



Report

Pace & Progress of Pakistan-India Dialogue

January 2013 – November 2014



Report

Pace & Progress of Pakistan-India Dialogue

January 2013 – November 2014

PILdAT
Pakistan Institute of
Legislative Development
And Transparency

PILDAT is an independent, non-partisan and not-for-profit indigenous research and training institution with the mission to strengthen democracy and democratic institutions in Pakistan.

PILDAT is a registered non-profit entity under the Societies Registration Act XXI of 1860, Pakistan.

Copyright ©Pakistan Institute of Legislative Development And Transparency PILDAT

All Rights Reserved

Printed in Pakistan

Published: December 2014

ISBN: 978-969-558-450-7

Any part of this publication can be used or cited with a clear reference to PILDAT.



Islamabad Office:

P. O. Box 278, F-8, Postal Code: 44220, Islamabad, Pakistan

Lahore Office:

P. O. Box 11098, L.C.C.H.S, Postal Code: 54792, Lahore, Pakistan

E-mail: info@pildat.org | Website: www.pildat.org

CONTENTS

Foreword

Introduction

The Official Dialogue (January 2013 – November 2014)	09
1. Pakistan and India exchange lists of nuclear installations: January 01, 2013	09
2. Pakistan rejects allegation of an attack across the Line of Control: January 01, 2013	09
3. Pakistan condemns bomb blasts in Hyderabad, India: February 22, 2013	09
4. Pakistan rejects remarks made by senior Indian Functionaries: March 13, 2013	09
5. Pakistan denies any involvement in 1993 terror attacks on Mumbai: March 23, 2013	09
6. Outgoing Indian High Commissioner pays farewell visit to Advisor: June 27, 2013	10
7. Pakistan and India exchange list of prisoners: July 01, 2013	10
8. Advisor to the Prime Minister meets Indian External Affairs Minister: July 02, 2013	10
9. Pakistan Prime Minister's Special Envoy Visits India: July 04-06, 2013	10
10. Pak-India blame game in Line of Control Violations: August 6, 2013	11
11. Pakistan releases 337 Indian Prisoners: August 24, 2013	11
12. Indian envoy meets Pakistan Premier Advisor, LoC tension discussed: September 3, 2013	12
13. Prime Minister Nawaz Sharif and Prime Minister Manmohan Singh meeting along the sidelines of the United Nations General Assembly Session: September 29, 2013	12
14. Speakers of the Indian Lokha Sabha and the Pakistan National Assembly meet: October 9, 2013	12
15. Shelling increased along the Working Boundary: October 23, 2013	13
16. Prime Minister Manmohan Singh criticizes Prime Minister Nawaz Sharif over LoC Violations: October 24, 2013	13
17. Officials of Punjab Rangers and Indian Border Security Force agree to halt border skirmishes: October 28, 2013	13
18. Meeting between Pakistan's Adviser to the Prime Minister on National Security and Foreign Affairs and Indian External Affairs Minister: November 12, 2013	13
19. India and Pakistan Exchange List of Prisoners: January 01, 2014	13
20. India and Pakistan Exchange List of Nuclear Installations: January 01, 2014	14
21. Indian and Pakistani Commerce Ministers seek to boost bilateral trade: January 18, 2014	14
22. India summons Pakistan Deputy High Commissioner in connection with suspension of Srinagar-Muzaffarabad and Rawalakot-Poonch bus services by Pakistan: January 21, 2014	14
23. Pakistan's Adviser to the Prime Minister on National Security and Foreign Affairs meets Indian External Affairs Minister: February 20, 2014	14
24. Pakistan lodges protest with Indian authorities over the capturing of fisherman: March 17, 2014	15
25. Pakistan Condemns Gunmen Attack on Consulate General of India: May 23, 2014	15
26. Prime Minister Nawaz Sharif travel to Delhi to attend the swearing-in ceremony of Prime Minister Mr. Narendra Modi: May 28, 2014	15
27. India Releases 37 Pakistani Prisoners: May 30, 2014	15
28. Indian Foreign Secretary talks to the Pakistan Foreign Secretary: July 23, 2014	16
29. Prime Minister Modi says that Pakistan too weak to fight conventional war and resorting to terrorism: August 11, 2014	16
30. Pakistan Foreign Office Strongly condemns the statement by Prime Minister Modi: August 13, 2014	16
31. India calls off Foreign Secretary level talks with Pakistan: August 19, 2014	16
32. Prime Minister Nawaz Sharif and Prime Minister Narendra Modi exchange offer of support and sympathy over the unprecedented monsoon flooding: September 7-9, 2014	16
33. Cross-border firing persists along the Line of Control: October 07, 2014	17

REPORT

Pace & Progress of Pakistan-India Dialogue

January 2013 – November 2014

- | | |
|---|----|
| 34. Pakistan should decide whether it wants to talk to the Government of India or those who want to break India: Indian Defence Minister Arun Jaitley: November 5, 2014 | 17 |
| 35. Pakistan's Foreign Office rejects statement by the Indian Defence Minister: November 06, 2014 | 17 |
| 36. Release of 40 Indian Prisoners by Pakistan: November 28, 2014 | 18 |
| 37. No breakthrough expected in dialogue with India, says Pakistan Foreign Office Spokesperson: December 04, 2014 | 18 |

List of Tables

- | | |
|--|----|
| Table 1: Status of Pakistani Prisoners in India | 11 |
| Table 2: Status of Indian Prisoners in Pakistan | 12 |
| Appendix A: Factsheet on LoC Violations: January 2013 – November 2014 | 20 |
| Appendix B: Violations along the Line of Control (LoC) from January 2013 – November 2014 | 24 |

REPORT

Pace & Progress of Pakistan-India Dialogue

January 2013 – November 2014

Foreword

In February 2011, the Governments of Pakistan and India formally embarked on a roadmap to resume the dialogue process suspended over the issue of the 2008 Mumbai attacks.

This report describes the main developments in the historically uneasy relationship between India and Pakistan from January 2013-November 2014.

The report has been prepared for the Parliamentarians of the two countries who meet periodically, at the unofficial level, to enhance the role of Parliamentary Diplomacy in improving Pakistan-India relations. The Pakistan-India Parliamentary Dialogues are facilitated by PILDAT.

The report has been prepared for consideration and adoption at the 6th round of the Pakistan-India Parliamentarians Dialogue-VI scheduled to be held in New Delhi on December 11-12, 2014.

Disclaimer

PILDAT team has made every effort to ensure accuracy of the contents of this report. Any error or omission, therefore, is not deliberate.

Islamabad
December 2014

Introduction

The dialogue process between India and Pakistan that resumed in February 2011 after remaining suspended for nearly 3 years following the Mumbai attacks in November 2008, has once again been halted by the tension on the Line of Control (LoC). No headway has been made since the meeting of the two Commerce Secretaries in September 2012 as the third round of the composite dialogue was halted citing tension on the Line of Control.

In this period, Pakistan, through its 10th General Election held on May 11, 2013, elected a new Government with Mr. Nawaz Sharif elected as the Premier of the country on June 5, 2013. With the change in Government there were newer prospects of peace between the two countries even though the official dialogue process had not moved forward during the time. The period also saw increased violations along the Line of Control leading to a significant stress in the Pakistan-India relations. Although Prime Minister Nawaz Sharif and Prime Minister Manmohan Singh met along the sidelines of the United Nations General Assembly Session in New York on September 29, 2013, the meeting had no significant outcome since resumption of the Composite Dialogue was postponed. Meanwhile, the Bharatiya Janata Party (BJP) swept to power in the May 2014 Indian General Election with Mr. Narendra Modi being elected as the 15th Prime Minister of India.

Although a lot of goodwill was generated when Prime Minister Nawaz Sharif chose to attend the Swearing-in ceremony of his Indian counterpart at his invitation, relations between the two countries were strained when India unilaterally cancelled the talks between the Foreign Secretaries of the two countries in August 2014, to be held after a gap of 18-months. According to the Indian Ministry of External Affairs, the cancellation took place because Pakistan's High Commissioner to India, Mr. Abdul Basit, chose to consult with members of the All Parties Hurriyat Council (APHC) prior to the Foreign Secretary talks.

Since then, Pakistan-India relations have significantly deteriorated with frequent violations and incidents of 'unprovoked firing' along the Line of Control (LoC) and the Working Boundary. Highest officials of both the countries have decried the loss of innocent life and property due to the persistent firing along the border, which has resulted in a blame game creating a sense of ambiguity over the unrest. Consequently, Pakistan has expressed disappointment that the sincerity exhibited by Prime Minister Nawaz Sharif's visit to India on the Swearing-in Ceremony of Prime Minister Modi has not been reciprocated. India on the other hand has resisted any steps towards normalisation citing 'brazen' firing by Pakistan along the LoC, amidst allegations of using domestic terrorist organisations to wage a proxy war against India.

The persistence of this friction was also at display during the 18th SAARC summit held in Nepal from November 26-27, 2014 where Prime Minister Nawaz Sharif and Prime Minister Modi could not hold a bilateral meeting to discuss issues of mutual concern. This lack of development came at the backdrop of Prime Minister Modi holding bilateral with the premiers of all the SAARC countries except for Pakistan.

This report takes into account key milestones of the state of Pakistan-India relations from January 2013 to November 2014.

January 2013 – November 2014

The Official Dialogue (January 2013 – November 2014)

Pakistan and India exchange lists of nuclear installations: January 01, 2013

Pakistan and India exchanged lists of their nuclear installations and facilities as per the Agreement on Prohibition of Attacks against Nuclear Installations and Facilities between Pakistan and India, signed on December 31, 1988. The Agreement further pledges both sides not to attack listed facilities but does not require detailed disclosure of all nuclear activity.

In accordance with Article II of the agreement, a list describing the precise location of all nuclear-related facilities in Pakistan was officially handed over to a representative of the Indian High Commission at the Foreign Office. The Indian side also handed over its list to the Pakistan High Commission in New Delhi.¹

Pakistan rejects allegations of an attack across the Line of Control: January 08, 2013

India accused Pakistani soldiers of attacking an Indian patrol party across the Line of Control. They claimed that two Indian soldiers had been killed and one beheaded in what India termed as a "barbaric" attack on January 8, 2013 was a violation of the 2003 ceasefire agreement between the two countries. Pakistan rejected these allegations. A statement from the Foreign Office said "These are baseless and unfounded allegations. Pakistan is prepared to hold investigations through the United Nations Military Observer Group for India and Pakistan (UNMOGIP) on the recent ceasefire violations on the Line of Control."

The ceasefire between the two countries has been observed well in the last 9 years, although there was an increase in violations in 2012.² Indian External Affairs Minister, Mr. Salman Khurshid, said that the event

should not be escalated as it threatened to undermine an already fragile peace policy.

Pakistan condemned bomb blasts in Hyderabad, India: February 22, 2013

Pakistan strongly condemned the bomb blasts that took place in Hyderabad, India which resulted in the loss of several lives and caused injuries to others, deeming any form of terrorism a threat to international peace and security.

The Foreign Office spokesman in Islamabad said all acts of terrorism are unjustifiable regardless of their motivation and said "our prayers and thoughts are with the families of victims of this terrorist attack".³

Pakistan rejected remarks made by Senior Indian Functionaries: March 13, 2013

Pakistan rejected the remarks made by Indian Home Secretary, R.K Singh, who had said that "prima facie evidence suggests that the militants who attacked the members of the Central Reserve Police Force (CRPF) were from across the border, they were probably from Pakistan."⁴

Pakistan felt that such "knee jerk"⁵ reactions and remarks by senior Indian Government functionaries undermined the efforts of both countries towards normal, peaceful relations. It called upon the Government of India to carry out a thorough investigation into the incident before levelling such accusations.⁶

Pakistan denies any involvement in 1993 terror attacks in Mumbai: March 23, 2013

Pakistan denounced insinuations suggesting the involvement of its Government or any of its agencies in the 1993 terror attacks in Mumbai. The Indian Supreme Court ruling implicated the Pakistani Government

1. For details, please see: **Pakistan and India exchange lists of nuclear installations**, January 01, 2013: Ministry of External Affairs India: <http://www.mea.gov.in/press-releases.htm?dtl/21020/India+and+Pakistan+exchange+list+of+nuclear+installations>
2. For details please see: **Pakistan Army denies cross LoC attack terms it propaganda**, Indian Express, January 09, 2011: <http://www.indianexpress.com/news/pakistan-army-denies-cross-loc-attack-terms-it-propaganda/1056771/2>
3. For details please see: **Pakistan condemns bomb blasts in Indian Hyderabad**, The Nation; February 22, 2013: <http://www.nation.com.pk/pakistan-news-newspaper-daily-english-online/national/22-Feb-2013/pakistan-condemns-bomb-blasts-in-indian-hyderabad>
4. For details please see: **Terrorist who attacked CRPF probably from Pakistan, Hindustan Times**; March 13, 2013: <http://www.hindustantimes.com/India-news/NewDelhi/Terrorists-who-attacked-CRPF-probably-from-Pakistan-RK-Singh/Article1-1025738.aspx>
5. For details, please see **Pakistan rejects remarks by senior Indian functionaries**, MoFA, March 13, 2013: <http://www.mofa.gov.pk/pr-details.php?prID=86>
6. For details please see, **MoFA-Pakistan rejects remark by senior Indian functionaries**, Media Point; March 13, 2013: <http://www.mediapoint.pk/press-release-mofa-pakistan-rejects-remarks-by-senior-indian-functionaries-13-mar/>

January 2013 – November 2014

agencies in the attacks followed by reports in the Indian media. The Foreign Office Spokesperson, Aizaz Ahmed Chaudhry, issued a statement firmly rejecting the baseless notion of any connection of the Pakistani Government or its agencies in the attacks.

The Spokesperson said that further detailed responses could only be made once the judgement had been studied in its totality in greater depth. The Spokesperson said “Pakistan remains committed in its resolve to fighting terrorism and engaging with India in a constructive, sustained and result-oriented dialogue process.”⁷ He maintained that Pakistan is itself a victim of terrorism and has rendered immense sacrifices in the international fight against this menace. Pakistan has on numerous occasions offered cooperation to India in fighting terrorism through laid down bilateral mechanisms.

Outgoing Indian High Commissioner pays farewell visit to Advisor: June 27, 2013

Outgoing Indian High Commissioner, H. E. Mr. Sharat Sabharwal called on Pakistan's Advisor to Prime Minister on National Security and Foreign Affairs, Mr. Sartaj Aziz. Mr. Sabharwal felt that relations between the countries had improved in the past four years. The Advisor reiterated that improving ties between India and Pakistan was an important mandate of the newly-elected Government. The Advisor also informed the Indian High Commissioner that the new Prime Minister was keen on continuing the efforts to improve relations that were started in the Lahore Process of 1999 by Prime Minister Sharif and Vajpayee.⁸

The Advisor wished the High Commissioner well in his future endeavours and indicated that he looked forward to working with his successor to further strengthen ties between the two countries.

Pakistan and India exchange list of prisoners: July 01, 2013

A list of prisoners was exchanged as per the Agreement on Consular Access signed between Pakistan and India on May 21, 2008. Both countries are required to

exchange lists of prisoners in each other's custody twice a year on January 01 and July 01.

In accordance with the provisions of this Agreement, the Foreign Office gave the Indian High Commission in Islamabad, a list of 491 Indian prisoners lodged in Pakistani jails. A similar list of 386 Pakistani prisoners was submitted to the Pakistan High Commission in New Delhi by the Indian Ministry of External Affairs.⁹

Advisor to the PM meets Indian External Affairs Minister: July 02, 2013

Pakistan's Advisor to the Prime Minister on National Security and Foreign Affairs, Mr. Sartaj Aziz met with the Indian Minister for External Affairs, Mr. Salman Khurshid, in Brunei. This was the first high-level bilateral meeting between Pakistan and India since the newly elected Government of Mr. Nawaz Sharif came to power.

The singular aim Pakistan conveyed was to exercise diplomacy in resuming the peace process which started in Lahore 1999 while India too pledged to improve relations between the countries. They both expressed hope that the bilateral dialogue would continue in the coming months and envisaged a possible meeting between the two prime ministers around the time of the United Nations General Assembly meeting in New York.

The meeting took place on the sidelines of the ASEAN regional forum. Both sides agreed that regional cooperation would help the economic development and prosperity of the South and South-East Asian nations. Trade and economic cooperation between the two countries could act as a catalyst and raise the confidence level on both sides that would allow a sustained peace process and the ministers discussed further actions that needed to be taken in this regard.¹⁰

Pakistan Prime Minister's Special Envoy visits India: July 04-06, 2013

Pakistani Prime Minister's Special Envoy Ambassador, Shahryar Khan visited New Delhi from July 04-06,

7. For details please see: **Pakistan rejects involvement in 1993 Mumbai blasts**, The News; March 21, 2013:

<http://www.thenews.com.pk/article-93268-Pakistan-rejects-involvement-in-1993-Mumbai-blasts>

8. For details please see: **Outgoing Indian HC calls on Sartaj**, The Nation; June 28, 2013 <http://www.nation.com.pk/pakistan-news-newspaper-daily-english-online/islamabad/28-Jun-2013/outgoing-indian-hc-calls-on-sartaj>

9. For details please see: **Pakistan Indian exchange list of prisoners**, MoFA, July 01, 2013; <http://mofa.gov.pk/pr-details.php?prID=1291>

10. For details please see: **Pakistan advisor on national security & foreign affairs meets Indian external affairs minister**, MoFA, July 02, 2013; <http://www.mofa.gov.pk/pr-details.php?prID=1293>

January 2013 – November 2014

2013 on a goodwill mission. Khan called on Prime Minister Manmohan Singh, carrying a letter from Pakistan's Prime Minister, Nawaz Sharif. The letter expressed good wishes for the Indian Prime Minister, the Government and people as well as a "sincere desire to move forward on improving relations with India."

There was a trend of "positive conversation" and Khan called on External Affairs Minister and National Security Adviser to the Prime Minister and met Prime Minister's Special Envoy Shri Satinder Lambah and Foreign Secretary as well.¹¹

Pak-India blame game in LoC violations: August 06 and 12, 2013

Tensions mounted along the 740 km Line of Control that divides Kashmir on August 06 when five Indian soldiers were killed in the Poonch region and Pakistan was accused of orchestrating the killing. The incident set off a wave of clashes between Pakistan and India. On August 12, Pakistan accused Indian troops of firing shells across the border in Kashmir.

Indian Foreign Office spokesperson, Syed Akbaruddin said India will not hold talks with Pakistan till the matter is resolved. He further alleged that Hafiz Saeed was responsible for the 2008 Mumbai attacks and Pakistan should take action against him in order to improve the relationship between the two countries.

A press release by the Pakistan's Ministry of Foreign Affairs however categorically rejected the allegations made. It stated that the military authorities had confirmed that there had been no exchange of fire that could have resulted in the death of the five Indian

soldiers. The press release also highlighted Pakistan's growing concern at violence along the LoC and its commitment to a 'constructive process of engagement with India' to resolve all mutual issues.¹²

Pakistan releases 337 Indian prisoners: August 24, 2013

Pakistan released 337 Indian prisoners on August 24. Mostly fishermen, these prisoners, detained for straying into Pakistani water over the past two years, were allowed to cross the Wahga border between Lahore and Amritsar to go back home.

According to Indian figures as of July 2013, there are 386 Pakistani prisoners (278 civil + 108 Fishermen) detained in Indian jails. However, as per Pakistan's estimates, there are 479 Pakistani prisoners (338 civil + 141 fishermen) detained in Indian jails. So far, consular access has only been provided to 69 Pakistani prisoners in Indian jails. As per Indian estimates, while sentences of 55 Pakistani prisoners have been completed, only 21 prisoners' national status has been confirmed.

Pakistani figures, however, say that there are 43 Pakistani prisoners whose sentences have been completed and their national status is also confirmed and they can be released.

India has released 386 Pakistani prisoners (163 Civil and 223 fishermen) from January 2011 till to-date:

Figures relating to Indian Prisoners in Pakistani Jails state that as of July 01, 2013 there are 491 Indian Prisoners (54 civil + 437 fishermen) detained in

Table 1: Status of Pakistani Prisoners in India¹³

Year	Prisoner		Total
	Civil	Fisherman	
2011	104	127	231
2012	49	82	131
2013	10	14	24
Total	163	223	386

- For details please see: **Nawaz Sharif's special envoy meets Manmohan Singh**, Times of India, July 06, 2013; http://articles.timesofindia.in/Nawazndiatimes.com/2013-07-06/india/40406637_1_pakistan-pm-pm-manmohan-singh-special-envoy
- For details, please see **Pakistan rejects Indian allegations of killing its soldiers**, MoFA, August 06, 2013: <http://www.mofa.gov.pk/pr-details.php?prID=1362>
- For details, please see **Pakistan and India exchange list of prisoners**, MoFA, August 23, 2014: <http://www.mofa.gov.pk/pr-details.php?prID=1291>

January 2013 – November 2014

Pakistani jails. Out of these 491 Indian prisoners, nine (9) Indian prisoners (07 civil+2 fishermen) have been released. All 491 prisoners have been provided with consular access. 435 Indian fishermen have completed their term of sentences. However, the Indian High Commission has only confirmed national status of 377 fishermen who could be released. Pakistan has released 888 Indian prisoners (52 civil + 836 fishermen) from January 2011 to July 2013.

Indian envoy meets Pakistan Premier Advisor, LoC tensions discussed: September 3, 2013

Indian High Commissioner Mr. TC Raghavan called on Advisor to the Prime Minister on Foreign Affairs Mr. Sartaj Aziz at the Pakistan Foreign Office.

While the meeting had no formal agenda, it is reported that the two officials discussed tension on the LoC and the proposed meeting between the premiers of the two countries.¹⁵

Prime Minister Nawaz Sharif and Prime Minister Manmohan Singh meet along the sidelines of the UNGA: September 29, 2013

Prime Minister Manmohan Singh of India and Prime Minister Nawaz Sharif of Pakistan met at the sidelines of the United Nations General Assembly session on September 29, 2013.

Although the meeting had no formal agenda, both the

Premiers did not focus on bilateral issues as much as focusing on US withdrawal from Afghan. They agreed to resume talks on five technical topics to lead up to the Composite Dialogue along with concurring to pursue peace along the Line of Control in light of the recent spate of violations. To this end, the leaders decided to evolve a mechanism to investigate the violations along the LoC by holding regular meetings of the Director General Military Operations of the two countries.

Speakers of the Indian Lokha Sabha and the Pakistan National Assembly meet: October 9, 2013

The Speaker of the National Assembly of Pakistan, Sardar Ayaz Sadiq met with the Speaker of the Indian Lok Sabha, Ms. Meira Kumar along the sidelines of the 129th Inter-Parliamentary Union Assembly in Geneva Switzerland.¹⁶

Both the Speakers expressed resolve to work for improved relations between the two countries. During the meeting, Sardar Ayaz Sadiq referred to the visit by Ms. Kumar to Pakistan in February 2012 and extended her an invitation to visit again. Both the leaders agreed that whenever moves were made for a mutually respecting neighborhood, the efforts were thwarted by isolated acts.

Ms. Kumar especially raised the issue of terrorism in the region, which was affecting all nations. She called for joint efforts to eradicate the menace. She also called for respecting the sanctity of the Line of Control.

Table 2: Status of Indian Prisoners in Pakistan¹⁴

Year	Prisoner		Total
	Civil	Fishermen	
2011	15	103	118
2012	26	680	706
2013	11	53	64
Total	52	836	888

14. For details, please see **Pakistan and India exchange list of prisoners**, MoFA, August 23, 2014: <http://www.mofa.gov.pk/pr-details.php?prID=1291>

15. For details please see, **Indian envoy T C Raghavan meets Pak PM's advisor , LoC tensions discussed**, The Economic Times, September 03, 2013; <http://economictimes.indiatimes.com/news/politics-and-nation/indian-envoy-t-c-raghavan-meets-pak-pms-advisor-loc-tensions-discussed/articleshow/22250644.cms>

16. For details, please see **Pak, India Speakers meet in Switzerland; agree to promote bilateral ties**, The News, October 10, 2014: <http://www.thenews.com.pk/Todays-News-2-207319-Pak-India-Speakers-meet-in-Switzerland-agree-to-promote-bilateral-ties>

Shelling increased along the Working Boundary: October 23, 2013

According to media reports, shelling was intensified along the Working Boundary in Pukhlian, Chaprar, Harpal and Charwah Sectors near Sialkot towards the end of October 2013.¹⁷

Heavy machine guns fire, along with mortar shells were exchanged between the Indian Border Security Forces and the Pakistani Chenab Rangers. The continuous firing resulted in a massive loss of cattle for people along both sides of the border. According to media reports, the local residents had vacated the area following the cross-border exchange that had been persisting for almost a week.

The exchange also drew a sharp retort from the Foreign Office Spokesman Aizaz Ahmed Chaudhry who said that 'continued violations across Line of Control by India were unfortunate and alarming, and might further escalate the tension, undermining Pakistan's efforts to improve relations with India'.¹⁸

According to a press release by the Pakistani Ministry of Foreign Affairs, the cross-border firing had resulted in the death of one civilian and two officials of the Rangers.¹⁹

Prime Minister Manmohan Singh criticizes Prime Minister Nawaz Sharif over LoC Violations: October 24, 2013

With both sides accusing each other of indiscriminate firing across the LoC and over the international border in Jammu, the ambiguity over the LoC violations persisted.

In the backdrop of the statement by Foreign Office Spokesman Aizaz Ahmed Chaudhry accusing India of firing across the boundary, the Indian Prime Minister Manmohan Singh lent full support to India's claim as he accused Pakistan of breaking the 2003 ceasefire pact and blamed Prime Minister Nawaz Sharif for not being

able to control the situation on his side.

He expressed disappointment upon the developments saying that the agreement reached between the two Premiers' meeting, along the sidelines of the United National General Assembly session to restore peace along the LoC was not being followed by Pakistan.²⁰

Officials of Punjab Rangers and Indian Border Security Force agree to halt border skirmishes: October 28, 2013

A decision was taken at a flag-meeting between the officials of the Indian Border Security Force and the Punjab Rangers to suspend hostilities along the Line of Control on October 28, 2013.

According to media reports, officials from both the sides agreed to pursue peace along the border so that the local residents could return to the area and carry on with the paddy harvests.²¹

Meeting between Pakistan's Adviser to the Prime Minister on National Security and Foreign Affairs and Indian External Affairs Minister: November 12, 2013

According to a press release by the Ministry on Foreign Affairs, a meeting was held between Mr. Sartaj Aziz, Adviser to the Prime Minister on National Security and Foreign Affairs and the India External Affairs Minister Mr. Salman Khurshid in New Delhi on November 12, 2013.

Details of the meeting were not reported to the press, except for stating that various aspects of bilateral relations came under review in a cordial environment.²²

India and Pakistan Exchange List of Prisoners: January 01, 2014

A list of prisoners was exchanged as per the Agreement on Consular Access signed between Pakistan and India

17. For details, please see **Indian Shelling intensified on Working Boundary**, The News, October 24, 2013: <http://www.thenews.com.pk/Todays-News-13-26253-Indian-shelling-intensified-on-working-boundary>
18. For details, please see **LoC violations may escalate tension: FO**, The Nation, October 24, 2013: <http://nation.com.pk/islamabad/24-Oct-2013/loc-violations-may-escalate-tension-fo>
19. For details, please see **Pakistan's response to unprovoked firing by India**, MoFA, October 23, 2013; <http://www.mofa.gov.pk/pr-details.php?prID=1500>
20. For details, please see **India premier criticises Sharif over LoC firing**, Dawn, October 25, 2013: <http://www.dawn.com/news/1051623/indian-premier-criticises-sharif-over-loc-firing>
21. For details, please see **Pak, India accord to end border skirmishes**, Dawn, October 30, 2013: <http://www.dawn.com/news/1052834/pak-india-accord-to-end-border-skirmishes>
22. For details please see **Adviser meets Indian External Affairs Minister**, MoFA, November 12, 2014; <http://www.mofa.gov.pk/pr-details.php?prID=1545>

January 2013 – November 2014

on May 21, 2008. Both countries are required to exchange lists of prisoners in each other's custody twice a year on January 01 and July 01.

In accordance with the provisions of this Agreement, the Foreign Office gave the Indian High Commission in Islamabad, a list of 281 Indian prisoners (49 civilian and 232 fishermen) in Pakistan. The Indian External Affairs Ministry also handed over to the Pakistani High Commission in Delhi a list of 396 Pakistanis in Indian jails (257 civilian and 139 fishermen).²³

India and Pakistan Exchange List of Nuclear Installations: January 01, 2014

A list of requisite nuclear facilities in Pakistan was officially handed over to a representative of the Indian High Commission at the Foreign Office on January 01, 2014. The Indian side also handed over its list to the Pakistan High Commission by the Ministry of External Affairs in New Delhi the same day.

This exchange takes place every year according to the Article-II of the December 1988 Agreement on Prohibition of Attacks against Nuclear Installations and Facilities between Pakistan and India.²⁴

Indian and Pakistani Commerce Ministers seek to boost bilateral trade: January 18, 2014

In a positive development for Pakistan-India relations, the Pakistani and Indian Commerce Ministers, Mr. Khurram Dastgir Khan and Mr. Anand Sharma met in New Delhi to discuss bilateral trade.

In a Joint Communiqué issued after the meeting between the two countries, it was stated that both sides agreed to provide access without any discrimination to each other's markets. They also made a decision to keep Wahga's border custom post operational for the whole week. Meeting after a gap of 16 months, the Commerce Ministers also agreed to grant Non-discriminatory Market Access (NDMA) on a reciprocal basis to each other as soon as possible.²⁵

India summons Pakistan Deputy High Commissioner in connection with suspension of Srinagar-Muzaffarabad and Rawalakot-Poonch bus services by Pakistan: January 21, 2014

Pakistan Deputy High Commissioner Mansoor Ahmed Khan was summoned by the Joint Secretary in-charge of the Pakistan division in the Ministry of External Affairs, India, Mr. Rudrendra Tandon in connection with the suspension of Srinagar-Muzaffarabad and Rawalakot-Poonch bus services by Pakistan, which has demanded release of its national arrested for alleged smuggling of narcotics worth 1 billion rupees across the LoC.

Authorities in Pakistan-administered Kashmir on January 15, 2014 suspended the cross-Line of Control bus service on Srinagar-Muzaffarabad and Rawalakot-Poonch sectors demanding the release of the Pakistani driver. According to media reports, Indian police detained a truck allegedly carrying 114 packets of brown sugar, valued at Rs1 billion, and arrested the driver along with two more people from Bandipore who were to receive the consignment.²⁶

Pakistan's Adviser to the Prime Minister on National Security and Foreign Affairs meets Indian External Affairs Minister: February 20, 2014

Adviser to Pakistan Prime Minister on National Security and Foreign Affairs, Mr. Sartaj Aziz, met, the Indian External Affairs Minister, Mr. Salman Khursheed, on the sidelines of the SAARC Council of Ministers meeting in the Maldives on February 20, 2014.

According a press release by Pakistan's Ministry of Foreign Affairs, both the officials reviewed the progress made towards normalizing bilateral relations since the meeting of the two Prime Ministers in New York last September. They expressed satisfaction over the scheduling of meetings, at the technical level for cooperation in the power sectors.²⁷

23. For details, please see **Exchange of list of prisoners between Pakistan and India**, MoFA, January 01, 2014; <http://www.mofa.gov.pk/pr-details.php?prID=1639>

24. For details, please see **Annual Exchange of Nuclear Installations and Facilities list between Pakistan and India**, MoFA, January 01, 2014; <http://www.mofa.gov.pk/pr-details.php?prID=1638>

25. For details, please see **Pakistan India open markets for each other**, The News, January 19, 2014; <http://www.thenews.com.pk/Todays-News-13-28009-Pakistan-India-open-markets-for-each-other>

26. For details, please see **India summons envoy over stalled bus service**, Dawn, January 22, 2014; <http://www.dawn.com/news/1081796/india-summons-envoy-over-stalled-bus-service>

27. For details, please see **Adviser meets Indian External Affairs Minister**, MoFA, February 20, 2014; <http://www.mofa.gov.pk/pr-details.php?prID=1742>

January 2013 – November 2014

Pakistan lodges protest with Indian authorities over the capturing of fishermen: March 17, 2014

The Indian Deputy High Commissioner in Islamabad was called in by the Foreign Office Director General (SA & SAARC) and a protest was lodged over the capturing of 13 Pakistani fishermen by Indian authorities on March 15, 2014.

According to Pakistan's Fishermen Cooperative Society, the fishermen along with their boat were within Pakistan territorial waters, at Khajar Creek, when they were captured. The Foreign Office, in a press release, has conveyed its concern over the incident, which it said was against 'the spirit of the positive steps being taken by the Governments of both countries to improve and normalize bilateral relations'.²⁸

Pakistan Condemns Gunmen Attack on Consulate General of India: May 23, 2014

Pakistan strongly condemned the reported gunmen attack on the Consulate General of India in Herat, Afghanistan of May 23, 2014. According to media reports, heavily armed gunmen launched a pre-dawn attack on the Indian consulate in the Afghan city of Herat and stormed nearby houses to fire on the compound with machine guns and rocket-propelled grenades.²⁹

Pakistan reiterated its condemnation of terrorism. The press release issued by the Ministry of Foreign Affairs stated that 'no cause justifies targeting of diplomatic missions. It is a matter of relief that no one from the Consulate staff was hurt'.³⁰

Prime Minister Nawaz Sharif travels to Delhi to attend the Swearing-in Ceremony of Prime Minister Mr. Narendra Modi: May 28, 2014

In a welcome move for Pakistan-India relations, Prime

Minister Nawaz Sharif travelled to India to attend the Swearing-in Ceremony of Prime Minister Narendra Modi, upon his invitation, on May 28, 2014.

During his short stay, he also held a bilateral meeting with Mr. Modi. According to media reports, both leaders were of the view that the confrontation between the two countries could not persist. On the occasion, Prime Minister Nawaz Sharif recalled the Lahore Declaration that calls for both the Governments to intensify their efforts to resolve all issues including the issue of Jammu and Kashmir by providing a framework to carry forward the relationship by addressing mutual concerns. During the meeting, the issue of terrorism also came up for discussion.³¹

During his visit, Prime Minister Nawaz Sharif also called on the Indian President.

India Releases 37 Pakistani Prisoners: May 30, 2014

India released 37 Pakistani prisoners (5 civil prisoners and 32 fishermen) on May 30, 2014. However, 484 Pakistani prisoners (348 civil and 136 fishermen) still remain lodged in Indian jails. On May 26, 2014 as a goodwill gesture, Prime Minister Nawaz Sharif had directed that 151 Indian prisoners (1 civil and 150 fishermen) be released.³²

28. For details, please see **Pakistan expresses concern over capturing of its fishermen by India**, MoFA, March 17, 2014; <http://www.mofa.gov.pk/pr-details.php?prID=1816>

29. For details, please see **Indian Consulate in Herat, Afghanistan attacked**, BBC News Asia, May 23, 2014; <http://www.bbc.com/news/world-asia-27533268>

30. For details, please see **Pakistan condemns attack on Indian Consulate in Heart**, MoFA, May 23, 2014; <http://www.mofa.gov.pk/pr-details.php?prID=1982>

31. For details, please see **Press Briefing on Prime Minister's visit to India**, MoFA, May 28, 2014; <http://www.mofa.gov.pk/pr-details.php?prID=2002>

32. For details, please see **Release of 37 Pakistani prisoners by India**, MoFA, May 30, 2014; <http://www.mofa.gov.pk/pr-details.php?prID=2003>

January 2013 – November 2014

India and Pakistan Exchange List of Prisoners: July 01, 2014

A list of prisoners was exchanged as per the Agreement on Consular Access signed between Pakistan and India on May 21, 2008. Both countries are required to exchange lists of prisoners in each other's custody twice a year on January 01 and July 01.

In accordance with the provisions of this Agreement, the Foreign Office gave the Indian High Commission in Islamabad, a list of 296 Indian prisoners (47 civil, 237 fishermen and 12 youthful offenders) in Pakistan. The Indian External Affairs Ministry also handed over to the Pakistani High Commission in Delhi a similar list.

Indian and Pakistani Foreign Secretary drop each other a telephone call: July 23, 2014

Indian Foreign Secretary Sujatha Singh spoke to Foreign Secretary Aizaz Ahmad Chaudhry over the telephone on July 23, 2014.

According to a press release by the Ministry of Foreign Affairs, during the conversation, it was agreed that 'the two Foreign Secretaries would meet in Islamabad on August 25, 2014 to carry forward the dialogue process'.³³

Prime Minister Modi says that Pakistan too weak to fight conventional war and resorting to terrorism: August 11, 2014

While addressing the officers, soldiers and air warriors of the Indian Army and Air Force at Leh, Kashmir, Prime Minister Narendra Modi said that 'the neighboring country (Pakistan) has lost the strength to fight a conventional war, but continues to engage in the proxy war of terrorism'.³⁴

Pakistan Foreign Office Strongly condemns the statement by Prime Minister Modi: August 13, 2014

The Pakistan Foreign Office Spokesman, Ms. Tasnim Aslam regretted the statement issued by Prime Minister Modi on Pakistan waging proxy war against India via state-sponsored terrorism terming it 'baseless rhetoric against Pakistan'.³⁵

She pointed out that the lives of 55,000 of its citizens were lost as a result of terrorism and stated that Indian accusations, at the highest political level, were most unfortunate, especially as the leadership of Pakistan wishes to establish good neighborly relations with India.

India calls off Foreign Secretary level talks with Pakistan: August 19, 2014

On August 19, 2014, Syed Akbaruddin, the Spokesperson for the Indian Ministry of External Affairs, stated that India had decided to call off the Foreign Secretary level talks between Pakistan and India scheduled to be held on August 25, 2014. According to him, the talks had been called off because of the decision made by the Pakistani High Commissioner in India, Mr. Abdul Basit to consult members of the All Parties Hurriyat Conference (APHC) prior to the Foreign Secretaries' talks.

He stated that 'it was underlined that the Pakistan High Commissioner's meeting with these so-called leaders of the Hurriyat undermines the constructive diplomatic engagement initiated by Prime Minister Modi in May on his very first day in office'.³⁶ The talks were going to be held after a gap of almost 18-months.

Prime Minister Nawaz Sharif and Prime Minister Narendra Modi exchange offer of support and sympathy over the unprecedented monsoon flooding: September 7-9, 2014

The Indian and Pakistani Prime Minister wrote to each

33. For details, please see **Telephonic conversation between Foreign Secretaries of Pakistan and India**, MoFA, July 23, 2013; <http://www.mofa.gov.pk/pr-details.php?prID=2106>

34. For details, please see **PM addresses Officers, Soldiers and Air Warriors of the Indian Armed Forces at Leh; Condemns Pakistan's proxy war**, Indian Prime Minister's Office, August 12, 2014; http://pmindia.gov.in/en/news_updates/pm-addresses-officers-soldiers-and-air-warriors-of-the-indian-armed-forces-at-leh-condemns-pakistans-proxy-war

35. For details, please see **Response to Indian Prime Minister's Statement**, MoFA August 13, 2014; <http://www.mofa.gov.pk/pr-details.php?prID=2164>

36. For details, please see **Amid Hurriyat overtures, India abruptly cancels talks with Pakistan**, The Express Tribune, August 19, 2014; <http://tribune.com.pk/story/750643/amid-hurriyat-overtures-india-abruptly-cancels-talks-with-pakistan/>

January 2013 – November 2014

other extending support and sympathy in light of the spate of monsoon floods afflicting both the countries.³⁷ Severe floods had caused massive loss of life and property in Indian Kashmir and in certain areas of Sindh and Punjab in Pakistan during the beginning of September 2014.

Cross-border firing persists along the Line of Control: October 07, 2014

According to media reports, at least one person was killed and 12 others were injured in fighting along the disputed and working border between India and Pakistan in Charwala Sector on October 7, 2014. Earlier, 9 civilians were killed and at least 25 wounded in fighting along a stretch of the disputed border between India and Pakistan in the Kashmir region.³⁸

The cross-border drew a strong reaction from Pakistan's Ministry of Foreign Affairs which in a press release stated that 'It is deeply saddening that Indian Security Forces' act of aggression deprived a number of families from celebrating the auspicious Eid. The Government of Pakistan offers its condolences to the bereaved families and the victims. Our heart goes out to the affected families. The Government of Pakistan has lodged strong protest with the Government of India through diplomatic channels and called for restraining its forces from constant violation of the ceasefire'.³⁹

Indian Home Minister says Pakistan given 'a befitting response to violating ceasefire': October 31, 2014

Indian Home Minister Mr. Rajnath Singh said on October 31, 2014 that Pakistan had been given a befitting response to the frequent ceasefire violations done by it.

According to Mr. Rajnath, violations by Pakistan along the LoC had resulted in the death of five India soldiers. He made this statement at a convention of workers of the Bharatiya Janata Party (BJP). During his address to

the workers, he also added that '*Ab shayad Pakistan jaldi himmat nahin karega*' (Translation: 'Pakistan dare not violate truce soon').⁴⁰

Pakistan should decide whether it wants to talk to the Government of India or those who want to break India: Indian Defence Minister Arun Jaitley: November 5, 2014

The Indian Defence Minister Mr. Arun Jaitley said that Pakistan should make a choice about whether it wants to talk to the Government of India or 'those who want to break India' while referring to the leaders of the All Parties Hurriyat Conference.⁴¹ He also stated that although India was ready to engage in a constructive dialogue with Pakistan, the latter must discontinue its consultation with the Kashmiri separatist leaders.

It must be noted that India abruptly called off the Foreign Secretary level talks between Pakistan and India on Monday, August 18, 2014 scheduled to be held on August 25, 2014 in New Delhi when the Pakistani High Commissioner in India, Mr. Abdul Basit met with the leaders of the All Parties Hurriyat Conference. According to Syed Akbaruddin, the Spokesperson for the Indian Ministry on External Affairs, such a move showed Pakistan's lack of sincerity towards resuming dialogue with India.

Pakistan's Foreign Office rejects statement by the Indian Defence Minister: November 06, 2014

Ms. Tasnim Aslam, Pakistan Foreign Office's Spokesperson in a media briefing, rejected the comments made by Indian Defence Minister, Mr. Arun Jaitley to choose between either resuming talks with the Government of India or to consult Kashmiri leaders on the issue of Kashmir. She said that it was a longstanding practice that prior to Pakistan-India talks, meetings with Kashmiri leaders were held to facilitate meaningful discussions on the issue of Kashmir.⁴²

37. For details, please see **Prime Minister's response to Indian Prime Minister's letter**, MoFA, September 8, 2014; <http://www.mofa.gov.pk/pr-details.php?prID=2199>

38. For details, please see **At least 1 killed, 12 injured in Pak-India cross border firing**, Dawn, October 8, 2014; <http://www.dawn.com/news/1136594>

39. For details, please see **Pakistan lodges protests with India over ceasefire violations**, MoFA, October 06, 2014; <http://www.mofa.gov.pk/pr-details.php?prID=2290>

40. For details, please see **Pakistan not to dare violate truce soon: Indian Minister**, Dawn, November 01, 2014; <http://www.dawn.com/news/1141703/pakistan-not-to-dare-violate-truce-soon-indian-minister>

41. For details, please see **Pakistan must decide if it wants to talk to India or Hurriyat leaders: Indian Defence Minister**, The Express Tribune, November 05, 2014; <http://tribune.com.pk/story/786122/pakistan-must-decide-if-it-wants-to-talk-to-india-or-hurriyat-leaders-indian-defence-minister/>

42. For details, please see **FO rejects Jaitley's statement about talks**, Dawn, November 07, 2014; <http://www.dawn.com/news/1142797/fo-rejects-jaitleys-statement-about-talks>

January 2013 – November 2014

Rejecting the contention made by Mr. Jaitley, she said that the necessity to consult the Kashmiri leaders before any Pakistan-India Dialogue arose from the fact that they are a party to the Kashmir dispute along with Pakistan and India.

She further said that 'Pakistan acted in good faith and Prime Minister Nawaz Sharif accepted invitation from India to attend oath-taking ceremony of Indian Prime Minister Narendra Modi'.⁴⁴

Release of 40 Indian Prisoners by Pakistan: November 28, 2014

According to a press release issued by the Ministry of Foreign Affairs, Pakistan released 40 Indian prisoners (5 civil prisoners and 35 fishermen) on November 29, 2014, who were to be repatriated to India through Wagha. This will bring the total number of Indian prisoners released during this year to 191, which includes 6 civil prisoners and 185 fishermen.

Prime Minister Nawaz Sharif: Now the ball is in India's Court: November 26, 2014

Prime Minister Nawaz Sharif on November 26, 2014 advised India to take the initiative and resume the stalled dialogue process with Pakistan by saying that 'now the ball is in India's court'.

This was in reference to India's unilateral decision to call off the Foreign Secretary-level talks that were due in August this year in protest at a meeting of Pakistan's High Commissioner in New Delhi with leaders from the Indian side of Jammu and Kashmir.

During a press briefing while on his way to the 18th SAARC Summit, the Prime Minister stated that question about the continuity of talks between Pakistan and India should be directed towards India because of their unilateral decision to call off the Foreign Secretary level talks in August 2014.⁴³

No breakthrough expected in dialogue with India, says Pakistan Foreign Office Spokesperson: December 04, 2014

Responding to queries at a weekly news briefing in Islamabad, Pakistan's Foreign Office Spokesperson Ms. Tasneem Aslam said on December 04, 2014 that there was no immediate breakthrough expected in resumption of bilateral dialogue with India.

43. For details, please see **Resumption of dialogue: the ball is now in India's court, says PM**, The Express Tribune, November 26, 2014: <http://tribune.com.pk/story/797327/resumption-of-dialogue-the-ball-is-now-in-indias-court-says-pm/>

44. For details, please see **No breakthrough expected in resumption of Dialogue with India: FO**, Dawn, December 04, 2014: <http://www.dawn.com/news/1148771/no-breakthrough-expected-in-resumption-of-dialogue-with-india-fo>

APPENDICES

Appendix A

Factsheet on LoC Violations: January 2013 – November 2014

1. January 09, 2013: India accuses Pakistan of 'beheading' Indian soldier at the LoC while Pakistan rejected these claims⁴⁵
2. January 10, 2013: India rejects Pakistan's Proposal for UN probe into LoC Incident⁴⁶
3. January 10, 2013: Pakistan express hope that the LoC incident will not affect the Pakistan – India dialogue process⁴⁷
4. January 16, 2013: Pakistani soldiers accused of crossing the LoC⁴⁸
5. February 13, 2013: India declares beheading incident as unacceptable⁴⁹
6. February 16, 2013: Pakistan accuses India of killing its soldier on LoC⁵⁰
7. March 14, 2013: Pakistan expresses hope that the LoC incidents will not affect the dialogue process between Pakistan and India⁵¹
8. June 25, 2013: Pakistani businessmen resolve to continue trade despite the LoC incidents⁵²
9. July 28, 2013: Pakistan media reports a Pakistan Army soldier was martyred and another was seriously injured in firing by Indian troops from across the Line of Control (LoC).⁵³
10. August 06, 2013: Indian media reports five soldiers were killed and another injured by a group of heavily armed militants, allegedly backed by Pakistan army, ambushed an Indian army patrol along the Line of Control.⁵⁴
11. August 7, 2013: Pakistan rejects the Indian media allegations about an attack across the LoC.⁵⁵
12. August 08, 2013: Indian media reports Pakistan Army opened unprovoked firing on forward posts along the LoC in Pallanwala sub-sector in Jammu district.⁵⁶

45. For details please see: **India says Pakistan 'beheaded' Kashmir Soldier**: BBC: <http://www.bbc.co.uk/news/world-asia-india-20954975>
46. For details please see: **India rejects Pakistan's proposal for UN Probe into the Loc incident**: The Times of India: http://articles.timesofindia.indiatimes.com/2013-01-10/india/36257369_1_indian-soldiers-indian-troops-kashmir-s-poonch
47. For details please see: **FM Khar hopes LoC incidents will not affect Pak-India dialogue**: Geo News: <http://www.geo.tv/article-83202-FM-Khar-hopes-LoC-incidents-will-not-affect-Pak-India-dialogue->
48. For details please see: **Assessing Pakistan's Transgression on the Line of Control**: IDSA (Institute of Defence Studies and Analyses): http://www.idsa.in/issuebrief/AssessingPakistansTransgressionontheLineofControl_vchadha_160113
49. For details please see: **Alleged beheading: LoC incident is unacceptable, says Indian PM**: The Express Tribune: <http://tribune.com.pk/story/506599/alleged-beheading-loc-incident-is-unacceptable-says-indian-pm/>
50. For details please see: **Pak soldier killed on LoC**: Greater Kashmir: <http://www.greaterkashmir.com/news/2013/Feb/16/pak-soldier-killed-on-loc-54.asp>
51. For details please see: **LoC incidents cannot derail Pak-India peace: Khar**: The International Herald Tribune: <http://tribune.com.pk/story/520742/loc-incidents-cannot-derail-pak-india-peace-khar/>
52. For details please see: **Pak, India trade to continue despite clashes at LoC**: Indian Defense: <http://www.indiandefence.com/forums/pakistan/19231-pak-india-trade-continue-despite-clashes-loc.html>
53. For details please see: **Pak army soldier martyred by Indian firing at LoC**, The News: <http://www.thenews.com.pk/Todays-News-13-24426-Pak-Army-soldier-martyred-by-Indian-firing-at-LoC>
54. For details please see: **5 soldiers killed in LOC ambush in Poonch**, Greater Kashmir: <http://www.greaterkashmir.com/news/2013/Aug/7/5-soldiers-killed-in-loc-ambush-in-poonch-23.asp>
55. For details please see: **Pakistan rejects the claim of the Indian media on Loc incursions**, The News: <http://www.thenews.com.pk/Todays-News-13-24642-Pakistan-rejects-claims-of-Indian-media-on-LoC-incursions>
56. For details please see **Pakistan army again violates ceasefire along LoC in Jammu**, Times of India: http://articles.timesofindia.indiatimes.com/2013-08-30/india/41618135_1_pakistan-army-forward-posts-indian-posts

REPORT

Pace & Progress of Pakistan-India Dialogue

January 2013 – November 2014

13. August 08, 2013: Pakistan media reports Pakistan made concrete proposals to the Indian side to help reduce the tension along the LoC and Indian response is awaited.⁵⁷
 14. August 10, 2013: Pakistan is accused by India of violates ceasefire again.⁵⁸
 15. August 11, 2013: India accuses Pakistan of violating ceasefire for third time in 72 hours.⁵⁹
 16. August 12, 2013: Pakistan media reports Indian security forces fired on the Pakistani border posts in the Nakial sector.⁶⁰
 17. August 12, 2013: Pakistan summoned India's Deputy High Commissioner to protest over the clashes along the LoC.⁶¹
 18. August 12, 2013: Pakistan's Punjab Assembly adopted a unanimous resolution condemning the Indian aggression along the Line of Control.⁶²
 19. August 13, 2013: National Assembly of Pakistan unanimously condemned Indian military's aggression" across the Line of Control (LoC).⁶³
 20. August 13, 2013: Pakistan media reports a civilian in Rawalakot killed by the firing of the Indian Border Security Force.⁶⁴
 21. August 13, 2013: India wants Pakistan to take responsibility for LoC killings.⁶⁵
 22. August 14, 2013: Indian media accuses Pakistani troops of firing on Indian posts along the LoC in Hamirpur-Balakote and Mendhar forward areas in Poonch district.⁶⁶
 23. August 14, 2013: The Indian Parliament Lok Sabha and Rajya Sabha unanimously adopt resolutions condemning Pakistan Army for indulging in the attacks across the Loc.⁶⁷
 24. August 15, 2013: Prime Minister Nawaz Sharif calls for de-escalation of tension on the Line of Control (LoC).⁶⁸
 25. August 16, 2013: Indian media reports the Indian Army claims to have killed 28 militants on the LoC.⁶⁹
 26. August 16, 2013: Pakistan media reports Indian forces continue to violate the LoC.⁷⁰
57. For details please see: **Indian response to maintaining LoC cease fire awaited**, Dawn: <http://beta.dawn.com/news/1039306/indian-response-to-maintaining-loc-ceasefire-awaited-fo>
58. For details please see: **Pakistan violates cease fire again: opens fire on Indian Posts**, The Economic Times: http://articles.economictimes.indiatimes.com/2013-08-10/news/41268096_1_indian-posts-mmgs-poonch-sector
59. For details please see: **LoC killings: Pakistan violates cease fire for third time in 72 hours**, The India Today: <http://indiatoday.intoday.in/story/loc-killings-pakistan-violates-ceasefire-for-third-time-in-72-hours/1/299044.html>
60. For details please see: **Indian Army resorts to unprovoked firing in Nakial, Sialkot Sector**, The News: <http://www.thenews.com.pk/Todays-News-13-24721-Indian-Army-resorts-to-unprovoked-firing-in-Nakial-Sialkot-sectors>
61. For details please see: **Indian Deputy High Commissioner summoned over Loc violation**, The Dawn: <http://dawn.com/news/1035436/indian-deputy-high-commissioner-summoned-over-loc-violation>
62. For details please see: **Punjab PA condemns Indian aggression**, The Dawn: <http://beta.dawn.com/news/1035487/punjab-pa-condemns-indian-aggression>
63. For details please see: **NA condemns Indian army's aggression**, The Dawn: <http://beta.dawn.com/news/1035740/na-condemns-indian-armys-aggression>
64. For details please see: **Indian firing at LoC continues**, The News: <http://www.thenews.com.pk/Todays-News-13-24741-Indian-firing-at-LoC-continues-one-killed>
65. For details please see: **Indian wants Pak to take responsibility of LoC killings**, The Hindu: <http://www.thehindu.com/news/national/india-wants-pak-to-take-responsibility-for-loc-killings/article5012535.ece>
66. For details please see: **Pakistan violates cease fire again, targets 16 Indian Posts**, The Hind: <http://www.thehindu.com/news/national/pak-violates-ceasefire-again-targets-16-indian-posts/article5021736.ece>
67. For details please see: **India's two houses reject National Assembly Resolution**, The Dawn: <http://beta.dawn.com/news/1035927/indias-two-houses-reject-na-resolution>
68. For details please see: **Nawaz calls for de-escalation of tension on LoC**, The Dawn: <http://beta.dawn.com/news/1035931/nawaz-calls-for-de-escalation-of-tension-on-loc>
69. For details please see: **28 militants killed by Indian army on LoC in nearly two months**, The Economic Times: http://articles.economictimes.indiatimes.com/2013-08-16/news/41417557_1_kashmir-valley-infiltration-indian-army
70. For details please see: **Woman among six injured in Indian army's shelling across LoC**, The News: <http://www.thenews.com.pk/Todays-News-13-24810-Woman-among-six-injured-in-Indian-Arms-shelling-across-LoC>

REPORT

Pace & Progress of Pakistan-India Dialogue

January 2013 – November 2014

27. August 17, 2013: Pakistan media reports 7 civilians, including three women, were injured in unprovoked firing by Indian troops across the Line of Control (LoC).⁷¹
28. August 19, 2013: Indian Defence Minister A K Antony blamed the Pakistani Army in Rajya Sabha for the killings of five Indian soldiers along the Line of Control (LoC) and the ceasefire violations in Jammu and Kashmir.⁷²
29. August 22, 2013: India also accuses Pakistan for violating ceasefire at LoC in Poonch.⁷³
30. August 22, 2013: Pakistan Foreign Office states that India has been continuously violating the cease fire agreement on the LoC.⁷⁴
31. August 25, 2013: Pakistan media reports a woman was killed and seven other civilians were injured in shelling by Indian troops from across the LoC in Azad Jammu and Kashmir (AJK).⁷⁵
32. August 27, 2013: Pakistan media reports five civilians were injured in the Nakial sector amid fresh displacement of 37 families from some highly vulnerable villages along the LoC.⁷⁶
33. September 01, 2013: Pakistani media reports two Pakistani civilians were injured in Indian firing and shelling on the Line of Control (LoC).⁷⁷
34. September 02, 2013: Indian media reports Pakistan troops violated the ceasefire on the Line of Control (LoC), opening fire at Indian positions in Jammu and Kashmir's Poonch district.⁷⁸
35. September 02, 2013: Pakistani media reports Indian and Pakistani troops traded fire in some areas of Nakial sector in the Kotli district of Azad Jammu and Kashmir. However, no casualties were reported.⁷⁹
36. September 03, 2013: Indian media reports Pakistani troops targeted Indian forward posts and civilian areas along the Line of Control (LoC) in Poonch district of Jammu and Kashmir.⁸⁰
37. September 04, 2013: Indian envoy raises LoC incident during 'courtesy call on Prime Minister's Advisor on Foreign Affairs'.⁸¹
38. October 23, 2013: According to Pakistani media reports, shelling was intensified along the Working Boundary in Pukhlian, Chaprar, Harpal and Charwah Sectors near Sialkot towards the end of October 2013.⁸²

71. For details please see: **Seven more injured in Indian firing across LoC**, The News: <http://www.thenews.com.pk/Todays-News-13-24824-Seven-more-injured-in-Indian-firing-across-LoC>
72. For details please see: **Pakistan army behind LoC killings**, Zee News: http://zeenews.india.com/news/nation/pakistani-army-behind-loc-killings-antony_870004.html
73. For details please see, **Pakistan violates cease fire for third time in 24 hours at LoC in Poonch, India retaliates**, The Indian Express: <http://www.indianexpress.com/news/pakistan-violates-ceasefire-for-third-time-in-24-hours-at-loc-in-poonch-india-retaliates/1158699/>
74. For more details please see: **LoC violations matter of grave concern**, Express Tribune: <http://tribune.com.pk/story/593772/loc-violations-matter-of-grave-concern-fo/>
75. For details please see: **Woman killed, seven injured in LoC Shelling**, The Dawn: <http://beta.dawn.com/news/1038432/woman-killed-seven-injured-in-loc-shelling>
76. For details please see: **Five civilians injured by Indian shelling**, The Dawn: <http://beta.dawn.com/news/1038660/five-civilians-injured-by-indian-shelling>
77. For details please see: **Two Pak civilians hurt in Indian shelling on LoC**, The News: <http://www.thenews.com.pk/Todays-News-13-25149-Two-Pak-civilians-hurt-in-Indian-shelling-on-LoC>
78. For details please see: **After a week, Pakistan again violates LoC ceasefire**, Business Standard: http://www.business-standard.com/article/news-ians/after-a-week-pakistan-again-violates-loc-ceasefire-113090201058_1.html
79. For details please see, **Shelling near Kotli**, The Dawn: <http://beta.dawn.com/news/1040182/shelling-near-kotli>
80. For details please see: **Pakistan shells forward posts in Poonch, villager injured**, Business Standard: http://www.business-standard.com/article/pti-stories/pak-shells-forward-posts-in-poonch-villager-injured-113090301160_1.html
81. For details please see: **Indian envoy raises LoC incident during courtesy call**, Dawn.com: <http://beta.dawn.com/news/1040356/indian-envoy-raises-loc-incident-during-courtesy-call>
82. For details, **please see Indian Shelling intensified on Working Boundary**, The News, October 24, 2013: <http://www.thenews.com.pk/Todays-News-13-26253-Indian-shelling-intensified-on-working-boundary>

REPORT

Pace & Progress of Pakistan-India Dialogue

January 2013 – November 2014

39. October 28, 2013: A decision was taken at a flag-meeting between the officials of the Indian Border Security Force and the Punjab Rangers to suspend hostilities along the Line of Control.⁸³
 40. July 23, 2014: A Pakistani citizen was killed in Narowal due to cross-border firing by the Indian forces.⁸⁴
 41. September 01, 2014: Pakistani Foreign Office expressed 'deep concern' over the continuous firing violations across the LoC by the Indian forces.⁸⁵
 42. October 08, 2014: Pakistani media reported that Indian cross-border firing along the Sialkot Working Boundary killed 12 Pakistanis.⁸⁶
 43. October 09, 2014: The Indian media reported that two women were killed along with 15 others injured in a spate of cross-border firing by the Pakistani forces along the LoC.⁸⁷
 44. October 09, 2014: Three civilians, including two women were killed due to Indian cross-border firing along the Sialkot Working Boundary.⁸⁸
 45. October 13, 2014: India rejects United Nations probe into ceasefire violations saying that according to the Simla Accord and the Lahore Declaration, third party mediation was unacceptable.⁸⁹
 46. October 13, 2014: Pakistani media reported that two women injured as a result of Indian firing across the LoC in the Haveli district of Pakistan-occupied Jammu and Kashmir.⁹⁰
 47. October 20, 2014: According to the Pakistani media, a Pakistani citizen was injured by firing of the Indian Border Security Forces at the Sialkot border village of Janglora.⁹¹
 48. October 22, 2014: According to the Pakistani media, the Indian Border Security Forces resorted to firing on the Sialkot border villages in the Charwah Sector of Sialkot Working Boundary.⁹²
 49. October 29, 2014: Pakistan Foreign Office summoned to the First Political Secretary at the Indian High Commission to protest the killing an elderly Pakistani women along the Line of Control⁹³
 50. November 06, 2014: Pakistani media reports that three siblings were killed when an Indian mortar exploded in the Shakargarh area of Pakistan⁹⁴
 51. November 20, 2014: Pakistani soldier killed in Kashmir by Indian cross-border firing⁹⁵
 52. November 28, 2014: The Indian Border Security Force (BSF) reopened unprovoked firing on Sialkot border villages in Charwah and Harpal sectors of Working Boundary⁹⁶
83. For details, please see **Pak, India accord to end border skirmishes**, Dawn, October 30, 2013: <http://www.dawn.com/news/1052834/pak-india-accord-to-end-border-skirmishes>
 84. For details, please see **Another killed by Indian firing along Narowal border**, The News, July 24, 2014: <http://www.thenews.com.pk/Todays-News-2-263580-Another-killed-in-Indian-firing-on-Narowal-border>
 85. For details, please see **Pakistan concerned over continuous ceasefire violations by India**, Daily Times, September 01, 2014: <http://www.dailytimes.com.pk/national/01-Sep-2014/pak-concerned-over-continuous-ceasefire-violation-by-india-fo>
 86. For details, please see **12 killed in Indian firing across LoC**, The News, October 09, 2014: <http://www.thenews.com.pk/Todays-News-13-33364-12-killed-in-Indian-firing-across-Sialkot-border>
 87. For details, please see **India claims two women killed, 15 injured in cross-border firing by Pakistan**, Dawn, October 09, 2014: <http://www.thenews.com.pk/Todays-News-13-33366-India-claims-two-women-killed-15-hurt-in-Pak-firing>
 88. For details, please see **Two women, among three killed in Indian firing**, Dawn, October 10, 2014: <http://www.dawn.com/news/1137022/two-women-among-three-killed-in-indian-firing>
 89. For details, please see **India rejects UN probe into ceasefire violations**, The News, October 13, 2014: <http://www.thenews.com.pk/Todays-News-13-33463-India-rejects-UN-probe-into-ceasefire-violations>
 90. For details, please see **Two women injured in Indian firing**, The Nation, October 14, 2014: <http://nation.com.pk/national/14-Oct-2014/two-women-injured-in-indian-firing>
 91. For details, please see **One hurt as Indian BSF once again violates LoC ceasefire**, The News, October 20, 2014: <http://www.thenews.com.pk/Todays-News-13-33580-One-hurt-as-Indian-BSF-once-again-violates-LoC-ceasefire>
 92. For details, please see **Indian forces target Sialkot border villages again**, The News, October 23, 2014: <http://www.thenews.com.pk/Todays-News-13-33641-Indian-forces-target-Sialkot-border-villages-again>
 93. For details, please see **FO summons Indian diplomat to protest cross-border killing**, The News, October 30, 2014: <http://www.thenews.com.pk/Todays-News-13-33798-FO-summons-Indian-diplomat-to-protest-cross-border-killing>
 94. For details, please see **Indian mortar kills three siblings**, Dawn, November 06, 2014: <http://www.dawn.com/news/1142584>
 95. For details, please see **Pakistani soldier killed in Indian firing**, The News, November 21, 2014: <http://www.thenews.com.pk/Todays-News-13-34254-Pakistani-soldier-killed-in-Indian-firing>
 96. For details, please see: **India reopens firing in Sialkot**, The Nation: <http://nation.com.pk/national/28-Nov-2014/india-reopens-firing-in-sialkot>

January 2013 – November 2014

Appendix B

Violations along the Line of Control (LoC) from January 2013 – November 2014

No.	Date	LoC Violations as Claimed by India	LoC Violations as Claimed by Pakistan	Military Casualties as Claimed by India	Civilian Casualties as Claimed by India	Military Casualties as Claimed by Pakistan	Civilian Casualties as Claimed by Pakistan
1.	January 09, 2013	India claimed Pakistani forces beheaded an Indian Soldier in Kashmir along the LoC	X	1	X	X	X
2.	January 16, 2013	Indian authorities claimed Pakistani soldiers crossed the LoC into India	X	X	X	X	X
3.	February 16, 2013	X	Pakistan claimed Indian forces killed one of its soldiers on the LoC	X	X	1	X
4.	July 28, 2013	X	Pakistani media claimed that a Pakistan Army soldier was martyred and another injured by firing from Indian troops at the LoC	X	X	1	X
5.	August 06, 2013	Indian media reported that five soldiers were killed by Pakistan Army at LoC	X	5	X	X	X
6.	August 10, 2013	India accuses Pakistan of violating the ceasefire at the LoC	X	X	X	X	X

REPORT

Pace & Progress of Pakistan-India Dialogue

January 2013 – November 2014

7.	August 11, 2013	Pakistan is accused by India of violating the ceasefire again	X	X	X	X	X
8.	August 12, 2013	X	Pakistani media reported Indian security forces fired on the Pakistani border posts in the Nakial sector	X	X	X	X
9.	August 13, 2013	X	Pakistani media reported a civilian killed in Rawalakot because of firing by Indian forces	X	X	X	1
10.	August 14, 2013	Indian media reported firing by Pakistani troops in the Poonch District of Kashmir	X	X	X	X	X
11.	August 16, 2014	Indian media reported that the Indian forces killed 28 militants on the LoC who were violating the ceasefire	X	X	X	X	X
12.	August 16, 2013	X	Pakistani media reported continuous violations along the LoC by the Indian troops	X	X	X	X
13.	August 17, 2013	X	Pakistani media reported that 7 civilians including three women were injured in unprovoked firing by India along the LoC	X	X	X	7

REPORT

Pace & Progress of Pakistan-India Dialogue

January 2013 – November 2014

14.	August 22, 2013	India accused Pakistan of violating the ceasefire at Poonch in Kashmir	X	X	X	X	X
15.	August 22, 2013	X	Pakistan's Ministry of Foreign Affairs claimed India had been violating the LoC ceasefire for almost a month	X	X	X	X
16.	August 25, 2013	X	Pakistani media reports that a woman was killed and seven others injured due to firing by India troops in Azad Jammu and Kashmir	X	X	X	1
17.	August 27, 2013	X	Pakistani media reports that five civilians were injured in the Nakial sector by Indian firing and shelling	X	X	X	X
18.	September 01, 2013	X	Pakistani media reported that two civilians were injured due to Indian firing along the LoC	X	X	X	X
19.	September 02, 2013	Indian media reported that Pakistan's troops violated the ceasefire along the LoC	X	X	X	X	X
20.	September 02, 2013	X	Pakistani media reported that Indian forces indulged in continuous shelling in the Nakial Sector	X	X	X	X

REPORT

Pace & Progress of Pakistan-India Dialogue

January 2013 – November 2014

21.	October 23, 2013	X	According to Pakistani media reports, shelling was intensified along the Working Boundary in Chaprar, Harpal, and Charwah sectors near Sialkot	X	X	X	X
22.	July 23, 2014	X	A Pakistani civilian was reported to be killed in Narowal due to firing by Indian forces	X	X	X	1
23.	October 08, 2014	X	Pakistani media reported that Indian cross-border firing along the Sialkot Working Boundary killed 12 civilian	X	X	X	12
24.	October 09, 2014	The Indian media reported that two women were killed along with 15 others injured because of firing by the Pakistani forces	X	2	X	X	X
25.	October 09, 2014	X	Three civilians including two women were killed due to Indian firing along the Sialkot border	X	X	X	3
26.	October 13, 2014	X	Pakistani media reported that two women were injured as a result of Indian firing in the Haveli district of Kashmir	X	X	X	X

REPORT

Pace & Progress of Pakistan-India Dialogue

January 2013 – November 2014

27.	October 20, 2014	X	A Pakistani citizen was injured by Indian firing near Sialkot village	X	X	X	X
28.	October 22, 2014	X	According the media reports, Indian forces resorted to cross-border firing along in the Charwah sector of the Sialkot Working Boundary	X	X	X	X
29.	November 06, 2014	X	Pakistani media reported that three siblings were killed when an Indian mortar exploded in Shakargarh	X	X	X	3
30.	November 20, 2014	X	Pakistani soldier killed in Kashmir due to cross-border firing by Indian forces	X	X	1	X
31.	November 28, 2014	X	The Indian Border Security Forces (BSF) reopened firing on the Sialkot Working Boundary	X	X	X	X



Islamabad Office:

P. O. Box 278, F-8, Postal Code: 44220, Islamabad, Pakistan

Lahore Office:

P. O. Box 11098, L.C.C.H.S, Postal Code: 54792, Lahore, Pakistan

E-mail: info@pildat.org | Website: www.pildat.org