Learnt	
Engendering Budgetary Process in Pakistan: An Overview	12
Major Policy Initiatives	
Evolution of Gender-Based Policies	
Do Policies adequately Address Gender Issues?	
Gender Responsive Budgeting Initiatives	
Gender Mainstreaming	
Is Gender Sensitive Data Available for GRB?	
Is Sufficient Expertise Available for GRB?	
Role of Parliamentarians in Relating Equity in the Budget Process in Pakistan	15
What is the Role of Parliamentarians in the Development of a GRB in Pakistan?	
Why Should Parliamentarians have a Greater Role in the Deliberations on Gender Mainstreaming in the Budget Process?	
Strategies for Enhancing the Role of Parliamentarians in the Development of a Gender Responsive Budget	15
Appendix 1: Suggested further readings	16
Appendix 2: Useful internet sites	18

PILDAT
BRIEFING PAPER

HOW CAN PARLIAMENTARIANS MAKE AN EFFECTIVE CONTRIBUTION?
GENDER-RESPONSIVE BUDGET

Abbreviations and Acronyms

ASEAN	Association of South East Asian Nations
AWID	Association for Women's Rights in Development
CEDAW	Convention for Elimination of all Forms of Discrimination Against Women
GNP	Gross National Product
GOP	Government of Pakistan
GRAP	Gender Reform Action Plan
GRAPs	Gender Reform Action Plans
GRB	Gender Responsive Budgets
GRBIs	Gender Responsive Budgeting Initiatives
GTZ	German Agency for Technical Cooperation
IDASA	Institute for Democracy in South Africa
IDRC	International Development Research Centre
IPU	Inter Parliamentary Union
MoWD	Ministry of Women's Development
MPs	Members of Parliament
MTDF	Medium Term Development Framework
NPDEW	National Policy for Development and Empowerment of Women
OECD	Organisation for Economic Cooperation and Development
PC-1	Planning Commission Proforma 1 for Project Proposals
PC-5	Planning Commission Proforma 5 for Project Proposals
PILDAT	Pakistan Institute of Legislative Development And Transparency
PRSP	Pover ty Reduction Strategy Paper
SPDC	Social Policy Development Centre
SNA	System of National Accounts
UK	United Kingdom
UN	United Nations
UNDP	United Nations Development Programme
UNFPA	United Nations Fund for Population Activities
UNIFEM	United Nations Fund for Women
USAID	United States Agency for International Development
WBI	World Bank Institute

PIL DAT
BRIEFING PAPER

HOW CAN PARLIAMENTARIANS MAKE AN EFFECTIVE CONTRIBUTION?
GENDER-RESPONSIVE BUDGET

FOREWORD

Ensuring that members of Parliament are able to influence decisions and resource allocations requires that MPs be provided with knowledge and skills for influencing the agendas and processes of decision-making related to the budgetary process in parliament. Parliamentarians' participation in the budget process offers new perspectives and development priorities, including the integration of gender issues in the development goals and policies to reduce poverty.

How can Parliamentarians Make an effective contribution: Gender-Responsive Budget, a briefing paper by PILDAT, is a special presentation for Parliamentarians to develop their parliamentary skills and understanding that is so crucial towards the discharge of their duties as public representatives. Authored by Mohammed Sabir, National Expert, Gender-Responsive Budgeting Initiative, Ministry of Finance, the paper provides practical advice and guidelines to MPs on how they can play a stronger and productive role in the budget debate by equipping them with the skills needed to contribute to the development of a gender-responsive budget and bring gender equality perspectives to bear on legislation and public policies and programmes. The paper also highlights the various initiatives specifically adopted to promote gender responsive budgeting by the government of Pakistan during the recent years and examines the role of Parliamentarians in the development of a gender-responsive budget.

PILDAT would like to acknowledge and appreciate the financial contribution of UK Government's **Global Opportunities Fund, and the British High Commission**, Islamabad in producing this briefing paper.

The author, PILDAT and its team of researchers have made every effort to ensure the accuracy of the contents of this paper. The author, PILDAT the Global Opportunities Fund and the British High Commission, Islamabad, however, do not accept any responsibility of any omission or error as it is not deliberate. The views expressed in this paper are not necessarily those of PILDAT, the Global Opportunities Fund or the British High Commission, Islamabad.

Islamabad
June 2006

PIL DAT
BRIEFING PAPER

HOW CAN PARLIAMENTARIANS MAKE AN EFFECTIVE CONTRIBUTION?
GENDER-RESPONSIVE BUDGET

PROFILE OF THE AUTHOR



Mohammad Sabir currently serves as National Expert for UNDP Supported “Gender Responsive Budgeting Initiative” project under the Ministry of Finance. He has about ten years of experience in research and academia. Previously he was working as Senior Economist in the Social Policy and Development Centre-SPDC, Karachi. He has also served as a visiting faculty in leading academic institutions including University of Karachi, Bahria University, and National Institute of Banking and Finance, Karachi. He has participated in various national and international conferences on issues such as gender responsive budgeting, intergovernmental fiscal relations, macroeconomic reforms, human capital formation and poverty and gender mainstreaming. He has a number of publications to his credit

Introduction

Budgeting for Equity

Contrary to common perception, the budget is more than just a technical instrument compiling income and expenditure of the government. In fact, it is the most important policy statement reflecting the fundamental values underlying national policy. It contains the government's financial plans for the upcoming year. It is a declaration of the government's fiscal, financial and economic objectives and reflects its socioeconomic priorities. It also implicitly reflects the level of gender sensitivity of government policy. In addition, the budget provides a valuable measure of the government's future intentions and past performance.

In view of the increasing calls for greater parliamentary involvement in the budget process, the concept of gender-responsive budgeting has increasingly come into the limelight. In order to strengthen the role of GRB in the budgeting process various tools have been proposed to put it into practice. This briefing paper looks at the various related concepts and methods used in preparing and integrating a gender perspective in the budget. It also provides few examples of its adoption and highlights various initiatives specifically adopted to promote gender responsive budgeting by the government of Pakistan during the recent years; and examines the role of Parliamentarians in the development of a gender-responsive budget.

Sex and Gender

There often exists confusion between the two terms sex and gender. While sex is used to refer to the basic biological differences between males and females, gender has taken on a more complex meaning. As a concept, it refers to socio-cultural characteristics, which vary and evolve on the basis of religion, education, socio-cultural values or economic variables and ultimately determine the role and place of men and women in society. In all countries, developed and developing, gender roles and relationships change slowly over time. These gender roles are determined by society and transmitted through cultural traditions, beliefs and norms. Gender identities and relationships are ascribed to people by the societies they live in. Moreover, the varying roles of women and men in

their communities generate different needs and concerns.

Why a Gender Perspective in the Budget?

Although a budget appears to be a gender-neutral policy instrument set out in terms of financial aggregates, containing a set of expenditure and revenue statistics and the resulting budget surplus or deficit with no particular mention of women or of men, it affects different people - women, men, boys and girls differently. Thus, the way government collects its revenue and spends its money will mean very different things to women and men in rural areas, or to middle class women and men. Therefore, budgets that appear to be gender-neutral may in fact be gender-blind. The purpose of bringing a gender perspective to the budget is to ensure that budgets and associated economic policies address the needs of women and men, girls and boys of different backgrounds equitably, and attempt to narrow any social and economic gaps that exist between them.

The Economic Costs of Gender Inequality

There is growing awareness that gender inequality is inefficient; it is not only costly to women, but it is also costly to children and to many men. It exacts costs through lower output, reduced development of people's capacities, less leisure and diminished well-being.

1. Research on agricultural productivity in Africa shows that by reducing gender inequality in the provision of agricultural inputs and education, yields obtained by women farmer could be increased by 20 per cent (Saito and Spurling, 1992).
2. Research on economic growth and education shows that everything else being equal, countries in which the ratio of female-to-male enrolment in elementary education is less than 75 percent can expect levels of GNP that are roughly 25 per cent lower than countries in which there is less gender disparity in education (Hill and King, 1995).
3. Research on gender inequality in the labour market shows that eliminating gender discrimination in occupation and pay could increase not only women's income but also national income. (Tzannatos, 1991).

4. Gender inequality also reduces the productivity of the next generation, while the World Bank reports mounting evidence that increases in women's well-being yield productivity gains in the future (World Bank, 1995).
5. Women's time burdens are an important constraint on growth and development women are an over-utilised, not an under-utilised resource. The benefits of reducing this gender-based constraint can be considerable. For instance, a study in Tanzania shows that reducing such constraints in a community of smallholder coffee and banana growers increases household cash incomes by 10 per cent, labour productivity by 15 per cent and capital productivity by 44 per cent (Tibajuka, 1994).

The rationale for gender budgeting is straightforward, but highly political. Simply put, every rupee spent by the government has a different impact on women and men, boys and girls. Gender sensitive budgeting ensures allocation of adequate funds for achieving gender equality commitments and aids in avoiding a negative impact on women by assessing the impact of budgets on gender relations. Therefore, budget allocations by Government should be carefully determined and monitored.

What are Gender-Responsive Budgets?

“Gender responsive budgets,” “gender budgets”, or “gender-sensitive budgets” entail a breakdown of the government's budget according to its impact on women and men, boys and girls and different groups of women and men, taking cognisance of the society's underpinning gender relations. Therefore, it is important to appreciate the fact that gender-responsive budgets are not separate budgets for women or for men, but rather are actual budgets that are planned, approved, implemented, monitored and audited in a gender-sensitive manner.

On the surface, all budgets share common characteristics. In reality, there are, however, many differences such as in the form in which they are presented and in the level of detail provided. There can be a single budget for the whole country or separate budgets for different levels (national,

provincial/regional, local). Gender-responsive budgeting differs from other budget initiatives in that it does not treat the household as a single unit but instead highlights that the access to and control over resources and the bargaining power of household members differ. It also explicitly takes into account the unpaid care work which is undertaken primarily by women and girls.

Gender responsive budgeting aims to formulate the budget in a gender-responsive way; link gender responsive policies with adequate budgetary funds; implement the budget so as to benefit women, men girls and boys equitably; and monitor the impact of expenditure and revenue raising from a gender perspective.

It is important for member of parliaments wanting to do gender budget work to understand the budget development process. To prepare a gender-sensitive budget it is necessary to include sex disaggregated measures of inputs, outputs and outcomes as well a to explicitly identify equity as an indicator of performance.

Assessment of Gender Responsiveness of the Budget

Articulating issues of gender inequality, oppression and discrimination and gathering results on them in a legislature where the majority are men requires a different set of skills from the usual ones. Gender budgeting is a tool, which can be used to expose gender inequalities and biases in the distribution of public resources. It can be used to move the debate on gender issues away from mere sentimental or moral exhortations to concrete demands supported by economic arguments.

Female and male legislators can use the research findings of gender budget initiatives to highlight the invisible and unpaid contributions of women to the economy. They can ask researchers and government officials to expose the trade-offs between production and human capabilities, which poor and resource-constrained women often have to make. This will show in real figures what a whole nation could gain economically if the budget were to reduce the burden of water and fuelwood collection on women and so on. Gender budgeting can therefore enhance the representational role of legislators.

While examining spending, MPs need to consider expenditure in terms of the following three categories:

- Expenditures targeted at gender issues and groups of men or women, boys or girls such as expenditures on schools only for girls or boys, women health projects etc. Many governments have allocated special funds for women's programmes;
- Spending related to equal employment opportunities by government agencies to promote gender equality in public service domain. For example, day-care facilities for employees' children, paid parental leave, or special training for women to build their human capital; and
- Mainstream allocations need to be examined for their gendered impacts. Most of the expenditures fall in this category, which necessitates the examination of such allocations with respect to addressing the needs of women and men, girls and boys of different social and economic backgrounds equitably. For example who benefits the most from government spending on primary health care, government supported literacy programmes and other subsidies.

Although it is relatively easy to calculate the percentage of the budget going to category 1, having a relatively big percentage for this category does not necessarily show that the budget is gender-responsive. For example, if government decides to move to a policy of mixed schools, the percentage of the education budget allocated for separate girls' and boys' schools will fall. This will result in the percentage allocated for category 1 falling. But the system of mixed schools might deliver education for girls more effectively than separate schools. For example, parents may feel happier if they know that their girl children can be accompanied to school by their boy children.

The third category while being the most difficult to analyse, is also the most important. If we look only at categories 1 and 2, we are not getting to the heart of the budget. If we look only at categories 1 and 2, we are not acknowledging that women and girls are full citizens of Pakistan.

To incorporate a gender dimension in the budget, government can be required to accompany each sector budget with a gender-aware budget statement indicating the expected impact the sector budget will have on women and men, girls and boys. It can also produce one statement

covering expected gender impacts of all revenues and expenditures as part of the package of budget related documentation.

Alternatively, parliamentarians can commission their own research and use the findings to put questions on the budget during debate. There are many approaches to ensuring that expenditures address the needs of women and men equitably. The Philippines, for example, has enacted a law that defines mandates and processes and allocates resources for integrating gender in development.

Gender-Analysis of the Budget

Gender budgets propose resource allocations to address poor women and girls' unmet needs with a view to close existing gender gaps. Areas where budget cuts can be made are also proposed. Although gender budgets tend to concentrate on expenditures, however more recently, gender responsive budgeting initiatives include a gender analysis of taxation as well.

Although, there is no single blueprint that fits every context, a range of technical tools for doing gender-responsive budgeting exist. These include:

Gender-Aware Policy Appraisal of Public Expenditure by Sector

Generally in order to assess the gender responsiveness of the budget a five-step approach is used for each sector. The essence of the approach is to understand the extent to which budgets reflect the policy priorities of governments, and the extent to which policies reflect the different situation of women and men, girls and boys in society. Income, age and disability result in different impacts on men and women. Therefore analyses do not consider all women or all girls as homogeneous groups.

The gender analysis begins with a description of the different situation of women and men, girls and boys for each sector and identifying their underlying causes and effects, both immediate and long-term. Very often, parliamentarians and civil society organisations have a fair idea about the social and economic situation of women and men, girls and boys in their constituencies. Moreover, relevant data can be found in the line ministries, statistical departments and international reports.

Following this, the sectoral policy and programme documents are examined to see whether they adequately address the gender issues previously identified. Is the policy gender neutral, pro-women leading to a reduction in gender gaps, or pro-men leading to increase gender inequality?

The difficult part of the analysis is related to the budget itself. For each sector, the question is posed “to what extent does the budget reflect the gender-sensitive policies identified and to what extent does it address the gender gaps and issues described in the sector situation?”

The next step in the process is to monitor whether the expenditures are going as planned in the budget or do they deviate substantially. Parliamentarians are in better position to judge the implementation of budget as well as to analyse the impact of deviation in budget through a gender lens.

The final step requires a detailed examination of the impact of the policy and expenditure reflected through outcome indicators i.e. whether it has promoted gender equity as intended at the time of budgeting and implementation. This step helps to understand the effectiveness of various policies and can be used as a guiding mechanism for future reference.

Gender-Disaggregated Beneficiary Assessment of Public Service Delivery

A gender aware beneficiary assessment is a tool that can be used to find out the extent to which a service addresses the needs of poor women and men. It is a measure of how poor people, themselves, value a particular service. Beneficiary assessments help to identify the different needs of women and men belonging from different social and economic groups and analysing whether or not these are met by budget activities. Gender aware beneficiary assessment can increase the capacities of legislatures to determine the effectiveness of public programmes.

Gender-Disaggregated Public Expenditure Benefit Incidence Analysis

Sex-disaggregated public expenditure incidence analysis can be done to estimate the unit cost of providing a service and the level of utilisation by different groups of women and men. Through this tool the extent to which men and women,

girls and boys benefit from expenditure on publicly provided services can be analysed. Some surveys done using this tool have revealed that a public service that was intended primarily for poor women actually benefited richer women relatively more.

Gender-Disaggregated Analysis of Impact of Budget on Time Use

Gender-disaggregated analysis of the impact of the budget on time use aims at analysing how government resource allocation and revenue raising patterns impact on the amount of different types of paid and unpaid work carried out and the way that time is spent by women and men. Empirical evidence has shown that cuts in expenditure for social services or the introduction of user fees often increases women's time burden. The work that women do in the care economy remains invisible in the System of National Accounts (SNA) and it is thus only through this sort of analysis that the impact can be seen.

Gender Budget Statement

A gender budget statement is an accountability tool, which a government uses to inform parliamentarians and members of civil society about what it is doing to advance gender equality. Based on gender budget statement, legislatures can examine whether governments' commitments to gender equality are reflected in public spending and revenue collection. Do governments walk their talk? In the same way, gender budget statement can be used as a powerful tool to hold governments accountable with respect to international agreements on gender equality such as the Convention on All Forms of Discrimination Against Women (CEDAW), the Beijing Global Platform For Action, etc. Legislatures can use information from gender budget statement to call for greater accountability to women, girls and other marginalized groups.

Initiatives to Support Gender Responsive Budgeting in Other Countries

Gender responsive budgeting has now been introduced in varying forms in more than forty countries throughout the world. These exercises emerged out of feminist practical politics initially in Australia, and later in a number of other countries. The idea of gender responsive budgets gathered

further momentum when the United Nations Beijing Platform for Action in 1995 called for the integration of a gender perspective into budgetary decision-making. Some of the inventive gender responsive budgeting initiatives in different countries are highlighted below.

Best Practices in Gender Responsive Budgeting

Australia

Australia was the first country to introduce a gender-sensitive budget analysis when the federal government initiated an assessment of budget for its impact on women and girls. It established a model whereby each government agency was required to provide an audit of the annual budget of the government's achievements in relation to women and girls. It strongly emphasized that all public programs and expenditures were relevant for GRB, not just those expenditures directly allocated to women and girls. The results were published in women's budget statements that were presented together with the annual budget documents. The government-led initiative was coordinated by the Offices on the Status of Women but was abandoned at the federal level in 1996 after a change in government.

South Africa

South Africa's Women's Budget Initiative is one of the best-documented Gender Budget Initiatives; which endeavors to assess the national, provincial, and local budgets from a gender perspective by tracking the impact of the budget on women. A strong alliance between civil society activists and government departments is one of the key features of the project. An important point to note is that the concrete impact of such projects, which have a national scope, is usually observable over time after a slow and gradual process.

Sri Lanka

The GRB initiative in Sri Lanka initially focused on the portfolios of health, education, public sector employment, agriculture, industry and social services. Later on, the GRB analysis was extended to all expenditure categories other than interest payments. The GRB analysis proposed an effective rationalization of various programmes under a few broad schemes that would enhance the social and economic well being of women. It also recommended an

adequate provision of funds instead of proliferation of schemes with thin distribution of resources.

India

The Ministry of Finance has recently set up an expert group on "Classification System of Government Transactions" and a sub-group on GRB process and priorities at the central government level. The expert group has recommended several changes in budget format that clearly highlight the gender sensitivities of budgetary allocations. The group also recommended the introduction of periodic benefit-incidence analysis of selected categories of public expenditures. The Ministry of Finance is currently examining the recommendations for incorporation in future budgets. If implemented, India will be the first country to institutionalize a sustainable process of gender budgeting in the Ministry of Finance.

Achievements of Gender Responsive Budget Initiatives

Although still in their early stages, gender budget initiatives have scored important successes, ranging from actual expenditure re-allocations to opening traditionally secretive budget processes to much greater transparency and accountability.

Re-prioritization of Expenditure

In the Philippines, the government has directed that all ministries allocate at least five percent of their resources to taking forward gender mainstreaming throughout government.

Exposing Policy Weaknesses

In Sri Lanka, the gender budget initiative has shown that while there is equality of access and usage in the social sectors such as education and health, targeting of women in the productive sectors, such as agriculture and industry, is weak. The initiative has recommended that resource flows into technology transfer, organizational strengthening, training, extension services and communications systems be targeted at improving the participation of women.

Exposing General Budgetary Weaknesses

The work on gender budgets has surfaced more general budgetary problems. For example, the work at local government level in Uganda has demonstrated that payments to government officials consume large portions of meager budgets, leaving little for actual programmes.

Developing Economic Literacy and Participation

The Uganda Women's Caucus has documented how the GRBI there helped new women legislators to demystify budget processes; led to the discovery that budgets were being crafted by just 6 to 8 officials; and that each year there was only a five percent variation in allocations such that biases and prejudices contained in the budget are perpetuated from year to year.

Lessons Learnt

The following lessons can be abstracted for the experience from GRBIs in other countries for Pakistan:

- The integration of gender-analysis into the budget process is a medium to long-term task and quick results are not to be expected from gender responsive initiatives. Therefore, continuity and the institutionalization of gender responsive budgeting are important.
- GRB has been proved to be more successful in countries where the civil society and government gender responsive budgeting initiatives complemented each other. This necessitates mutual trust, transparency and the accessibility to information and documents.
- Often, analytical tools cannot be applied because gender sensitive data is lacking. The collection of gender sensitive data and time use data has therefore to be one of the initial steps for the successful gender responsive budgeting.
- Generally medium term budgetary and development frameworks are based on the forecast from macroeconomic models. Therefore, an important step for gender

responsive budgeting is to “engender” macroeconomics.

Engendering Budgetary Process in Pakistan: An Overview

In recent years, Government of Pakistan has adopted a multi pronged approach with a paradigm shift to engender its budgetary and planning process, implementation of which is at a nascent stage. The main policies documents reflecting mainstreaming of gender issues include The Gender Reform Action Plan (GRAP), National Policy for Development and Empowerment of Women (NPDEW), Poverty Reduction Strategy Paper (PRSP) and Medium Term Development Framework (MTDF). Moreover, Gender Responsive Budgeting Initiative (GRBI), and Gender Mainstreaming Project are the integral parts of this approach.

Major Policy Initiatives

GRB and GRAP

GRAP includes one national and four provincial plans. GRAPs are over-arching plans to focusing on engendering planning and budgetary process to narrow the gap in public expenditure, restructuring of national machinery dealing with gender issues, facilitating policy shifts from social welfare to social development and women's development to gender equality. GRAPs have been designed under the ambit of liberalization and enlightened moderation. They take women's empowerment at the center and carry a view to enhance the participation of women across the gender and governance sphere. It is about creating space for women within the existing systems while trying to improve the efficiency of the system.

In order to incorporate gender dimension in policy formulation and implementation in fiscal policies and budget process for education and health sectors GRAPs suggested that policy and budgeting mechanisms to be based on following key initiatives:

- Gender aware policy analysis
- Gender disaggregated beneficiary analysis
- Gender disaggregated time use analysis

- Gender disaggregated public expenditure incidence analysis
- Gender disaggregated revenue incidence analysis
- Gender aware medium term economic framework
- Modification of Budget Call to include the instruction that all expenditure estimates of education and health be submitted with clear indication of their intended targeting and impact on women and men

In addition, GRAPs emphasize on the review of existing policy documents through gender lens and adoption of amendments pertaining to federal legislation and concurrent lists. Moreover, GRAPs also suggest that the policy formulation guidelines of Planning and Development to be revisited and redesigned to encompass gender in PC-1 to PC-5 forms.

GRB and PRSP

With the view to mainstream gender in policy budgeting process PRSP 2003 states:

“ In the longer term, the government will support the use of gender responsive budgeting (GRB) in analyzing the federal, provincial, and district government budgets to determine the extent to which resources are allocated to address gender inequality and impact of budgetary expenditures on different gender groups. It, however, does not construe separate budgets for women. The Government aims at launching a pilot study with the assistance of donors for postbudget analysis, to begin with health or education sector at the federal, one province, and two districts (rural and urban) level. Gradually, the institutional mechanism is likely to be in place on successful completion of the study. This will not only facilitate in improving women's status but also will introduce allocation efficiencies and contribute to national, social and economic development of the country. In addition, GRB can be help in measuring progress on national and international gender related commitments.”

GRB and MTDf

In order to incorporate gender in policy and budgeting process MTDf relied on enhancement of the status of women through promotion and protection of women's

rights, their empowerment and advancement, and their active participation and mainstreaming in all spheres and at all levels, so as to bridge the gender gaps and move towards gender equality. In this regard following are the four broad strategies presented in MTDf:

- Meeting women's basic minimum needs: making efforts towards broader horizontal linkages
- Poverty reduction, economic empowerment, social and legal empowerment, personal security and political participation:
- Affirmative actions to create a 'level playing field'
- Gender responsive budgeting and required investments

Evolution of Gender Based Policies

With respect to evolution of gender-based policies, Pakistan has adopted a two-step approach. In the first place a set of overarching policies has developed in line with national and international commitments. These policies provide an overall framework and set out priorities with gender focus while looking at the bigger picture, for instance GRAP, PRSP, MTDf and NPDEW etc. In the second step, sector specific policies try to address sector specific needs and provide guidelines to achieve a set of objectives for a particular sector, for e.g., education policy, health policy, etc. Generally, sector specific policies flow from overarching policies and presumably try to address gender issues.

Do Sector Policies adequately Address Gender Issues?

At sector level, the policy formulation process takes place through a set hierarchy of steps beginning with situation analysis or data collection to perform situation analysis. In general, these situational analyses as well as remaining steps either miss out or inadequately cover the gender dimension. For instance the recently conducted gender aware policy appraisal for education sector highlights that education policy does not properly address various demand side factors and the socio-cultural constraints attached with female education. Similarly population policy initially missed out the involvement of men in population planning and just focused on women for achieving a reduction in population growth. Recently, however after the realization of the role of men, male village-based family

planning workers were incorporated in population planning to enlighten and motivate males towards responsible parenthood and family health. These examples indicate that gender dimension can be added throughout the policy cycle and to bridge gender-gaps in output and outcome indicators.

Gender Responsive Budgeting Initiatives (GRBI)

The Ministry of Finance, Government of Pakistan with technical and financial support of UNDP and its cost sharing donors has initiated a two and half year's pilot project 'Gender Responsive Budgeting Initiative' (GRBI). The project aims to: a) develop skills to prepare, review and analyze budgets using the gender lens; b) promote policy and resource allocation with a gender perspective; and c) build advocacy skills of GOP and civil society organizations for gender budgeting.

The project will focus its analysis on the sectors of Education, Health and Population. The analysis will be carried out at the federal, provincial (Punjab) and district (Gujrat and Rajanpur) levels.

To achieve the above aims, activities are envisaged in the following five stages:

1. Awareness raising and consensus-building
2. Training in gender budgeting for the stakeholders
3. Gender analysis of the priority sectors
4. Review of the research
5. Advocacy

The following three interrelated outputs are foreseen:

1. Government spending addresses the needs of women and men equitably and attends especially to the needs of the poor
2. Budget reviewed through a gender lens, in order to analyze if budget allocations are in line with women's and men's different priorities and needs
3. Civil society and government partnership promotes transparency in the determination of government priorities and in public spending

Gender Mainstreaming

Ministry of Planning and Development has initiated a three-year project to mainstream gender issues into policies, development plans and programmes to promote gender equity in Pakistan. The key instruments for gender mainstreaming include gender considerations in all development programmes and projects; institutional strengthening programmes for government to have the capacity for gender mainstreaming; consistency in the policy context for women; gender focal points in all ministries; establishment of horizontal and vertical linkage development and provision of technical support by MoWD to the gender focal points in other ministries.

Is Gender-Sensitive Data Available for GRB?

It is generally believed that similar to other developing countries, in Pakistan the main challenge would be a lack of availability of gender-disaggregated data, which hinder researchers and civil society organizations to conduct gender analysis and government to produce gender budget statements. However, recently the Social Policy and Development Centre (SPDC) and Federal Bureau of Statistics with support of UNFPA published two separate reports containing gender-sensitive indicators include both sex-disaggregated data (i.e. data specified separately for male and female) and data on issues that are important from a gender perspective. For example, data on maternal mortality cannot be usefully sex-disaggregated as they refer only to women. Nevertheless, these data are important from a gender perspective and thus a part of gender-sensitive data.

Recently, the GRBI project has conducted a study to review the availability of the relevant data for gender responsive budgeting initiatives for the three sectors health, education and population. This review suggests that while there are some gaps for the education and population welfare sectors, the majority of the data are available. However, in case of the health sector, there is a greater deficiency in the availability of sex-disaggregated data especially in relation to non-reproductive health of male and female is not available.

Is Sufficient Expertise Available for GRB?

Presently, there exists a lack of expertise in developing and

implementing GRB. This is due to the fact that the incorporation of gender issues in policy formulation and implementation of the budget with a gender focus is a relatively new phenomenon. The concept of gender itself is not very well understood by the government officers and is generally perceived to relate to women only. In addition, a lesser representation of women in the civil services runs the risk of creating a bias in policy formulation and implementation. However, recently the GRBI and various civil society organizations conducted awareness raising and capacity building workshops for both members of civil society and government officials. As a result of these trainings, a pool of resource persons for GRB has been developed.

Role of Parliamentarians in Relating Equity in the Budget Process in Pakistan

There is an emerging trend among legislatures to strengthen their budgetary role in Parliament in Pakistan. Presently, political processes are opening up to citizens for greater engagement. As more women and representatives of other previously excluded groups take their place in legislatures, they seek not only to influence policies and budgets but also to transform the processes and culture of legislative decision-making.

What is the Role of Parliamentarians in the Development of GRB in Pakistan?

The role of parliamentarians in relating equity in budget process can be recapitulated under their two important functions: oversight function and work, which is carried out in parliamentary committees. In case of their oversight function, MPs in Pakistan can exercise their gender oversight role by monitoring the implementation of gender-sensitive laws and policies such as National Policy for the Development & Empowerment of Women (NPDEW) as well as regional and international instruments or agreements that promote gender equality and eliminate discrimination.

Much of parliament's important work is carried out in committees. Both male and female MPs can play a more effective role in the committees by addressing gender-related issues relevant to the policies of each ministry. One gender-sensitive budget strategy is to work through committees to identify gender issues and gender-target

allocations specific to given sectoral budgets such as agriculture, education, health and population welfare. By employing the gender-budgeting approach, parliamentarians can require government departments/sectors to produce expenditure analysis for their gender impacts within each budget cycle.

Why Should Parliamentarians have a Greater Role in the Deliberations on Gender Mainstreaming in the Budget Process?

By strengthening their skills to make a gender-based analyses of the budget the Parliamentarians can contribute to a more meaningful debate in Parliament and influence the agenda of decision-making. Understanding the main features of the budget provide parliamentarians much needed vital information and arguments to demand for more efficient and equitable resource allocations. Such initiatives enhance transparency, accountability and participation by legislators and civil society in determination of spending priorities and taxation policies. However, the executive needs to give opinionated support by opening up the budgeting process and responding positively to the criticism from gender budget analysts and advocates.

Strategies for Enhancing the Role of Parliamentarians in the Development of a Gender Responsive Budget

Each new idea needs a champion to take it forward. Parliamentarians can assume the responsibility for planning and institutionalizing a gender perspective in the budget by augmenting their skills and knowledge of undertaking a gender-based analysis and using these tools to ensure accountability and transparency of the executive in the process. Members of parliament can also deliberate on these issues in committees by involving civil society and media in highlighting the impact of gender-based policies on different segments of society. However, the appropriate institutional mechanism for introducing a gender perspective on the budget will be determined by the political and legislative system in place with respect to Pakistan. Without such a mechanism, however, the momentum for such a transformative process can be difficult to sustain.

Annexure 1

Suggested further readings

Alailima, P. J. (2003): Engendering the National Budget in Sri Lanka, paper presented at an IPU Regional Seminar for Parliaments of South West Asia, May 2003, Colombo, Sri Lanka.

Borges Sugiyama, N. (2002): Gendered Budget Work in the Americas: Selected Country Experiences, Austin: University of Texas.

Budlender D. (2006), Data Requirements needs for Gender Responsive Budgeting in Pakistan, Gender Responsive Budgeting Initiative, Government of Pakistan.

Budlender, D. (ed.) (1996): The Women's Budget, Cape Town (Institute for Democracy in South Africa).

Budlender, D. and G. Hewitt (2002): Gender Budgets Make More Cents: Country Studies and Good Practice, London (Commonwealth Secretariat).

Budlender, D. et al (eds) (2001): Gender Budget Trail, Makati City (Asia Foundation).

Budlender, D., R. Sharp and K. Allen (1998): How to Do a Gender-Sensitive Budget Analysis, Canberra and London (Australian Agency for International Development and Commonwealth Secretariat).

Byanyima, W. (2002): Gender-Responsive Budgeting: A Parliament-Civil Society Initiative in Uganda, paper presented at a GTZ conference 'Beyond the Review: Sustainable Poverty Alleviation and PRSPs, Berlin, Germany, 13-16 May 2002.

Center For Democracy And Governance (2000), USAID Handbook on Legislative Strengthening, Technical Publication Series Bureau for Global Programs, Field Support, and Research U.S. Agency for International Development Washington D.C.

Esim, S. (2000): Impact of Government Budgets on Poverty and Gender Equality, paper presented for the 'Inter-Agency Workshop on Improving the Effectiveness of Integrating Gender into Government Budgets', London, Commonwealth Secretariat, 26-27 April 2000.

Grown. C. and G. R. Gupta (2004): From Promises to Action: UN Millennium Project Interim Report of the Task Force on Education and Gender Equality.

Himmelweit, S. (2002), 'Making visible the hidden economy: the case for gender-impact analysis of economic policy, Feminist Economics Vol. 8 No. 1: 49-70.

Inter-Parliamentary Union (2001): Parliament and the budgetary process, including from a gender perspective: Regional Seminar for the Anglophone Parliaments of Africa, Geneva (IPU).

Inter-Parliamentary Union (2003): Parliament and the budgetary process, including from a gender perspective: Regional seminar for the ASEAN + 3 region, Geneva (IPU).

Inter-Parliamentary Union (IPU), United Nations Development Program (UNDP), World Bank Institute (WBI), United Nations Development Fund for Women (UNIFEM) (2004), Parliament, The Budget And Gender Handbook For Parliamentarians N° 6

Joachim Wehner and Winnie Byanyima (2004), Parliament, the Budgetary Process and Gender, IPU, UNIFEM, World Bank and UNDP collaboration.

Kabeer, N. (2003): Gender Mainstreaming in Poverty Eradication and the Millennium Development Goals, London (Commonwealth Secretariat).

Mukhtar Eshya M. (2006), Gender-Aware Policy Appraisal: Education Sector, Gender Responsive Budgeting Initiative, Government of Pakistan.

Rukanuddin A. Razzaque and Inam ul Haq (2006), Gender-Aware Policy Appraisal: Population Welfare Sector, Gender Responsive Budgeting Initiative, Government of Pakistan.

Rusimbi, M., D. Budlender, R. Shayo and S. Pehrsson (2000): Checklist for Mainstreaming Gender into the Government Budget, prepared for the Ministry of Finance, Dar Es Salaam.

Sabir M. (2006), Unpacking of Federal Budget through Gender Lens, Gender Responsive Budgeting Initiative, Government of Pakistan.

Sabir M. (2002), "Gender and Public Spending on Education in Pakistan: A Case Study of Disaggregated Benefit Incidence." The Pakistan Development Review 41:4 Part III (Winter 2002) pp. 477-491.

Schneider Katrin (2005), Gender Responsive Budgeting: The Resource Kit, Gender Responsive Budgeting Initiative, Government of Pakistan.

Schneider Katrin and Sabir M. (2005), Training Manual: Gender Responsive Budgeting, Gender Responsive Budgeting Initiative, Government of Pakistan.

Shehzad Shafqat (2006), Gender-Aware Policy Appraisal: Health Sector, Gender Responsive Budgeting Initiative, Government of Pakistan.

United Nations Fund for Women (UNIFEM) (2004): Gender Responsive Budgets (GRB) Programme Mid Term Review Summary.

Winnie Byanyima (2002), Strengthening Parliamentary Governance through Gender Budgeting: the Experience of Three African Countries, paper presented at Policy Dialogue on Legislative Development, Brussels.

World Bank (2001): Engendering Development Through Gender Equality in Rights, Resources and Voice: A World Bank Policy Research Report, Washington D.C. (World Bank).

Zuckerman, E. and A. Garret (2003): 'Do Poverty Reduction Strategies Address Gender? A Gender Audit of 2002 PRSPs, Southern African Regional Poverty Network

Annexure 2

Useful internet sites

Association for Women's Rights in Development (AWID)
Gender Responsive Budgeting
<http://www.awid.org/go.php?stid=660>

Commonwealth Secretariat
Gender Responsive Budgeting
<http://www.thecommonwealth.org/Templates/Colour.asp?NodeID=34006&int2ndParentNodeID=33895&int3rdParentNodeID=33899&int4thParentNodeID=34005>

Gender Advisory Project (GTZ)
Gender Sensitive Budgeting
<http://www2.gtz.de/gender-budgets/english/>

Gender Responsive Budget Initiatives
(UNIFEM, Commonwealth Secretariat and IDRC)
www.gender-budgets.org

Gender Responsive Budget Initiatives
Government of Pakistan
www.grbi.gov.pk

Gender Responsive Budget Initiatives
Government of the Punjab
<http://www.grbipunjab.gov.pk/>

Heinrich Boll Foundation (Berlin)
Gender Responsive budgeting
<http://e-education.uni-muenster.de/boell/>

Institute for Democracy in South Africa (IDASA)
Budget Information Service
<http://www.idasa.org.za/bis>

International Budget Project
Legislatures and Budget Oversight
<http://www.internationalbudget.org/themes/LEG/index.htm>

International Development Research Centre (IDRC)
Science for Humanity
<http://www.idrc.ca/gender/>

Inter-Parliamentary Union (IPU)
<http://www.ipu.org>
Organisation for Economic Co-operation and Development (OECD):
Results of the Survey on Budget Practices and Procedures

<http://ocde.dyndns.org/>

Siyanda
Mainstreaming Gender Equality
<http://www.siyanda.org>

United Nations Development Fund for Women (UNIFEM)
<http://www.unifem.org/>

United Nations Development Program (UNDP)
Policy Dialogue on Legislative Development
http://www.undp.org/governance/policy_dialogue.htm

World Bank Institute (WBI)
Parliamentary Program
<http://www.worldbank.org/wbi/governance/parliament/>



No. 7, 9th Avenue, F-8/1, Islamabad
Tel: (+92-51) 111 123 345 Fax: (+92-51) 226 3078
E-mail: info@pildat.org URL: www.pildat.org

