

SCORE CARD

First Year of the Government of the Punjab

June 6, 2013 - June 5, 2014



Assessment of the Quality of Governance

SCORE CARD

First Year of the Government of the Punjab

June 6, 2013 - June 5, 2014



PILDAT is an independent, non-partisan and not-for-profit indigenous research and training institution with the mission to strengthen democracy and democratic institutions in Pakistan.

PILDAT is a registered non-profit entity under the Societies Registration Act XXI of 1860, Pakistan.

Copyright © Pakistan Institute of Legislative Development And Transparency - PILDAT

All Rights Reserved

Printed in Pakistan

Published: June 2015

ISBN: 978-969-558-447-7

Any part of this publication can be used or cited with a clear reference to PILDAT.

Supported by

EMBASSY OF DENMARK
DANIDA | INTERNATIONAL
DEVELOPMENT COOPERATION

PILdAT
Pakistan Institute of
Legislative Development
And Transparency

Islamabad Office: P. O. Box 278, F-8, Postal Code: 44220, Islamabad, Pakistan
Lahore Office: P. O. Box 11098, L.C.C.H.S, Postal Code: 54792, Lahore, Pakistan
E-mail: info@pildat.org | Website: www.pildat.org

June 6, 2013 – June 5, 2014

CONTENTS

Preface

Abbreviation and Acronyms

Executive Summary

Introduction	21
Assessment of the Quality of Governance under Individual Parameters	23
- Annual Development Programme	23
- Anti-Corruption Efforts	24
- Devolution of Power to the Lower Tiers	26
- Disaster Preparedness and Management	27
- Education	28
- Energy Production and Management	31
- Environment Sustainability	33
- Healthcare	34
- Immunization of Children	36
- Investment Friendliness	37
- Management of Population Growth	38
- Management of Relations with International Institutions	39
- Management of Unemployment	40
- Merit-Based Recruitment and Promotions	41
- Peace, Stability, and Order	42
- Poverty Alleviation	44
- Public Procurement	45
- Public Transport	46
- Safe Drinking Water Supply	47
- Sanitation	49
- Tax Collection	50
- Transparency	51
- Use of Technology for Better Governance	52
- Water Resource Development and Management	53
Appendices	
Appendix A: List of Members of the PIDAT Governance Assessment Group (GAG)	55
List of Tables	
Table 1: Score Card and Assessment of the Quality of Governance: First Year of the Government of the Punjab: June 6, 2013–June 5, 2014	10
Table 2: Timeline for Power Generation from Coal Project in South Punjab	31
Table 3: Timeline for Power Generation Project at Taunsa Barrage	31
Table 4: Timeline for the Setting up of five Micro-hydel Power Stations	31
Table 5: Number of Reported Dengue Cases in Punjab	34
Table 6: Health and Family Planning: On-going Schemes	35
Table 7: Health and Family Planning: New Schemes	35
Table 8: Budgetary Allocation for Healthcare	35
Table 9: Number of Reported Polio Cases in Punjab	36
Table 10: Number of Reported Deaths from Measles	36
Table 11: Percentage of Modern Contraceptive Methods in Punjab	38
Table 12: Rate of Unemployment in Punjab (%)	40

June 6, 2013 – June 5, 2014

Table 13: The Number of Jobs Created in the Private Sector	40
Table 14: Examination Details for Recruitment and Promotions	41
Table 15: Comparison of Prosecution of Criminal Cases in 2013 and 2014	43
Table 16: Comparison of Crimes Committed in Punjab in 2012-2013 and 2013-2014	43
Table 17: Acts of Terrorism Committed in Punjab	43
Table 18: MTDf Targets and MDGs	47
Table 19: Water Supply and Sanitation: Summary of ADP 2013–2014	48
Table 20: Details of Receipts 2013-2014 (Revised)	50
Table 21: Comparison of the Budget Estimates for Board of Revenue and Excise and Taxation 2012-2013 and 2013-2014	50
Table 22: ADP Allocation for the Punjab Information Technology Board	52
Table 23: Budgetary Allocation for Water Resource Development and Management 2013–2014	53

June 6, 2013 – June 5, 2014

PREFACE

PILDAT Score Card on the **Assessment of the Quality of Governance: First Year of the Government of the Punjab: June 6, 2013-June 5, 2014** is the first of its kind that assesses the quality of governance in Punjab upon the completion of the first year of the Government in office since May 2013 General Election.

This Score Card is primarily based on data provided by the Provincial Government of the Punjab.

The assessment and Score Card is part of PILDAT's new initiative under its Democracy and Governance Programme. Within this programme, the 'Assessment of the Quality of Governance in Pakistan' project aims to examine the performance of the Federal and Provincial Governments in 2013-2014 in comparison to 2012-2013. As democracy progresses in Pakistan, PILDAT believes the focus should now be on the *performance* of democracy and not just the *process* of democracy. With this report, PILDAT seeks to understand the extent to which the democratic governments have delivered to their citizens in terms of providing good governance.

PILDAT has developed an indigenous framework to monitor the quality of governance to assess the performance of the Federal and Provincial Governments of Pakistan. While greatly benefitting from many international frameworks to assess the quality of governance, PILDAT's framework has been prepared with the valuable input of a 27-member Governance Assessment Group comprising some of the most eminent experts across four Provinces.

PILDAT's initiative to assess the quality of governance in Punjab is by no means an exercise to criticise the performance of the Government. It is, in fact, a collaborative effort to highlight areas of strengths and potential areas requiring improvement in the quality of governance.

Earlier, upon the completion of the first year of the Federal and Provincial Governments in office in June 2013, PILDAT carried out a *Public Opinion Poll on the Quality of Governance in Pakistan: First Year of Federal and Provincial Governments*, released in September 2014. The Performance Assessment Score Card of the Federal and Provincial Governments, as a second part of this exercise, is part of the effort to assist elected political Governments in the Centre and the Provinces to improve their quality of governance. It is hoped that policymakers, Government officials, and politicians will benefit from the perspectives presented in this Score Card.

Both the Expert Score Card based on the analysis of the Government data as well as Public Approval Ratings on governance indicators through public opinion polls are planned to be conducted annually by PILDAT to keep a track of the trend of performance on governance.

The data for this Score Card was requested by PILDAT and provided by the Provincial Government. It was supplemented from published and online resources, where required. Multiple meetings were held with various Departments of the Provincial Government while the Planning and Development Department acted as the focal agency for providing coordinated response from various departments upon the direction of the Chief Minister. A draft of the analysis and the Score Card was shared with the Provincial Government. The comments by the Government were incorporated to the extent considered suitable by PILDAT before finalising the report.

Acknowledgements

PILDAT gratefully acknowledges the support of all the government and non-government institutions and organizations that extended their cooperation in compiling this Score Card. We especially wish to acknowledge the cooperation of the Government of the Punjab, particularly Ms. Zakia Shah Nawaz, MPA, Provincial Minister for Population and Welfare, who was designated as the Chairperson of the committee constituted by the Chief Minister to provide the data to PILDAT for this Score Card; other members of the committee and Planning and Development Department, Government of the Punjab, which was designated as the Focal Agency on behalf of the Provincial Government for coordinating with various Ministries/Departments and for providing data for this Score Card.

PILDAT also acknowledges the support and assistance provided by the members of the Governance Assessment Group consisting of eminent Pakistanis on an honorary basis. *Appendix A* carries the list of members of the Governance Assessment Group.

June 6, 2013 – June 5, 2014

This Score Card benefits from compilation of assessment and background research, where needed, carried out by *Ms. Naureen Ahsan*, Senior Projects Manager / Joint Director, *Ms. Reem Hassan*, former Project Manager, *Ms. Sara Ali*, *Ms. Mehrbano Raja* and *Ms. Neha Ali Gauhar*, Projects Officers PILDAT, its review by *Ms. Aasiya Riaz*, Joint Director, PILDAT, under the overall guidance and direction by *Mr. Ahmed Bilal Mehboob*, President PILDAT.

This Score Card has been prepared by PILDAT as a part of the Governance and Democracy Programme, which is supported by the Danish International Development Agency (DANIDA), Government of Denmark. We wish to thank them for their support but reiterate that the views expressed in this Score Card do not necessarily represent the views of DANIDA, Royal Danish Embassy, Islamabad or the Government of Denmark.

Disclaimer

PILDAT has made every effort to ensure the accuracy of data and assessment in this Score Card. Any error or omission therefore is not deliberate.

Islamabad
May 2015

June 6, 2013 – June 5, 2014

Abbreviations and Acronyms

ACE	Anti-Corruption Establishment
ADB	Asian Development Bank
ADP	Annual Development Programme
AIOU	Allama Iqbal Open University
ASI	Assistant Sub-Inspector
BHU	Basic health unit
BISE	Board of Intermediate and Secondary Education
BZU	Bahauddin Zakariya University
CPR	Contraceptive prevalence rate
CWE	China Water and Electric (Corporation)
DANIDA	Danish International Development Agency
DFID	Department for International Development (UK)
DRF	Disaster response force
DRTA	District Regional Transport Authority
DRTS	District Regional Transport System
EA	Environmental assessment
ECP	Election Commission of Pakistan
EIA	Environmental impact assessment
EPA	Environment Protection Agency
EU	European Union
FDI	Foreign direct investment
FIA	Federal Investigation Agency
GAG	Governance Assessment Group
GRR	Gross reproductive rate
GSP	Generalized system of preferences
GST	General sales tax
HEC	Higher Education Commission
HED	Higher Education Department
IEE	Initial environmental examinations
IFAD	International Fund for Agricultural Development
IFC	International Finance Corporation
IPA	Investment promoting agency
IT	Information technology
JV	Joint venture
KW	Kilowatt
LCA	Lifecycle analysis
LGE	Local government election
LTC	Lahore Transport Company
MBS	Metro Bus Service
MIS	Management information system
MOU	Memorandum of understanding
MT	Metric ton
MTDF	Medium-Term Development Framework
MW	Megawatt
NDMA	National Disaster Management Authority
NIPS	National Institute of Population Studies
NTS	National Testing Service
PBIT	Punjab Board of Investment and Trade
PDMA	Punjab Disaster Management Authority
PEC	Punjab Education Commission
PEOP	Punjab Economic Opportunities Programme
PHC	Punjab Healthcare Commission

June 6, 2013 – June 5, 2014

PIDA	Punjab Irrigation and Drainage Authority
PITB	Pakistan Information Technology Board
PML-N	Pakistan Muslim League-Nawaz
PPMRP	Punjab Public Management Reform Programme
PPRA	Punjab Procurement Regulatory Authority
PPSC	Punjab Public Service Commission
PRA	Punjab Revenue Authority
PSDF	Punjab Skills Development Fund
PSV	Public Sector Vehicle
PWD	Population Welfare Department
PYIP	Punjab Youth Internship Programme
RNI	Rate of Natural Increase
RO	Reverse osmosis
RTI	(The Punjab Transparency and) Right to Information (Act)
SDPI	Sustainable Development Policy Institute
SED	School Education Department
SEZ	Special economic zone
SHS	Solar home solution
TFR	Total fertility rate
UF	Ultra-filtration (plant)
WASA	Water and Sanitation Agency
WFP	World Food Programme.

June 6, 2013 – June 5, 2014

Executive Summary

Assessment of the quality of governance of the Punjab Government in its first year in office (June 6, 2013- June 5, 2014) has earned it a score of **42%**.

The Punjab Government has the highest score in only two out of the 24 governance parameters, i.e., **Tax Collection**, which scored 76% and **Public Procurement**, scoring 72%. While majority of the parameters scored 40% and above, the parameters that scored the lowest are **Management of Unemployment** at 21% and **Devolution of Power to the Lower Tiers** at 23%.

The results of the public approval ratings of the Punjab Government, based on a PILDAT public opinion poll conducted in July-August 2014, and PILDAT's Score Card were analogous in many parameters. However there were differences at places; for instance the public opinion poll gave the Provincial Government a score of 25% to Energy Production and Management and 45% to Tax Collection whereas in PILDAT score the rating of Energy Production and Management is 45% and Tax Collection is 76%. Furthermore, the Punjab Government's efforts to improve Immunization of Children and Public Transport both received ratings above 70% in the opinion poll. However, the PILDAT scores assigned to both parameters were below 50 %, to be exact 49% and 40% respectively. Overall approval rating for the Punjab Government was 47 % in the public opinion poll whereas the overall quality of Governance as determined through the data analysis is 42%. However, Punjab enjoys the first position in the comparative ranking of the four provinces both in the public opinion poll and the score assigned on the basis of the data analysis.

Positive Parameters of Governance in Punjab

Based on the comparative data provided by the Punjab Government on the 24 key governance parameters for 2012-2013 and 2013-2014, the overall performance of the Punjab Government seems to have comparatively improved.

The performance analysis indicates that during 2013-2014, the Punjab Government showed the greatest improvement under the parameter of **Tax Collection** in comparison to 2012-2013. Tax Collection in the Province increased by Rs. 33 billion or 42% as compared to 2012-2013. The Government enacted the Punjab Sales Tax on Services (Enforcement) Rules 2014.

Data also shows that significant measures were also taken to improve governance in the parameter of **Public Procurement**. The Government introduced the new Punjab Public Procurement Rules 2014. Consequently, the Punjab Procurement Rules Authority held more public firms accountable for violating procurement rules as compared to the previous year.

The Punjab **Transparency** and Right to Information Act 2013 was enforced during the year. Punjab Information Commission was established and 3 Information Commissioners were appointed under this Act.

4 **polio cases** were reported in the Province during 2013-2014, in comparison to 7 reported during the previous year; this shows a 43% decrease in polio.

Punjab Government has launched a wide campaign to bring back 2 million out of school children to ensure 100 % enrolment by 2015 in the **Education** sector but the success of the campaign is yet to be determined.

There was 58.5% increase in the **foreign assistance for development** projects in Punjab to Rs. 18, 212.486 million in 2013-2014.

The budget for the **irrigation** sector was doubled and for **Use of Technology for Better Governance** the budget increased by 84% in comparison to the previous year.

The Punjab Government faced acute energy shortage, which has severely affected its industrial output, agriculture, commercial activity and domestic consumers in general. 5 new schemes were introduced in the **energy sector** and the allocated budget was doubled, which is expected to add 50 MW in the system. In the aftermath of the two floods in Punjab in 2012-2013, which affected 2.4 million people, the Provincial Government initiated relief efforts by setting up

June 6, 2013 – June 5, 2014

492 camps in 17 districts. In addition, during 2013-14 the revised ADP for 2012-2013 was Rs. 166.86 billion and compared to that the ADP budget for 2013-2014 is about 74% larger.

Following the inauguration of the Lahore Metro Bus Service, currently 69 million people have access to public transport in 2013-2014 .

Negative Aspects of Governance in Punjab

The rate of **unemployment** in Punjab has increased by 0.64% and was 7.07%. **Local Government Elections** could not be held according to the Punjab Local Government Act. A high percentage of approximately 50% of rural households still do not have access to **sanitation** facilities and **safe drinking water** .

Furthermore, the South of Punjab is suffering from staggering levels of **poverty**, as 30-40% of the population is living under the poverty line. There is **over-centralization** of power in the hands of a few at the provincial capital. Over the past year, the greatest challenge for the country and Punjab has been **Sectarianism** and its nexus with terrorist organizations has also posed a great threat to the law and order situation in the Province. Incidents such as the Model Town tragedy where 12 persons lost their lives in a clash between the workers of the Pakistan Awami Tehrik (PAT) and the police have weakened the law and order situation of the Province and over-shadowed the positive measures taken to improve the quality of governance in Punjab. The crime rate increased during the reporting period. The Province is also lagging behind in meeting the Millennium Development Goal to improve maternal health, and adequate steps have not been taken to manage **population growth** specifically in relation to contraceptive prevalence rate and total fertility rate in the Province

Table 1: Score Card and Assessment of the Quality of Governance: First Year of the Government of the Punjab: June 6, 2013–June 5, 2014

No.	Parameters	Score assigned by PILDAT based on Data Analysis	Approval Rating according to the Public Opinion Poll conducted in July-August 2014
1	Tax Collection	76%	45%
2	Public Procurement	72%	45%
3	Anti-Corruption Efforts	56%	31%
4	Transparency	53%	46%
5	Immunization	49%	73%
6	Healthcare	48%	56%
7	Education	47%	62%
8	Management of Relations with International Institutions	46%	50%
9	Environmental Sustainability	44%	44%
10	Water Resource Development and Management	43%	48%
11	Use of Technology for Better Governance	43%	53%
12	Energy Production and Management	42%	25%

June 6, 2013 – June 5, 2014

13	Annual Development Programme	40%	54%
14	Disaster Preparedness and Management	40%	45%
15	Public Transport	40%	72%
16	Management of Population Growth	37%	NA
17	Merit-Based Recruitment and Promotions	37%	33%
18	Investment Friendliness	36%	39%
19	Peace, Stability, and Order	34%	55%
20	Poverty Alleviation	33%	32%
21	Safe Drinking Water Supply	25%	51%
22	Sanitation	25%	40%
23	Devolution of Power to the Lower Tiers	23%	37%
24	Management of Unemployment	21%	34%
Overall Quality of Governance based on the average value of above scores		42%	47%

The quality of governance is assessed based on PILDAT Framework with 24 parameters. The scores are assigned on each parameter, based on data provided primarily by the Governments, by comparing the quality of governance during 2013-2014 with the previous year of 2012-2013.

While assessing the quality of governance, PILDAT has looked at both the Policy Formulation and Actual Implementation of Governance Policies. Policy Formulation including legislation and institution building was assigned a 40% weightage whereas the results achieved through implementation were assigned 60% weightage.

According to the PILDAT assessment of the quality of governance in 24 parameters, the Punjab Government has shown **improvement in 8** parameters, marginal **improvement in 7** parameters, no **improvement in 5** parameters, and **declining performance in 4** parameters for the reporting year 2013-2014 as compared to 2012-2013.

The Government has shown improvement in the following governance parameters:

- i. Tax Collection
- ii. Public Procurement
- iii. Anti-Corruption Efforts
- iv. Transparency
- v. Immunization of Children
- vi. Healthcare
- vii. Education
- viii. Management of Relations with International Institutions

The Government showed marginal improvement in the following governance parameters:

- i. Environmental Sustainability
- ii. Water Resource Development and Management
- iii. Use of Technology for Better Governance
- iv. Energy Production and Management
- v. Annual Development Plan
- vi. Public Transport

June 6, 2013 – June 5, 2014

vii. Disaster Preparedness and Management

There was no improvement shown in the following parameters, i.e., the performance remained the same as last year:

- i. Management of Population Growth
- ii. Merit-Based Recruitment and Promotions
- iii. Investment Friendliness
- iv. Peace, Stability, and Order
- v. Poverty Alleviation

The Government has shown a decline in its performance in the following parameters:

- i. Safe Drinking Water Supply
- ii. Sanitation
- iii. Devolution of Power to the Lower Tiers.
- iv. Management of Unemployment.

Parameters showing Improvement

Tax Collection

In 2013–2014, the Government of the Punjab collected taxes of Rs. 111.7 billion against a budget target of Rs. 126.7 billion. In 2012–2013, it collected Rs. 78.4 billion against a fixed target of Rs. 2 billion. Although the Government missed their tax collection target by a significant margin of 12 %, there is an increase of Rs. 33 billion or 42% in tax collection in 2013-2014 as compared to 2012-2013. The collection of agricultural income tax in 2013–2014 was Rs. 830 million compared to Rs. 827.3 million in 2012-2013 indicating a marginal improvement. The collection of sales tax on services, amounted to Rs. 52 billion in 2013–2014 whereas it was Rs. 34 billion in 2012–2013; thus registering an increase of about 53%. The Punjab Sales Tax on Services (Enforcement) Rules, 2014 were passed in September 2014.

Public Procurement

The previous Public Procurement Rules were repealed and the new Punjab Procurement Rules, 2014 were enforced. The Punjab Procurement Regulatory Authority (PPRA) continues to exist under the new framework. The management information system (MIS) testing phase meeting was held in June 2013 with the aim to ensure that target departments were briefed on the system. Feedback was received and incorporated into the system. In June 2013, a PPRA MIS demonstration was arranged for testing purposes. In February 2013, the PPRA organized a capacity building workshop on the Punjab Procurement Rules, 2014 on its own premises, specifically for the school education sector. Punjab Procurement Regulatory Authority Act 2009 was amended. Some 22 capacity building workshops on PPRA laws/rules were conducted between June 2013 and June 2014. 16 firms were blacklisted in 2012–2013 and another 24 in 2013–2014 for violations in procurements. In addition, 1,454 irregularities were detected in public procurements between May 2013 and May 2014. The PPRA is providing necessary guidance to all procuring agencies and bidders in response to their queries as mandated under the PPRA Ordinance, 2002. During 2013-2014, 484 advices were issued to guide the procurement process.

Anti-Corruption Efforts

The Government of the Punjab has planned to set up an Anti-Corruption Department as a separate entity from the existing Anti-Corruption Establishment (ACE), and to introduce a new law that would replace the Prevention of Corruption Act, 1947 and the Anti-Corruption Establishment Ordinance, 1961. As per the draft of the proposed Punjab Anti-Corruption Act, 2013, there will be a separate secretary for the new department. The Director General and Secretary will be senior officers from the civil service. It was recommended that the existing ACE be overhauled. The decision was later changed to setting up a separate department through the Punjab Anti-Corruption Act, 2013. The Government of the Punjab has decided to withdraw all officials working on key assignments against whom, challans have been submitted to anti-corruption courts. The ACE head and the Chairman of the Pakistan Information Technology Board (PITB) would develop software to facilitate the authorities by updating lists of corrupt government servants. During 2013–2014, the ACE Punjab took action against 12 officers in various departments.

Transparency

The Punjab Transparency and Right to Information (RTI) Act 2013 established the Information Commission of Punjab

June 6, 2013 – June 5, 2014

as the appellate and regulatory authority to enforce the right to information. Target departments and attached organizations are required to furnish updated information on their websites, which includes information regarding the institution/organization, services, and operational budgets. Six months after the introduction of the Punjab Transparency and RTI Act, 2013, the Government had not implemented the legislation and had not reserved any funds for the purpose, either. Information Commissioners were appointed in March, but they had no funds at their disposal to set up offices and implement the Act. The Government had notified 50 public information officers for Lahore and their training had been completed. Other districts in the Province still await the appointment of information officers.

Immunization of Children

The number of polio cases decreased from 7 in 2013 to 4 in 2014, showing a 43% decrease. In 2013, the total number of reported cases of measles was 23,477 with 192 deaths, mostly children. The Government released Rs. 610 million for measles vaccinations. In 2014, only 3 cases of measles were reported in the Punjab out of 200 cases of measles nationwide. The Punjab Health Department launched an anti-polio campaign that was to run over three days in the Province in January 2014. It planned to target approximately 17 million children under the age of five. In March 2014, a second campaign commenced to give anti-measles vaccine booster doses to 40 million children up to the age of ten at a cost of Rs. 610 million. In 2013, the total immunization coverage in the Punjab was reported to be 66%. The percentage of children immunized in urban regions was 74% whereas the corresponding figure for the rural population was 62%.

Healthcare

The Government was successful in controlling the dengue epidemic in the Province. During 2013, 2,629 cases of dengue were reported in the Punjab, whereas 13 cases were reported in 2014. The Government allocated Rs. 82 billion in 2013–2014 for healthcare, whereas the previous year's figure was Rs. 84 billion indicating a 2% decrease. The Provincial Government is currently running 141 schemes at a total cost of Rs. 19,648.25 million, showing a 22% increase in the number of schemes compared to 2012–2013. However, the overall cost of these schemes has only increased by 19%. In March 2014, the Reproductive, Maternal, Neo-Natal, and Child Health Authority Act, 2014 was passed to regularize 48,000 lady health workers and 1,947 supervisory staff. The Punjab Mental Health (Amendment) Act, 2014 was passed in May 2014 to manage psychiatric facilities. Twenty-five capacity building workshops were held for senior clinicians, healthcare experts, and managers across Punjab. The Punjab Healthcare Commission's (PHC) inspection teams conducted 179 inspections of healthcare facilities in 35 districts of Punjab. A consultative workshop was held by the PHC on complaints management, licensing regulations, and charters of rights.

Education

The Literacy Department through trend projections on the basis of Pakistan Social and Living Standards Measurement (PSLM) 2013 has calculated that 62% of the Province is literate. Furthermore, the female literacy rate in Punjab was 51% in 2013-2014, which is the highest among the four Provinces in the country. According to the Annual Status of Education Report 2013 compiled by ASER, a non-governmental organisation, 15.7% of the children of school-going age in Punjab are out of school, including 8% girls and 7.7% boys. These statistics have not changed much since 2012-2013. In addition, the student dropout rate remained at 79% and similarly the female student dropout rate remained at 83% during the same time span. The student teacher ratio at the primary level in Government-run schools in 2013-2014 was 43:1, whereas, the student teacher ratio at the secondary level in Government-run schools was 23:1. The total number of public sector universities in Punjab in 2013-2014 was 18 with 184,751 students enrolled.

The Government promulgated the Punjab Free and Compulsory Education Ordinance 2014 and the Punjab Curriculum and Textbook Board Ordinance 2014. During 2013–2014, the Government also introduced the Punjab Free and Compulsory Education Bill, 2014 in the Provincial Assembly, which provides for free and compulsory education to all children aged 5–16 years.

The Government of Punjab has declared its plan for 100% enrolment of all school age children by the year 2015. The Chief Minister Punjab Enrolment Emergency Campaign 2013 was initiated which aimed to bring back to school 2 million out of school children of ages 5-16. In the School Education Sector during 2013-2014, the Punjab Government completed 15,239 schemes of missing facilities, which included boundary walls, drinking water, furniture, electricity and toilet blocks in schools in 11 districts of Southern Punjab. In addition, 50 Middle schools for girls were upgraded to high schools. 931 High schools were converted to Model schools, which enrolled over 1000 students in classes VI- X. Furthermore, 50 hazardous school buildings and 500 schools damaged by the floods were reconstructed and rehabilitated. Merit scholarships amounting to Rs. 99.900 million were disbursed amongst talented students.

June 6, 2013 – June 5, 2014

Under the Higher Education Department, the Government had set a target to establish 31 new colleges, but established only 18. Similarly, 55 colleges were to be provided with missing facilities; however, only 22 colleges were covered. Phase-I of the establishment of 20 information technology (IT) universities has been completed. Furthermore, the BA/BSc results in 2014 showed a 39% pass rate.

In the ADP, 2013–2014, under the Punjab Education Sector Reform Project, Rs. 10,400 million was disbursed to schools through school councils. This amount also included a block allocation of Rs. 3,500 million as an additional conditional grant for non-salary recurrent expenditure of schools in nine pilot districts. In 2013–2014, expenditures on education were estimated at Rs. 40,596.539 million against estimates of Rs. 31,307.272 million in 2012–2013; a 30% increase. Moreover, the budget allocated for school education in 2013–2014 was Rs. 15,500 million. In comparison, Rs. 15,000 million was allocated in 2012–2013. This illustrates that the budget increased by 3.3%. Rs. 6,670 million was allocated to the Higher Education Department in 2013–2014, whereas, Rs. 6,650 million was allocated the previous year. Therefore, it can be held that the budget for the Higher Education Department marginally increased by 0.3%. The special education department was allocated Rs. 1,140 million in the 2013–2014, comparatively; Rs. 700 million was allocated in 2012–2013. Hence, the budget for special education increased by 63%. In 2013–2014, the budget allocated for the literacy and non-formal basic education was increased by 75.4% to Rs. 1,605 million in 2013–2014, which was Rs. 915 million in 2012–2013.

Management of Relations with International Institutions

The foreign assistance for development projects in 2013–2014 in the Province was Rs. 29,700 million, in comparison to 2012–2013, when Rs. 11,487.514 million foreign aid was received which means that foreign assistance increased in 2013–2014 by Rs. 18,212.486 million or 58.5%. The Punjab Economic Opportunities Programme (PEOP), funded by the UK's Department for International Development (DFID), is an on-going programme and this year covers 6 districts of the Punjab covering same number in 2012–2013. The International Fund for Agriculture Development (IFAD) has assisted the Government through the 'Southern Punjab Poverty Alleviation Project'. The International Finance Corporation's (IFC) transactional advisor also helped the Punjab Food Department in preparing a project proposal for wheat storage. An MOU has been signed with the Asian Development Bank (ADB) and the Government of the Punjab for a public-private partnership in the energy sector. The IFC is also in collaboration with the Lahore Chamber of Commerce and is working on alternate dispute resolution.

Parameters showing Marginal Improvement

Environment Sustainability

The Punjab Environmental Motor Vehicle Rules, 2013 were drawn up by the Environment Protection Department of the Government of the Punjab. The Punjab Bio-safety Rules have been enforced, which apply to the manufacturing, importing, and storage of microorganisms and gene technology products for research. Under the Hospital Waste Management Rules, 2014, the Government of the Punjab assigned a key role to the Environmental Protection Agency to supervise and monitor the process of handling and incinerating clinical waste. The Government has constituted the Punjab Environmental Protection Council, comprising a chairperson, a vice chairperson, a secretary, and nine official members (e.g. the Secretary of the P&D and the Secretary of Finance). There were two on-going schemes, namely the legal cell for introducing management and legal discipline to improve service delivery, and the Establishment of Air Quality Monitoring System in the Punjab. Under these new schemes, missing facilities in Environment Protection Agency (EPA) field offices were provided for effective environmental monitoring and compliance. In addition, the EPA laboratory in Multan has been upgraded.

As many as four projects relating to capacity building, the creation of legal cells for introducing management and legal discipline to improve service delivery, and the development of biodiversity parks, were taken up in 2012–2013. The allocation in the ADP was Rs. 350 million in 2012–2013 and it was reduced to Rs. 164 million in 2013–2014; a decline of Rs. 186 million or 53%.

Water Resource Development and Management

The irrigation sector's total outlay for 2013–2014 in the annual development budget was Rs. 22.401 billion, which was Rs. 11.250 billion in 2012–2013. This shows an almost 100% increase in the allocation under this parameter in comparison to 2012–2013. The budget for irrigation sector constitutes about 12% of the ADP (2013–2014) under the MTDF 2013–2016. Out of the total 59 schemes included in the MTDF, 2013–2014, 19 schemes (15 on-going and 4 new

June 6, 2013 – June 5, 2014

schemes) have been targeted for completion by allocating 90% of the outlay to the on-going ones and 10% to the new ones. Other than development schemes, the overall expenditure on the irrigation sector has also increased from Rs. 8,718.297 million in 2012–2013 to Rs. 9,552.284 million in 2013–2014; a marginal increase. The Government is spending major funds on the rehabilitation and lining of existing canals and the remodelling of existing infrastructure. Other than development schemes, the overall expenditure on the irrigation sector has also increased from Rs. 8,718.297 in 2012–2013 to Rs. 9,552.284 million in 2013–2014.

Use of Technology for Better Governance

The Government has completed computerization of land records in 15 districts during 2013-2014 and in 12 districts in 2012-2013. The Strategic Planning Unit's website was launched. Approximately 150,000 applications were processed through the online college administration system across the Province for the intermediate admission cycle in over 200 colleges. The Government initiated the automation of cases at the Lahore High Court. The allocated budget for 2012–2013 was revised from Rs. 247,800,000 to Rs. 123,961,000 during the same fiscal year; a 50% decrease. By comparison, in 2013–2014, the estimated allocated budget for the Punjab Information Technology Board was Rs. 777,000,000. There was an increase of 84% in the estimated budget in the current fiscal year compared to the previous fiscal year.

Energy Production and Management

The Pakistan Board of Investment and Trade hosted a conference on Punjab energy investment opportunities on August 1, 2013 in Lahore where it was stated that the Government had made changes and improvements to the regulatory framework to encourage investment in Punjab's energy sector. Projects in the energy sector in Punjab gave an average 17% return on equity to potential investors. A project for power generation from imported coal in South Punjab has been initiated with an aim to generate 300 MW. The development of a 120 MW power plant at Taunsa Barrage is also underway. A policy was formulated for the setting up of micro-hydel power stations by communities and individuals / concerns. The Government has allocated over Rs. 20 billion for various projects in the energy sector. The construction of five hydropower projects with a total installed potential of 25 MW is on-going. Comparatively, in 2013-2014, 4 new schemes were introduced; overall various projects initiated by the Government will add approximately 500 MW to the system. The Government has introduced an adaptive solar-based solution known as 'solar home solutions' (SHS) for over 200,000 students.

Annual Development Programme

The Annual Development Programme of Punjab in 2013–2014 was Rs. 290 billion.⁰¹ The revised ADP for 2012-2013 was Rs. 166.86 billion and compared to that the ADP for 2013-2014 is about 74% larger.⁰² Rs. 88 billion was allocated for social sector investments with a major focus on education (Rs. 20.5 billion) and health (Rs. 18.3 billion). An allocation of Rs. 20.5 billion was made for energy sector investments. There was an allocation of Rs. 25 billion for women empowerment initiatives. Rs. 7.5 billion was allotted to subsidize solar tube wells for farmers. A new industrial city economic zone was to be established with an allocation of Rs. 5 billion. The Southern Punjab Poverty Alleviation Programme was initiated at a cost of Rs. 4,126 million through a loan agreement with IFAD. The objective of this project was to increase the income of 80,000 poor households by enhancing their employment potential and increasing agricultural productivity.

Public Transport

Public sector or public-private partnerships did not provide any new inter-city transport service in the Province during 2013–2014. The Government of the Punjab has initiated a customer complaint/suggestion centre (111 582 111 and 0331 444 0582) and an SMS information portal (0332 582 0582). The Government has established a route permit facilitation centre at the railway station Lahore. The total number of buses employed by the public sector or public-private partnerships for city transport in the Province during 2013–2014 was 5,883. The number of buses employed for city transport on dedicated tracks/lanes in Punjab from June 2013 to April 2014 was 64. Some 69 million passengers used the intercity transport and—42 million in 2013 used city transport provided by the public sector in five districts of Punjab. The Metro Bus Service (MBS) was completed and launched in Lahore in 2012–2013 at a cost of Rs. 30 billion. Lahore needs around 2,000 buses to meet the needs of daily commuters; there are just 300 buses currently operating in the city

1. Government of the Punjab, MTDF 2013-16, Development Programme 2013-14. Available online [<http://punjab.gov.pk/?q=system/files/ADP.pdf>] Accessed on June 1, 2015
2. White Paper Budget 2013-14, Finance Department, Government of the Punjab, Available Online [http://punjab.gov.pk/system/files/White_Paper_2013-14.pdf] Accessed on June 1, 2015

June 6, 2013 – June 5, 2014

under the umbrella of the Lahore Transport Company (LTC). The severe shortage of public transport is also a problem in other large cities of Punjab like Multan, Rawalpindi, Faisalabad, and Gujranwala. The Transport Department has taken action against substandard CNG cylinders and removed 17,441 cylinders from public sector vehicles (PSVs).

Disaster Preparedness and Management

The Government of the Punjab notified a disaster response force (DRF) under the Punjab Disaster Management Authority (PDMA), comprising Rescue 1122, civil defence, and the district disaster coordinators. This force will comprise 7,500 personnel of Rescue 1122 trained in water rescue and create community emergency response teams. The DRF will be under the operational command of Rescue 1122. The PDMA has already provided 210 boats to Rescue 1122 for rescue and evacuation efforts. In 2014, major breaches of nullahs were plugged and a protection wall was constructed for the city of Sialkot. The construction of an embankment along the Hasri drain near Kamoki has been approved and initiated. De-silting and cleansing work on 18 drains of Gujranwala division has started with an estimated cost of Rs. 198 million. In addition, the World Food Programme (WFP) established small warehouses in eight vulnerable district of Punjab with a storage capacity of 300–500 MT, each.

The Government faced two floods in 2013–2014. In 2014, an estimated 2.4 million people were affected. Some 2,000 schools were destroyed across the Punjab, 318 people died, and more than 500 people were injured. Nearly 17,000 houses were completely destroyed. Flood damages were higher in 2014 than in 2013. In 2013, 39 people were killed and an estimated 20,411 houses were damaged. In 2014, 492 flood relief camps were set up in 17 districts of the Punjab and 173,224 people were accommodated. The total number of people evacuated was 688,348 and the number of cattle evacuated was 16,150,346.

The PDMA's relief budget in 2013–2014 was Rs. 1.97 billion whereas it was Rs. 3.591 billion in 2012–2013. The reason for this high spending was that in 2012–2013, Chief Minister Relief Cards were issued to flood affected people and the total relief budget was used for that. The relief budget for 2013–2014 has been utilized mainly for the provision of relief goods and death compensations. The operational budget has been reduced from Rs. 90.578 million to Rs. 37.757 million. Less importance has been given to early warning and prevention systems. The major focus has been on contingency and relief and rescue activities

Parameters showing No Improvement

Management of Population Growth

The Government of Punjab developed the Punjab Population Policy for Development, 2014. The short-term objectives are to increase accessibility to family planning services in remote areas of Punjab, and the long-term objective is to achieve safe and quality family planning services uniformly in the Province by 2018. Meanwhile, various population welfare programmes (2010–2015) by the Population Welfare Department (PWD) are still operational. In 2012–2013, the population welfare budget of the government of Punjab was Rs. 3,000 million. In 2013–2014, the figure was reduced to Rs. 2,500 million; a 17% decrease. The population of Punjab stands over 98 million. Population annual growth rate is currently estimated at 1.87% while the population welfare programmes, 2010–2015, which aimed to reduce the rate from 2% to 1% by 2015, have not been able to achieve their objectives. The contraceptive prevalence rate (CPR) for modern methods in Punjab is 41% and for traditional methods, 12%.

Merit-Based Recruitment and Promotions

During 2013–2014, the total numbers of civil servants recruited was 1,204, whereas 368 were recruited through the Provincial Public Service Commission. The number of Government servants recruited without National Testing Service (NTS)-managed tests in 2013–2014 was 315. The position of the Chairman of the Punjab Public Service Commission (PPSC) had been vacant as of June 2014 since November 2013. The number of tenured positions held by acting officers from June 2013 to April 2014 was 11,137. The average service period for departmental secretaries as determined for 2013–2014, was a year and one month before they were transferred. This period is extremely low, as generally a term of 3 years is considered appropriate. The Punjab Civil Servants (Amendment) Bill, 2014 was passed in 2014, which includes the insertion of sections for postings and transfers in order to give effect to the 18th Amendment.

Investment Friendliness

The Government constituted a special cabinet committee to benefit from the generalized system of preferences (GSP) status granted to Pakistan by the European Union (EU). The Punjab Energy Investment Opportunities Conference was

June 6, 2013 – June 5, 2014

organized while the Government was represented in the Pak-Turk Energy and Mining Cooperation in Istanbul. Three MOUs were signed between the two countries for cooperation in various fields. The Government of the Punjab facilitated a Chinese group investment of up to US \$ 2 billion, with plans to invest US \$ 1.5 billion in two 660 MW coal-fired power plants. The Government also facilitated a JV agreement between Chinese Group and Pakistani textile mills, with an investment amounting to US \$ 205 million. An agreement has been signed between the Government and a Chinese company to execute the new project named “Orange Line Metro Train”, with the investment of US \$ 1.6 billion. The total amount of foreign direct investment (FDI) in the Province during the period June 2013–April 2014 was approximately US \$ 320 million. The amount of local investment in the Province from June 2013 to April 2014 was Rs. 677.12 million.

Peace, Stability, and Order

During 2013-2014, 274,706 criminal cases were reported in the Province compared to 283,649 criminal cases during the previous year indicating a marginal 3 % decrease. The number of convictions in Punjab increased from 63,845 in 2012-2013 to 66,378 in 2013-2014. The overall crime rate in the Province in 2013-2014 has marginally declined. The number of murders committed decreased by 2%; some 6,030 murders were committed in 2012–2013, whereas, 5,900 were reported in 2013–2014. Around 1,800 armed robberies were committed in 2012–2013, while 1,705 were committed in 2013–2014, showing an 18% decrease. The number of reported gang rape cases, however increased by 28% from 193 cases in 2012–2013 to 247 cases in 2013–2014; a 12% decrease was in kidnappings/abduction as 103 cases were reported in 2012–2013 and 91 cases were reported in 2013–2014; There was a 33% increase in the reported cases of robberies in 2013–2014 in comparison to 2012–2013. Furthermore, the percentage of motor vehicle thefts/snatchings also increased by 21% in the given time span.

The number of bomb blasts during 2013-2014 increased by 67% and suicide attacks by 50% compared to the previous year. The number of security forces killed by insurgents decreased by 35% in 2013–2014 compared to the previous year. The number of terrorists killed in encounters reduced by 27% in 2013–2014. There were 4 sectarian attacks in 2012–2013 and 19 in 2013–2014, showing almost 5 times increase.

During the reporting period there was a violent clash between the Punjab Police and activists of Pakistan Awami Tehrik in Model Town, Lahore, in which 12 persons were killed allegedly due to police firing. Five police officers were later arrested. The questions about the responsibility still linger despite a judicial enquiry.

The Government of the Punjab passed the Punjab Strategic Coordination Ordinance, 2014 with an aim to strengthen Provincial security. A security strategy was mapped out by the Punjab Police to ensure the safety of polio workers across the Province. A training workshop for the capacity building of senior-level police officers was held in collaboration with the Police School of Information and Analysis and the Turkish Police Force. Some 2,000 new recruitments in the new Counter-Terrorism Force were approved.

Poverty Alleviation

Statistics of province-wise incidence of poverty were not available from the government sources. However, according to a non-government organization, 19% of Punjab's population lives below the poverty line, which is the lowest among the four Provinces.⁰³ However, in Southern Punjab, approximately 35%–40% of households live below the poverty line.⁰⁴ The Government introduced various social protection programmes for poverty alleviation during 2013–2014. These included schemes for wheat subsidies, Ramzan packages, and public transport that amounted to Rs. 13.61 billion. The Government has an on-going programme to reduce the poverty of 80,000 households in Southern Punjab. The amount allocated for this purpose in 2013–2014 was Rs. 900 million. Under the Khidmat Programme, further development programmes were started in Southern Punjab at a total estimated cost of Rs. 15.9 billion in 2013–2014.

Parameters Showing Decline

Safe Drinking Water Supply

69% of the population in Punjab have access to safe drinking water; this includes 95% of the urban population and 52%

3. Arif Naved and Nizam Ali, 'Clustered Deprivation: District Profile of Poverty in Pakistan': Sustainable Development Policy Institute, 2012. Available online <http://www.sdpi.org/publications/files/Clustered%20Deprivation\district%20profile%20of%20poverty%20in%20pakistan.pdf> Accessed on May 20, 2015

4 Ibid.

June 6, 2013 – June 5, 2014

of the rural population. During 2013-2014, the Government of Punjab launched a Saaf Pani project. The entity was initially being handled by the Provincial Housing Department but is now registered as a company under Section 42 of the Companies Ordinance, 1984. The company is to run a project of Rs. 12 billion aimed at installing 1,479 filtration plants in 33 of the total 36 districts in Punjab where groundwater is either brackish or contaminated. The allocation for 2013–2014 was Rs. 500 million and it was to be completed during the next fiscal year. Reverse osmosis (RO) filtration plants will be installed in the brackish water zone and ultra-filtration (UF) plants in the contaminated water zone. The Government announced an amount of Rs 10.86 billion for water supply and sanitation schemes for 2013–2014 and the amount was 8.6% higher than the previous year's allocation of Rs. 10 billion. The new schemes include the rehabilitation of non-functional rural water supply schemes in brackish water and barani areas, and the provision of services in 15 districts.

Under on-going programmes, 68 water supply schemes—37 urban and 31 rural—and 89 on-going programmes are under execution at a total cost of Rs. 8,593 million. In 2013–2014, 274 safe drinking water supply schemes were implemented, which included 145 on-going schemes and 129 new schemes. Of these total 274 schemes, 132 were completed, which represents almost 48% completion. In order to achieve the target of providing safe drinking water, an allocation of Rs. 10,868 million has been made in the ADP, 2013–2014, of which Rs. 2,811.50 million was for on-going schemes and Rs. 8,056.50 million was for new programmes.

Sanitation

Half of the rural population, 50% do not have access to sanitation facilities and the Government has not been able to introduce and implement schemes to address this. Most cities and rural areas are not even connected to a sewerage system. The execution of sanitation schemes is slow and the Government has not been able to complete the projects described in the annual development budget, 2013–2014. The MDG on water and sanitation has still not been achieved and it is clear that it will not be met by 2015. Drainage facilities are inadequate and untreated water is polluting clean waterways. Even areas possessing sanitation facilities and sewage pipelines have inadequate drainage and sewage water is being dumped into rivers. However, in 2013-2014 there were 74 on-going programmes to improve sanitation in the Province—31 urban and 43 rural—are being executed at a cost of Rs. 101,84.700 million.

Devolution of Power to the Lower Tiers

The Punjab Local Government Act, 2013 was passed in August 2013. The new law did not sufficiently devolve the financial and administrative powers to the local governments. It provided for elections on a non-party basis. The Act was thereafter challenged in the Lahore High Court, and following the court order the Punjab Law Department issued a notification of an Amendment Ordinance in the Local Government Act, 2013. The court declared Section 18 of the Act 'void and ultra vires to the constitution', which related to holding elections on a non-party basis. The petitions filed against the provisions of the Punjab Local Government Act, 2013 challenging the power of the Government of the Punjab to carry out delimitation for local government elections (LGE) were, however, dismissed. The Election Commission of Pakistan (ECP) filed an appeal against the judgment of the High Court. The Supreme Court has held that Sections 8–10 of the Punjab Local Government Act, 2013 needs to be amended and the relevant rules framed under those sections, which empowered Provincial Government to undertake delimitation of local government constituencies. The Supreme Court held that since the delimitation of constituencies of Local Governments is part of the process of organizing and holding elections and is the constitutional mandate of the ECP, the power to carry out such delimitation should rest with the ECP. It further ordered the carrying out of appropriate amendments/legislation to empower the ECP to initiate and carry out the process of delimitation of constituencies for LGE. A five-month deadline from March 2014 was given to make provisions for holding LGE.

The Government of the Punjab planned to amend the Local Government Act, 2013 to allow the ECP to delimit local areas. The Federal Government was similarly directed by the Supreme Court in this regard, which may promulgate an ordinance to amend the Delimitation of Constituencies Act, 1974 to allow the ECP to delimit local areas under Supreme Court direction. As a consequence, the Government of the Punjab would do the same by amending the Local Government Act, 2013. At present, the Delimitation of Constituencies Act, 1974 allows the ECP to delimit only Provincial Assembly and National Assembly Constituencies. The Punjab Local Government Act, 2013 empowers the Provincial Government to conduct the delimitation of local areas. However, nothing was done in this regard during the reporting period.

No tangible progress was made during the period to hold LGE and to devolve powers from the Provincial Government to

June 6, 2013 – June 5, 2014

LG. In fact, the past trend indicates a reluctance to hold LGE and to devolve powers to them.

Management of Unemployment

The rate of unemployment in Punjab increased from 6.38% in 2012-2013 to 7.07% in 2013-2014. Furthermore in 2012-2013, the rate of unemployment in the rural regions was calculated to be 5.44%, whereas in urban region 8.07% of the population was unemployed. The Government of the Punjab currently has seven on-going projects to address unemployment in the Province under the Punjab Youth Development Fund. In addition, the Government has introduced schemes to provide employment opportunities in rural and urban communities. This include the launch of Punjab Youth Internship Programme in 2012–2013, where 20,000 students and new graduates in 2013–2014 went through an internship programme after which 50% of interns were recruited into the private sector and 50% into the public sector. The second phase of the project was launched to train 20,000 interns in 2013-2014. The second phase saw an increase in both internship duration and intern stipends. At the end of the internship, 80% of the interns were recruited in the private sector and 20% were recruited in the public sector However, the number of jobs created in the private sector decreased by 42% in 2013–2014 in comparison to the previous year.

June 6, 2013 – June 5, 2014

Introduction

Background and Rationale

As a basic principle and assumption, democracy must translate into improved governance in a country. In order to assess whether democratic governments have been able to deliver improved governance in Pakistan, their performance has to be assessed on certain parameters. PILDAT has undertaken this by first forming a Governance Assessment Group (GAG) comprising leading experts from all four Provinces. With the valuable input from the members of the GAG, an indigenous PILDAT Governance Assessment Framework has been developed by PILDAT, which formed the basic guideline to carry out an assessment of the quality of governance in the Federal and Provincial Governments.

Methodology

The PILDAT Governance Assessment Framework has been used to collect data from the government sources, which has been further substantiated through other reliable and official sources. Leading experts have been invited to give their expert analysis based on this data. A detailed comparative analysis has been carried out between the preceding and current financial years. A matrix has been developed based on the Governance Assessment Framework. Statistical analysis has been carried out which indicates whether performance on governance has improved, marginally improved, remained static or deteriorated in comparison to the previous year. This methodology facilitates a fact-based and impartial assessment of Government performance.

In addition to PILDAT's assessment of quality of governance based on data provided by respective Governments, PILDAT also conducted a Public Opinion Poll to ascertain public perception in key governance areas of both Federal and 4 Provincial Governments. The rationale behind the exercise is to provide both public approval ratings on governance parameters as well as governance scores assigned based on the analysis of data provided by Governments.

While assessing the quality of governance, PILDAT has looked at both the Policy Formulation and Actual Implementation of Governance Policies. Policy Formulation including legislation and institution building was assigned a 40% weightage whereas the results achieved through implementation were assigned 60% weightage.

The Score Cards and assessment is primarily based on

In addition to PILDAT's assessment of quality of governance based on data provided by respective Governments, PILDAT also conducted a Public Opinion Poll to ascertain public perception in key governance areas of both Federal and 4 Provincial Governments

Government data are shared with each Government to receive official input before publication and public dissemination. This is to ensure that stakeholders and Government take ownership of the assessment.

Both the Score Card based on the analysis of Government data as well as Public Approval Ratings on governance parameters through public opinion polls are planned to be conducted annually by PILDAT to keep a track performance on governance.

The findings emanating from the assessment are to be presented to relevant Government and its Ministries/Departments as the objective behind the exercise to assess quality of governance across Federal and Provincial Governments is to improve governance across Pakistan.

Scheme of this Score Card

PILDAT has undertaken to compile this Score Card, which assesses the performance of the Punjab Government in the financial year 2013-2014 in 24 parameters. Each parameter has sub parameters that address 3 to 8 questions in order to get specific information on that particular area of working of the Government ministry/division/body. The data is collected, organized and analysed according to these sub parameters within each parameter.

In each parameter there is a discussion on:

- How many legislative and policy interventions have the Government introduced and got passed?
- How many new institutions, bodies and/or committees have been created or restructured to design, execute and oversee the implementation?
- What key steps have been taken to implement and execute laws and policies?

June 6, 2013 – June 5, 2014

- What has been the budgetary allocation and actual spending in the parameter?
- How has the Government performed compared to the previous year? (In this case year 2013-2014 as compared to the year 2012-2013). Specific questions were devised and answered relating to each parameter to understand and assess the performance on implementation.

Use of Government Data

Not only this is the first Score Card of its kind prepared indigenously in Pakistan to assess quality of governance based on a specific framework, the strength of this assessment is that it is primarily based on official performance data provided by the Government of the Punjab. PILDAT sought official data on governance performance by providing data sheets to Government so that relevant data is organized in a systematic format. These data sets have been further substantiated through open source and other official sources.

At places, however, the analysis is based partly or solely on open source material due to unavailability of sufficient / related data from the Government especially under the parameters of Devolution of Power to the Lower Tiers, Management of Unemployment, Anti-Corruption Efforts, and Poverty Alleviation.

June 6, 2013 – June 5, 2014

Assessment of the Quality of Governance under Individual Parameters

Annual Development Programme

Legislative and Policy Interventions

None.

Analysis

The budgetary allocation for the Annual Development Programme (ADP) for 2013-2014 was Rs. 290 billion,⁵ however Rs. 250 billion was allocated in 2012-2013.⁶ In comparison, the ADP budget in 2012-2013 and 2013-2014, there is an increase of Rs. 40 billion or 16% in 2013-2014. However the revised ADP for 2012-2013 was Rs. 166.86 billion and compared to that the ADP budget for 2013-2014 is about 74% larger.

ADP for 2013-2014 comprises 32% of the total budget whereas the actual spending of the Annual Development Programmes was Rs. 199.424 billion.⁷

The total budget allocated for the Annual Development Programme of less developed regions, including Southern Punjab was Rs. 93 billion. In addition, Southern Punjab Poverty Alleviation Programme was initiated at the cost of Rs. 4,126.00 million through loan agreement with International Fund for Agricultural Development (IFAD). The objective of this project is to increase income of 80,000 poor households by enhancing employment potential and increasing agricultural productivity.

5. Government of the Punjab, MTDf 2013-16, Development Programme 2013-14. Available online [<http://punjab.gov.pk/?q=system/files/ADP.pdf>] Accessed on June 1, 2015
6. White Paper Budget 2013-14 Finance Department, Government of the Punjab. Available online [http://punjab.gov.pk/system/files/White_Paper_2013-14.pdf] Accessed on May 25, 2015
7. Government of the Punjab, MTDf 2013-16, Development Programme 2013-14. Available online [<http://punjab.gov.pk/?q=system/files/ADP.pdf>] Accessed on June 1, 2015

June 6, 2013 – June 5, 2014

Anti-Corruption Efforts

Legislative and Policy Interventions

The Government of Punjab has planned to set up an Anti-Corruption Department as a separate entity from the existing Anti-Corruption Establishment (ACE) and create a new law that would replace the Prevention of Corruption Act, 1947 and the Anti-Corruption Establishment Ordinance, 1961.

As per the draft of the purposed Punjab Anti-Corruption Act, 2013, there will be a separate Secretary for the new department. A committee comprising the Anti-Corruption Director General, the Home Secretary, and others, was constituted that recommended a complete overhaul of the existing ACE. Another committee later examined the matter and decided to set up a separate department through the Punjab Anti-Corruption Act, 2013.⁸

Key Steps Taken

In 2013-2014, 2,136 cases were registered in the ACE and the highest court convicted 38 persons.

The Government of Punjab has decided to withdraw all officials working on key assignments against whom, *challans* have been submitted to anti-corruption courts. The Deputy Secretary, Establishment of the Services and General Administration Department issued a notification on November 13, 2013 to this effect.⁹ It has been dispatched to:

- The Senior Member of the Punjab Board of Revenue;
 - The Chairman of the Planning and Development Board;
 - All commissioners in Punjab;
 - The Punjab Accountant General;
 - The Director General of the ACE;
 - The Chairman of the Punjab Information Technology Board;
 - Various DCOs;
 - All heads of autonomous bodies;
 - The Provincial Ombudsman Secretary;
 - The Secretary of the PPSC;
 - The Registrar of the Punjab Services Tribunal.
- The Deputy Secretary, Establishment stated that some

The Government of Punjab has decided to withdraw all officials working on key assignments against whom, challans have been submitted to anti-corruption courts. The Deputy Secretary, Establishment of the Services and General Administration Department issued a notification on November 13, 2013 to this effect

proposals were submitted to the Chief Minister of Punjab to streamline the policy to avoid posting government servants involved in corruption cases. It was proposed that the Director General of the ACE would furnish the respective authorities with details about FIRs lodged against government servants.

According to the notification, the departmental inquiries pending in such cases would be completed without further delay and a report in this regard would be submitted to the Chief Minister.

The Director General ACE and the Chairman PITB would develop software to facilitate the authorities by updating the lists of corrupt government servants.

The following actions were taken during 2013–2014 by the ACE Punjab:¹⁰

- On June 5, 2014, the ACE Circle Officer arrested the Farid Town Circle Patwari (revenue official) for accepting Rs. 20,000 as a bribe.
- On December 25, 2013, the ACE arrested a Water and Sanitation Agency (WASA) sub-engineer for corruption.
- On November 28, 2013, the ACE claimed to have arrested a police Assistant Sub-Inspector (ASI) on charges of corruption.
- On October 10, 2013, the ACE Circle Officer arrested a patwari for accepting Rs. 5,000 as a bribe.

8 Iqbal, Javed. 2014. "Punjab to set up new anti-corruption department". The Nation. 14 January. Available from <http://nation.com.pk/lahore/14-Jan-2014/punjab-to-set-up-new-anti-corruption-department>. Accessed March 3, 2015.

9 Ahmed, Shakeel. 2013. "Officials under ACE spotlight to be 'removed'". Dawn. 29 November. Available from <http://www.dawn.com/news/1059319>. Accessed March 3, 2015.

10 Risk Discovered. 2012. "Anti-corruption establishment". Available from <http://pakistancriminalrecords.com/tag/anti-corruption-establishment/>. Accessed March 5, 2015.

June 6, 2013 – June 5, 2014

- On September 12, 2013, the ACE arrested four officials of the Housing and Planning Department after a court denied them bail.
- On July 31, 2013, the ACE registered a case of fraud against three patwaris of the Revenue Department, nine naib tehsildars, eight gurdawars, and their seven accomplices.
- On July 8, 2013, the ACE arrested a patwari of Ratta Amral on charges of accepting a bribe, and registered a case against him. The Officer was arrested by an ACE inspector following instructions from the Director of the ACE. Rs. 100,000 was recovered from the accused's office.
- On May 30, 2013, the ACE registered 114 cases against government employees on charge of accepting bribes during the last five months. Two food inspectors were also booked.
- On May 8, 2013, the ACE caught an Additional DHQ Hospital South City Medical Superintendent red-handed while accepting a bribe. The complainant contended that the Additional DHQ had demanded Rs. 150,000, adding that he had paid a huge amount to him and was about to pay the remaining Rs .15,000.
- The Director General of the ACE, Punjab moved a summary to the Governor/Chancellor through the Chief Minister's Secretariat to obtain permission to summon the Vice Chancellor of the Punjab University, which was approved. The ACE wanted to question the Vice Chancellor about one Abdul Qadir Gilani and a bogus degree. This was originally referred to the Federal Investigation Agency (FIA) and then passed on to the ACE.¹¹

11. Pakedu.net. 2014. "Anti-Corruption Establishment (ACE) Punjab to grill Punjab University PU VC in Gilani degree case". Available from <http://pakedu.net/pakistani-education-news/anti-corruption-establishment-ace-punjab-to-grill-punjab-university-pu-vc-in-gilani-degree-case/>. Accessed March 6, 2015.

June 6, 2013 – June 5, 2014

Devolution of Power to the Lower Tiers

Legislative and Policy Interventions

The Punjab Local Government Act, 2013 was passed in August 2013. The new law did not devolve sufficient financial and administrative powers to Local Governments (LG). It provided for elections on a non-party basis. Under the Local Government Act, 2013, most of the powers were to remain in the hands of the Provincial Government, especially the removal of elected chairmen of district councils and mayors of municipal/metropolitan corporations. The Government also had the authority to change the boundaries of the union councils.

The Act was thereafter challenged in the Lahore High Court, and the Punjab Law Department issued a notification of an amendment ordinance in the Local Government Act, 2013.

The court declared Section 18 of the Act 'void and ultra vires to the constitution', which relates to the holding of elections on a non-party basis. The petitions filed against the provisions of the Punjab Local Bodies Act, 2013 challenging the power of the Government of Punjab to carry out delimitation for Local Government Election (LGE) were, however, dismissed.

The ECP filed an appeal against the High Court's judgment. The Supreme Court declared Sections 8–10 of the Punjab Local Government Act, 2013 and the relevant rules framed under those sections, ultra vires of the Constitution, empowering the Provincial Government to carry out the delimitation of the constituencies for the LG. The Supreme Court held that since the delimitation of constituencies of the LG is part of the process of organizing and holding elections and is the Constitutional mandate of the ECP, the power to carry out such delimitation should rest with the ECP. It further ordered the carrying out of appropriate amendments/legislation to empower the ECP to initiate and carry out the process of delimitation of constituencies for the LGEs. A five-month deadline (from March 2014) was given make provisions for holding LGEs.

Key Steps Taken

The Government of Punjab planned to amend the Local Government Act, 2013 to allow the ECP to delimit local areas.

The Federal Government was also directed by the Supreme Court in this regard, which may promulgate an ordinance to amend the Delimitation of

Constituencies Act, 1974 to allow the ECP to delimit local areas under Supreme Court direction. As a consequence, the Government of Punjab will also do the same by amending the Local Government Act, 2013. At present, the Delimitation of Constituencies Act, 1974 allows the ECP to delimit only Provincial Assembly and National Assembly constituencies. The Punjab Local Government Act, 2013 empowers the Provincial Government to conduct the delimitation of local areas. However, nothing substantial has been done in this regard.

June 6, 2013 – June 5, 2014

Disaster Preparedness and Management

Legislative and Policy Interventions

None.

Key Steps Taken

The Government of Punjab has notified a Disaster Relief Fund under the Provincial Disaster Management Authority (PDMA) comprising Rescue 1122, civil defence, and district disaster coordinators. This force will comprise 7,500 personnel of Rescue 1122 trained in water rescue and the creation of community emergency response teams. The Disaster Relief Force (DRF) would be under the operational command of Rescue 1122. The PDMA has already provided 210 boats to Rescue 1122 for rescue and evacuation efforts.

In routine practice before the floods of 2014, major breaches of nullahs were plugged and a protection wall was constructed for Sialkot. The construction of an embankment along Hasri drain near Kamoki has also been approved and initiated. In addition, de-silting and cleansing work has begun on 18 drains of Gujranwala division with Rs. 198 million in funds.

World Food Programme (WFP) has established a state-of-the-art warehouse at Muzaffargarh with a storage capacity of over 2,500 Metric Tons (MT). WFP also established small warehouses in eight vulnerable district of Punjab with a storage capacity of 300–500 MT, each.

Analysis

The Government of Punjab faced two floods in 2013–2014 and estimated 2.4 million people were affected. According to the National Disaster Management Authority (NDMA), 2,000 schools were destroyed across Punjab. The year 2014 saw spells of heavy rains and floods that left 318 people dead and more than 500 injured. Nearly 17,000 houses were completely destroyed. In 2013, 39 people were killed and an estimated 20,411 houses were damaged.

The PDMA is the focal department for managing floods. It has set up relief camps and provided relief and rescue services to flood-affected people in 17 districts. The PDMA's relief budget in 2013–2014 was Rs. 1.97 billion, whereas in 2012–2013, it was Rs. 3.591 billion. The reason for this was mainly that in 2012–2013, Chief Minister Relief Cards were issued to flood-affected people and the total relief budget was used for that. The relief budget for 2013–2014 has been utilized mainly for the provision of relief goods and death

According to the National Disaster Management Authority (NDMA), 2,000 schools were destroyed across Punjab. The year 2014 saw spells of heavy rains and floods that left 318 people dead and more than 500 injured. Nearly 17,000 houses were completely destroyed

compensations.

Other PDMA budget heads include the pays and salary budget, which increased marginally from Rs. 29.191 million in 2012–2013 to Rs. 30.946 million in 2013–2014. The operational budget has been reduced from Rs. 90.578 million to Rs. 37.757 million. The total budget was Rs. 1.249 billion for 2013–2014.

The PDMA set up relief camps for affected populations during the floods in both 2013 and 2014. The number of people in the camps was significantly higher in 2014. Some 492 camps were set up in Punjab in 2014 and 173,224 people were accommodated. The total number of people evacuated was 688,348 and the number of cattle evacuated was 16,150,346.

June 6, 2013 – June 5, 2014

Education

Legislative and Policy Interventions

The Government of Punjab promulgated 2 new Ordinances during 2013–2014. The Punjab Free and Compulsory Education Ordinance 2014 provided for free and compulsory education to all children aged 5–16. This was to operationalize Article 25-A of the Constitution, which enjoins that the state shall provide free and compulsory education to all children aged 5–16. The Punjab Free and Compulsory Education Bill 2014 was also introduced in the Punjab Assembly.

The Punjab Curriculum and Textbook Board Ordinance, 2014 was introduced in the Provincial Assembly, which provides for the establishment of the Punjab Curriculum and Textbook Board.

The 18th Constitutional Amendment made two significant changes in the education governance framework of Pakistan. First, the curriculum has become a provincial responsibility and free and compulsory education for children aged 5–16 has been added to the list of fundamental rights. Prior to the 18th Amendment, curriculum and national policy were in the Concurrent List of the Constitution whereby both the Provincial and Federal Governments had jurisdiction to legislate on the subject. Under the law, the Federal Government was given the authority to prepare national curriculums. With the abolishment of the Concurrent List, the provincial law on the subject now prevails. In this context, the Ordinance for setting up the Punjab Curriculum and Textbook Board has been issued by the Government of the Punjab.

The second, even more critical, change made by the 18th Amendment was to make free and compulsory education for children aged 5–16 a fundamental right. The Punjab Free and Compulsory Education Bill is a step in that direction.

Key Steps Taken

The Government of the Punjab has declared 100% enrolment for all school-age children by 2015. The Chief Minister Punjab Enrolment Emergency Campaign 2013 was initiated which aimed to bring back to school 2 million out of school children of ages

5-16.

According to the White Paper Budget 2014–2015,¹², issued by the Finance Department, Government of the Punjab, the achievements of 2013–2014 are as follows:

- Provision of computer labs in 500 elementary schools.
- Provision of computer labs in 600 high schools.
- Provision of missing facilities in 15,742 schools.
- Reconstruction of 300 dangerous school buildings.
- Provision of furniture in 500 high schools.
- Establishment of two new primary schools.
- Up-gradation of 30 schools (elementary to high level).

Analysis

The Literacy Department through trend projections on the basis of Pakistan Social and Living Standards Measurement (PSLM) 2013 has calculated that 62% of the Province is literate. Furthermore, the female literacy rate in Punjab was 51% in 2013-2014,¹³ which is the highest among the four Provinces in the country. According to the Annual Status of Education Report 2013, compiled by ASER, a non-government organisation, 15.7% of the children of school-going age in Punjab are out of school, 8% of which are girls. These statistics have not changed much since 2012-2013. In addition the students dropout rate remained at 79% with female student dropout rate at 83% during the same time span. The student teacher ratio at the primary level in Government-run schools in 2013-2014 was 43:1, whereas, the student teacher ratio at the secondary level in Government-run schools was 23:1. The total number of public sector universities in Punjab in 2013-2014 was 18 with 184, 751 students enrolled.

In the Annual Development Plan (ADP) 2013-2014 the education budget was Rs. 40,596.539, whereas in 2012-2013 the education budget was Rs. 31,307.272. This shows a 30% increase in the allocation for the education sector in 2013-2014. Around 80% of the total education budget is spent on salaries and non-salary recurring expenditure. The development budget is a small portion in comparison with the total budget.¹⁴

Under the Punjab Education Sector Reform Project, a

12. White Paper Budget 2014-2015, Finance Department, Government of the Punjab. Available online [<http://www.finance.punjab.gov.pk/system/files/WP2014-15.pdf>] Accessed on May 31, 2015

13. White Paper Budget 2013-14 Finance Department, Government of the Punjab. Available online [http://punjab.gov.pk/system/files/White_Paper_2013-14.pdf] Accessed on May 25, 2015

14. Budget Transparency a Case Study of Punjab Development Budget 2013 Available online [http://www.cpdipakistan.org/?publication=budget-transparency-a-case-study-of-punjab-development-budget-2013-2014&wppa_open=1] Accessed April 26, 2015

June 6, 2013 – June 5, 2014

provision of Rs. 104, 00 million has been made for disbursement of non-salary budgets to schools, stipend to girls, free text-books and management of public sector schools through school councils.¹⁵ This amount also includes a block allocation of Rs. 350, 0 million as additional conditional grant for non-salary recurring expenditure of schools in 9 pilot districts.

Moreover, in line with Chief Minister's Education Sector Road Map, substantial resource allocation has also been made in the development budget for 2013-2014 as below the line items of ADP for following initiatives in the sector:¹⁶

- Daanish School increased to Rs. 3,000 million from Rs. 2,000 million in 2012-2013
- Punjab Education Foundation Rs. 7,500 million increased from Rs. 6,500 million in 2012-2013.
- Punjab Education Endowment Fund Rs. 2,000 million
- Punjab Technology University Rs. 500 million
- Internship Programme Rs. 1,500 million
- As for the development budget, there has been a marginal increase of allocation of funds from Rs. 15,000 million in 2012-2013 to Rs. 15,500 million in 2013-2014.
- There were 57 schemes in education sector, in which seven were on-going and 50 new schemes with the allocation of Rs. 15,500 million. This includes provision of missing facilities in 2,500 primary schools.

In February 2014 PEC conducted exams of class 5 and 9. 1,378,800 students appeared in the exam for class 5 out of which 756, 336 children passed making pass rate at 56% and in class 8th 1,085,777 children appeared out of which 815, 860 passed making the pass percentage at 77%.

In the School Education Sector during 2013-2014 the Punjab Government completed 15,239 schemes of missing facilities, which included boundary walls, drinking water, furniture, electricity and toilet blocks in schools in 11 districts of Southern Punjab. In addition, 50 Middle schools for girls were upgraded to high schools. 931 High schools were converted to Model schools, which enrolled over 1000 students in classes VI- X. Furthermore, 50 hazardous school buildings and 500 schools damaged by the floods were reconstructed and rehabilitated. Merit scholarships amounting to Rs.

99.900 million were disbursed amongst talented students.

Punjab Higher Education Department includes, Directorate of Public Instruction Colleges, 09 Divisional Directorates, and 37 District Directorates managing 690 colleges in Punjab. Nine Boards of Intermediate and Secondary Education (BISE) for examination purposes are also working, in addition to 40 public/private sector universities and 26 autonomous bodies. According to the HED official website the total strength of staff including teaching staff in the 690 colleges was 33,177. The total number of students is 443, 285. During 2013-2014, the Provincial Government started the project to establish the Punjab Technology University, Lahore. In addition, 100,000 laptops were distributed to students.

In the Special Education sector, the Provincial Government constructed Special Education Centres in 5 districts. Furthermore, solar energy solutions were provided to Special Education offices of District Education Officers and generators were provided to institutions of Special Education in Punjab. In 2013-2014 the Govt. Degree College of Special Education in Bahawalpur was also constructed and capacity building trainings were provided to the Directorate of Special Education, Lahore.

Rs. 66 million were allocated to the Higher Education Department for the fiscal year 2013-2014 for 197 on-going schemes including 68 schemes of provision of missing facilities, up-gradation of 4 colleges and establishment of 7 universities. The budget also mentioned 12 new schemes but the allocation of the development budget was for all practical purposes a block allocation as no details have been given.¹⁷ In 2013-2014 expenditure on Education was estimated at Rs. 40, 596.539 million against estimates of Rs. 31,307.272 million in 2012-2013 showing increase of 30%. It is important to understand that this budget does not reflect the overall education budget of the Province. The Government set the target to establish 31 new colleges but established only 18 colleges. 55 colleges were to be provided with the provisions of missing facilities however only 22 colleges were provided with missing facilities. There was a plan to complete 07 projects of Commerce Colleges but only 01 project was completed. Phase-I of establishing Punjab Technology University, Lahore, has been completed.

15. Government of the Punjab, MTDf 2013-16, Development Programme Available online [<http://punjab.gov.pk/?q=system/files/ADP.pdf>] Accessed on May 26, 2015

16. Id

17. Government of The Punjab, MTDf 2013-2016 Development Programme 2013-2014 [http://www.finance.punjab.gov.pk/system/files/ADP2013_14.pdf] accessed April 26, 2015

June 6, 2013 – June 5, 2014

The plan is underway to establish 3 women universities at Sialkot, Multan and Bahawalpur. Establishment of University of Gujrat, Phase I and II has been completed whereas establishment of a sub campus of Punjab University has been established at Jhelum. In 2013-2014 funds were allocated to establish sub campus of Lahore College for Women University Lahore at Kala Shah Kaku and Bahadur Sub Campus of BZU at Layyah, both are in progress.¹⁸

In March 2014 the results of class 9th of all the boards of intermediate and secondary education were announced and according to Controller Examination Punjab 240,088 candidates appeared out of which 87,334 passed making pass percentage at 36%. In science group 76,397 boys appeared and 25,278 passed making the pass percentage at 33%, 53,1538 girl students appeared and 26,278 making pass percentage at 49%. The BA/BSc results in 2014 showed 39% pass percentage.

18. Government of the Punjab, MTDF 2013-16, Development Programme Available online [<http://punjab.gov.pk/?q=system/files/ADP.pdf>] Accessed on May 26, 2015

June 6, 2013 – June 5, 2014

Energy Production and Management

Legislative and Policy Interventions

None.

Key Steps Taken

Under the Ujala programme, the Government has been providing SHSs to students in different institutions of **the Government of the Punjab**, like secondary and higher secondary schools and colleges, vocational institutes like TEVTA and PVTC and *Daanish* Schools. The SHS system has a 30 WP capacity and can provide power for at least three 12 V DC LED light fixtures of 3 watts each, for five hours a day. In 2012–2013, some 200,000 SHS systems were procured from ZTE Pakistan. In 2013–2014, an additional 78,000 SHS systems has been procured to be distributed among deserving students.¹⁹

The PBIT hosted a conference on Punjab energy investment opportunities on August 1, 2013 in Lahore, where it was stated that **the Government** had made changes and improvements to the regulatory framework to encourage investment in Punjab's energy sector. Projects in the energy sector in Punjab gave an estimated average of 17% return on equity to potential investors.²⁰

Power generation project from imported coal in South Punjab has been initiated with an aim to generate 300 MW (Table 2).

An agreement has been signed with China Water and Electric (CWE) Corporation for the development of a 120 MW power plant at Taunsa Barrage. The project feasibility will be updated by CWE under the joint

Table 2: Timeline for Power Generation from Coal Project in South Punjab

Activity	Timeline
Project information digest	Aug 2013
Selection of consultants	Dec 2013
Project feasibility and engineering design	Sep 2014

19. Ibid.

20. Ibid.

21. The Express Tribune. 2013. "Hydropower: Punjab govt. begins work on five projects. 4 July. Available from <http://tribune.com.pk/story/572112/hydropower-punjab-govt-begins-work-on-five-projects/>. Accessed 16 February, 2015.

ownership of Punjab and CWE. The Government of Punjab will invest mutually agreed equity in the project (Table 3).

A policy was created for the setting up of micro-hydel power-stations by communities and individuals/concerns.

On-going projects in Punjab include five hydel power projects, namely a 7.6 megawatt (MW) project in Marala in Sialkot, a 5.38 MW project in Chian Wali in Gujranwala, a 4.04 MW Deg Outfall in Sheikupura, a 2.82 MW project in Pakpattan, and a 4.16 MW project in Okara.²¹ Furthermore, a feasibility study was completed to set up 2.5 MW solar PV powerplant at Islamia University Bahawalpur to produce uninterrupted power supply and research base for university students. In addition, a feasibility study was completed for two coal power projects 2x55 MQ each for Industrial areas in Lahore and Faisalabad. In order to promote research in renewable energy, a Centre of

Table 3: Timeline for Power Generation Project at Taunsa Barrage

Activity	Timeline
Updating of feasibility	June 2013
Negotiation/establishment of SPV	September 2013
Start of construction	March 2014

Table 4: Timeline for the setting up of five micro-hydel power stations

Activity	Timeline
Policy formulation/notification	August 2013
Project information digest	October 2013
Engagement of consultancy services	November 2013
Survey and project feasibility	December 2013
PC-1 approval	January 2014
Agreement with	February 2014
Design/costing/procurement	June 2014

June 6, 2013 – June 5, 2014

Excellence for Research in such Technologies (CERAD) has been set up at University of Engineering and Technology, Lahore.

Under the coal based power initiatives the Punjab Government has taken the initiative to engage the private sector in power generation. It is planned that 6 x 1320 MW power plants will be set up at 6 different sites in the Province in the next four years. In addition, during 2013-2014 two of the four hydropower stations designed to produce 20 MWs electricity under the REDSIP programme in 4 districts of Punjab are near completion. The public sector company, Punjab Quaid-e-Azam Solar Power Company has initiated 100 MW Solar Power Plant. The plant is scheduled to start power generation by December 2014

Analysis

The Government of Punjab has allocated over Rs. 20.5 billion for various projects in the energy sector.²² In the previous annual development programme, 2012–2013, the implementation of the annual development budget assisted low-head hydel power plants under the Province's Renewable Energy Development Sector Investment Programme. This entails the construction of five hydropower projects in various locations across Punjab.

Furthermore, appraisals have been initiated for the development of five additional hydropower sites at suitable locations within the Province's irrigation network, including barrages and canals. During the ADP, 2012–2013, the Government of Punjab introduced an adaptive SHS system under the Chief Minister's Ujala Programme. The SHS programme aims to cover the needs of over 200,000 students on merit-based identification of its clientele in the Province. The ADP 2013–2014 included the installation of a 2.5 MW solar-photovoltaic power plant at Islamia University, Bahawalpur. The 2013–2014 ADP aimed at physical execution of projects in 2012–2013. The Government is also envisaging the creation of an 'Energy Development Fund' to cater for sustainable development in various energy sub-sectors including hydel, solar, biogas, biomass, and wind.

22. Syed, Nadeem. 2013. "Punjab presents Rs. 897 billion budget for FY 2013–14". Pakistan Today. 17 June. Available from <http://www.pakistantoday.com.pk/2013/06/17/national/punjab-presents-rs-897-billion-budget-for-fy-2013-14/>. Accessed 16 February, 2015.

June 6, 2013 – June 5, 2014

Environment Sustainability

Legislative and Policy interventions

The Punjab Environmental Motor Vehicle Rules, 2013 were made by the Government of Punjab's Environment Protection Department, which states that a person shall not operate a motor vehicle from which air pollutants and noise are being emitted in an amount, concentration, or level that is in excess of environmental quality standards. Under these rules, authorized officers may inspect, examine, or check any motor vehicles at any time in their areas of jurisdiction.²³

The Punjab Bio-Safety Rules 2014 have been enforced, which apply to the manufacturing, importing, and storage of microorganisms and gene technology products for research, whether conducted in teaching and research laboratories, research and development institutes, or private companies involved in the use and application of generally modified organisms. In addition, a Bio-safety Committee has been formed in the given time-span.

The Government of Punjab assigned the EPA a supervisory and monitoring role under the Hospital Waste Management Rules, 2014. It involves the process of handing and incinerating clinical waste.

Key Steps Taken

There are two on-going schemes, namely the creation of a legal cell for introducing management and legal discipline to improve service delivery, and the establishment of air quality monitoring systems in Punjab. Under these new schemes, missing facilities in EPA field offices were provided for effective environmental monitoring and compliance. In addition, the EPA laboratory in Multan has been upgraded.

Following projects were undertaken in 2012–2013:

- Regulatory control on environmental degradation through EPA capacity building.
- Capacity building of provincial departments in environmental management through trainings in initial environmental examinations (IEE), environmental impact assessment (EIA), environmental assessment (EA), and lifecycle analysis (LCA).

23. Government of Punjab. 2013. "Notification". Lahore: Environment Protection Department. Available from http://epd.punjab.gov.pk/system/files/motor%20vehicle%20rules_0.pdf.

24. Government of Punjab. Undated. "Notification". Lahore: Environment Protection Department. Available at <http://epd.punjab.gov.pk/system/files/Notification%20of%20PEPC.pdf>.

In 2013, 831 violations of environmental laws were reported by the Government. In comparison 273 violations were reported from January-March 2014. Furthermore, in 2013, fines worth Rs. 10.535 million were imposed for infringing environmental laws

- The creation of a legal cell for introducing management and legal discipline to improve service delivery.
- The development of biodiversity parks in collaboration with city district governments, district governments, and business communities.

The Environment Protection Department issued a notification on 3 September, 2013²⁴ stating that pursuant to Section 3(1) of the Punjab Environmental Protection Act, 1997 (amended 2012), the Government of Punjab has constituted the Punjab Environmental Protection Council comprising a chairperson, vice chairperson, secretary, and nine official members (e.g. the Secretary of the P&D, the Secretary of Finance, etc.).

Analysis

In 2013, 831 violations of environmental laws were reported by the Government. In comparison 273 violations were reported from January-March 2014. Furthermore, in 2013, fines worth Rs. 10.535 million were imposed for infringing environmental laws. However, in January- March 2014, fines worth Rs. 2.27 million were imposed. The Environmental tribunal decided 914 cases during 2013, whereas, 163 cases were decided from January to March 2014. In addition, the total amount allocated in the Provincial budget for Environmental protection and stability in the ADP was Rs. 164 million in 2013-2014.

June 6, 2013 – June 5, 2014

Healthcare

Legislative and Policy Interventions

The Punjab Assembly passed the Reproductive, Maternal, Neo-Natal, and Child Health Authority Act, 2014 on March 27, 2014. The reproductive, maternal, neo-natal, and child health authority will be established under this legal framework to regularize 48,000 lady health workers and 1,947 supervisory staff.²⁵

The Provincial Assembly passed the Punjab Mental Health (Amendment) Act 2014 on May 29, 2014 to institute and manage psychiatric facilities for the treatment and rehabilitation of mentally disordered patients.²⁶

Key Steps Taken²⁷

The Provincial Government held 25 capacity building workshops in Hafizabad for senior clinicians, healthcare experts, and managers across Punjab. This training was conducted under the Minimum Service Delivery Standards for Hospitals initiative for tertiary care hospitals.

The PHC's inspection teams conducted 179 inspections of healthcare facilities in 35 districts of Punjab.

A consultative workshop was held on May 15, 2014 by the PHC to solicit the opinion of key stakeholders on complaints management and licensing regulations and charters of rights for patients and healthcare institutions.

The PHC and the Pakistan Academy of Family Physicians organized a seminar on dengue treatment for family physicians on November 11, 2013.

The PHC took notice of the dengue epidemic in Punjab

and visited 15 hospitals to examine healthcare facilities and treatment. Furthermore the Provincial Government published treatment guidelines on dengue for public and private hospitals.

Analysis

The number of reported dengue cases decreased significantly in the Province in 2013 in comparison to the previous year. During 2013, 2,629 cases were reported in Punjab whereas 13 cases were reported in 2014 (till October 2014).

There were 182,446 persons suffering from Tuberculosis in this time span. In addition, 20,000 patients of Hepatitis C and 25,000 patients of Hepatitis B received treatment in 2013-2014. Furthermore, 75,000 kidney patients were provided with dialysis treatment. During 2013-2014, the total number of doctors employed in the Public sector in Punjab was 2,937. This included 1,963 Medical Officers, 793 Women Medical Officers and 181 Associate Professors and Registrars. The total number of patients treated by the public sector hospitals and clinics in 2013-2014 was 94,506,017.

In 2013-2014, the number of Basic Health Units in the Province was 2,471 and there were 305 Rural Health centres. In addition, there were 32 Teaching Hospitals, 27 District Headquarter Hospitals and 93 Tehsil Headquarters Hospitals. Furthermore, the total number of Hospital beds in Government run institutions was 43,565.

In 2013–2014, the Government of Punjab had 112 on-going schemes that cost Rs. 11,340.55 million to grant access to adequate healthcare in the Province. However, 2012–2013 saw 107 on-going schemes that cost Rs. 11,488 million. These figures illustrate that

Table 5: Number of Reported Dengue cases in Punjab

Year	Patients diagnosed	Per Cent Change
2013	2,629	-100%
2014 (till October)	13	

Source: The Express Tribune. 2014. "Better safe: Anti-dengue measures to be stepped up in September". 3 September. Available from <http://tribune.com.pk/story/757144/better-safe-anti-dengue-measures-to-be-stepped-up-in-september/>. Accessed February 18, 2015.

- Punjab Laws Online. Undated. "The Punjab Reproductive, Maternal, Neo-Natal, and Child Health Authority Act, 2014 (Act VIII of 2014)". Available from <http://punjablaws.gov.pk/laws/2562.html>. Accessed 16 February, 2015.
- Punjab Laws Online. Undated. "The Punjab Mental Health (Amendment) Act 2014 (Xi of 2014)". Available from [http://punjablaws.punjab.gov.pk/public/dr/THE%20PUNJAB%20MENTAL%20HEALTH%20\(AMENDMENT\)%20ACT%202014.doc.pdf](http://punjablaws.punjab.gov.pk/public/dr/THE%20PUNJAB%20MENTAL%20HEALTH%20(AMENDMENT)%20ACT%202014.doc.pdf). Accessed 16 February, 2015.
- Government of Punjab. 2013. "News and events". Lahore: Punjab Healthcare Commission. Available from <http://www.phc.org.pk/news.aspx>. Accessed 16 February, 2015.

June 6, 2013 – June 5, 2014

even though the number of schemes had increased in 2013–2014, the Government's expenditure decreased by Rs. 147.45 million.

The Government of Punjab introduced 29 new schemes that cost Rs. 8,307.698 million in 2013–2014, whereas 10 new schemes that cost Rs. 5,012 million were

launched in 2012–2013.

The Government of Punjab allocated Rs. 82 billion in 2013–2014 for healthcare, compared to Rs. 84 billion the previous year; the healthcare budget decreased by 2 % (Table 8).

Table 6: Health and Family Planning: On-going Schemes (Rs. in millions)

Fiscal year	On-going schemes	Cost
2012–2013	107	11,488.000
2013–2014	112	11,340.554

Source: Government of Punjab. 2013. "Finance Department". Lahore: Finance Department. Available at [www.finance.punjab.gov.pk.] Accessed on February 16, 2015

Table 7: Health and Family Planning: New schemes (Rs. in millions)

Fiscal year	New schemes	Cost
2012–2013	10	5,012.000
2013–2014	29	8,307.698

Source: Government of Punjab. 2013. "Finance Department". Lahore: Finance Department. Available at [www.finance.punjab.gov.pk.] Accessed on February 16, 2015.

Table 8: Budgetary Allocation for Healthcare (Rs. in millions)

Fiscal year	2012-2013	2013-2014
Total budget allocated	84	82

Source: Government of Punjab. 2013. "Finance Department". Lahore: Finance Department. Available at [www.finance.punjab.gov.pk.] Accessed on February 16, 2015

June 6, 2013 – June 5, 2014

Immunization of Children

Legislative and Policy Interventions

None.

Key Steps Taken

The **Punjab Health Department** launched an anti-polio campaign that was to run over three days in the Province in January 2014. Some 17 million children under the age of five were being targeted for vaccination.²⁸

A second campaign commenced in March 2014 that aimed to administer anti-measles vaccine booster doses to 40 million children up to the age of ten. The cost associated with this was Rs. 610 million.²⁹

Analysis

In 2013, the total immunization coverage in Punjab was reported to be 65.6%. The percentage of children

immunized from urban regions and rural areas was 74% and 61%, respectively.³⁰

Table 9 shows that the number of polio cases decreased from seven in 2013 to 4 in 2014; which shows 43% reduction.^{31,32} In addition, Environmental samples from sewers are regularly collected from Multan, Faisalabad, Lahore and Rawalpindi. These samples were found positive for wild poliovirus once in Multan, thrice in Lahore and thrice in Rawalpindi.

In 2013, some 23,477 people were reported to be suffering from the measles. The outbreak resulted in 192 deaths, mostly children. The Government then released Rs. 610 million to eliminate the measles epidemic from the Province. Consequently in 2014, just three cases were reported in Punjab out of 200 cases nationwide.

Table 9: the number of reported polio cases in Punjab

Year	2013	2014	Per Cent Change
Total number of reported cases	7	4	-43%

Table 10: Number of Reported Cases and Deaths from Measles

Year	2013	2014
Total number of reported cases	23,477	3
Total number of deaths	192	NA

28. The News. 2014. "Three-day anti-polio campaign in Punjab starts today". January 20. Available from <http://www.thenews.com.pk/Todays-News-2-227438-Three-day-anti-polio-campaign-in-Punjab-starts-today>. Accessed 19 February, 2015.
29. The Express Tribune. 2014. "Public health: Rs. 610 million released for measles campaign in Punjab". 8 March. Available from <http://tribune.com.pk/story/680130/public-health-rs610-million-released-for-measles-campaign-in-punjab/>. Accessed 20 February, 2015.
30. Pakistan CSOs Coalition for Health and Immunization. 2014. "Status of immunization coverage and maternal child healthcare in Punjab province, Pakistan". Islamabad: Pakistan CSOs Coalition for Health and Immunization. Available from <http://www.chip-pk.org/wp-content/uploads/2015/02/Status-of-Immunization-Coverage-Maternal-Child-Health-Care-Punjab-2014.pdf>.
31. Wasif, Sehrish. 2014. "First ever polio case in Punjab reported". The Express Tribune. 8 August. Available from <http://tribune.com.pk/story/745849/first-ever-polio-case-in-punjab-reported/>. Accessed 20 February, 2015.
32. Chaudhry, Asif. 2014. "Polio cases on rise in Pakistan". Dawn. 14 January. Available from <http://www.dawn.com/news/1080350/polio-cases-on-rise-in-pakistan>. Accessed 20 February, 2015.

June 6, 2013 – June 5, 2014

Investment Friendliness

Legislative and Policy Interventions

None

Key Steps Taken

In January 2014, Pakistan was awarded GSP status by the EU, and in this context, the Chief Minister of Punjab constituted a special cabinet committee.³³

The Punjab Board of Investment and Trade (PBIT) and the Government of Punjab took the following initiatives to promote investment in 2013–2014:

- The Government of Punjab organized the Punjab Energy Investment Opportunities Conference (August 2013) and attended the Pak-Turk Energy and Mining Cooperation in Istanbul (September 2013). The PBIT also represented Pakistan at the Kazan Summit held in October 2013, which was designed to address the importance of investment promoting agencies (IPAs) in the world.³⁴
- A delegation was sent to attend the Tuscon Expo in Istanbul in November 2013 and arranged B2B meetings. This resulted in a JV agreement between Green Spring and Fruits, a Pakistani company, and Al-Kharusi Trading, a firm in Oman. According to the agreement, Green Spring Fruits will supply its products to the Omani firm. A MOU between the PBIT and Shandong Ruyi Science and Technology Group, a Chinese company was also signed. The investment is in various sectors, including agriculture, power, and textiles, based in special economic zones (SEZs).³⁵ The Government of the Punjab facilitated the RUYI group for the establishment of SEZs related to textiles with an aggregate investment of up to Rs. 2 billion. RUYI is also planning to invest US \$ 1.5 billion in two 660 MW coal-fired power plants.³⁶ The Government facilitated a JV agreement between the RUYI Group, China and Masood Textile Mills Ltd. The investment amounted to US \$ 205 million.

The Chief Minister of Punjab and the chairman of a Chinese company, NDRC, signed the agreement during a ceremony held in Shanghai in May 2014. The new project has been named the 'Orange Line Metro Train', which will be completed with an investment of US \$ 1.6 billion. The train track will be 27.1 km long.³⁷

Analysis

The total amount of FDI in the Province during the period June 2013–April 2014 was approximately US \$ 320 million. The amount of local investment in the Province from June 2013 to April 2014 was Rs. 677.12 million.

33. Government of Punjab. 2013. "News". Lahore: Punjab Board of Investment and Trade. Available from <http://www.pbit.gop.pk/eng/GSP%20News>. Accessed 19 February, 2015.

34. Government of Punjab. 2013. "Kazan Summit 2013". Lahore: Punjab Board of Investment and Trade. Available from <http://www.pbit.gop.pk/eng/pbit-representation-at-kazan>. Accessed 19 February, 2015.

35. Government of Punjab. 2013. "Memorandum of understanding between the Punjab Board of Investment and Trade and Shandong Ruyi Science and Technology Group Co. Limited". Lahore: Punjab Board of investment and Trade. Available from <http://www.pbit.gop.pk/eng/mou-pbit-jv-investors>. Accessed 19 February, 2015..

36. Data provided by the government of Punjab.

37. Government of Punjab. 2013. "CM Punjab and Chinese company sign an agreement for 'Orange Line Metro Train'". Lahore: Punjab Board of Investment and Trade. Available from http://www.pbit.gop.pk/eng/metro_train. Accessed 19 February, 2015.

June 6, 2013 – June 5, 2014

Management of Population Growth

Legislative and Policy Interventions

The Government of the Punjab developed the Punjab Population Policy for Development, 2014 to improve both access and quality of reproductive health services, raise awareness, promote family planning, and promote the use of modern contraceptive methods, particularly by encouraging male participation. The short-term objectives are to increase accessibility to family planning services in remote areas of Punjab. The long-term objective is to achieve safe and quality family planning services uniformly in the Province by 2018.³⁸

Key Steps Taken

Meanwhile, the population welfare programmes, 2010–2015 by the Population Welfare Department (PWD) are still operational.³⁹ The primary strategies of the Punjab PWD are maternal and child healthcare, and family planning and contraception prevalence in the Province. The key objectives of these programmes are to:

- Increase the contraceptive prevalence rate (CPR) from 36% in 2008–2009 to 44% by 2014–2015.
- Reduce population growth rate from 1.66% in 2008–2009 to 1.34% by 2014–2015.
- Reduce unmet need for family planning from 33% to 20% by 2014–2015.

Analysis

In 2012–2013, the population welfare budget was Rs. 3,000 million. In 2013–2014, the figure was reduced to Rs. 2,500 million; a 17% reduction.⁴⁰

Punjab accounts for 56% of Pakistan's population. The

Population of Punjab is reported to be over 98 million. Population growth in 1998 was at three per cent. While the population growth rate in the country has decreased, the rate contradicts the objectives of the population welfare programmes, 2010–2015, which aimed to reduce the rate from 1.66% to 1.34% by 2015.

Punjab's population density stood at 358.52 persons per square km in 1998. The figure was revised to 460 persons per square km in 2013.

In 1998, the TFR in the Province was 4.3%. The figure was 3.8% in 2013, according to a National Institute of Population Studies (NIPS) report.⁴¹

Reverting to the population welfare programmes, 2010–2015, it is evident that contraceptive performance has indeed improved from 2008, which was at 36%. It remains to be seen at the conclusion of the five-year plan in 2015 whether the PWD has been able to reach its target of 44.18%.⁴² Table 11 shows the distribution of CPR in the entire country in 2013.⁴³ The CPR of modern methods in Punjab is 41% and of traditional methods is 12%.

Table 11: Percentage of Modern Contraceptive Methods in Punjab

	Modern methods (%)	Traditional method (%)
Punjab	40.7	11.7

38. Gilani, Iqtidar. 2014. "Punjab wakes up to population policy". The Nation. 26 February. Available from <http://nation.com.pk/laure/26-Feb-2014/punjab-wakes-up-to-population-policy>. Accessed 19 February, 2015.

39. Government of Punjab. 2010. "Projects: Population welfare programmes (2010–15)". Lahore: Population Welfare Department. Available from <http://www.easy-sol.com/profile/population/pages/projects3.html>. Accessed 19 February, 2015.

40. Government of Punjab. 2013. "White paper - budget 2012–13". Lahore: Finance Department. Available from http://punjab.gov.pk/system/files/White_Paper_2013-14.pdf.

41. National Institute of Population Studies. 2013. "Pakistan demographic and health survey 2012–13". Islamabad: National Institute of Population Studies and Calverton, MA: Measure DHS/ICF International. Available from http://www.nips.org.pk/abstract_files/PDHS%20Final%20Report%20as%20of%20Jan%2022-2014.pdf.

42. Ibid.
43. Ibid.

June 6, 2013 – June 5, 2014

Management of Relations with International Institutions

Legislative and Policy Interventions

None

Key Steps Taken

- Punjab Economic Opportunities Programme (PEOP) funded by United Kingdom's Department for International Development (DFID) has commenced in the districts of Punjab during the time span 2013.
- International Fund for Agriculture Development (IFAD) has assisted the Government of Punjab in making efforts to ameliorate poverty through “Southern Punjab Poverty Alleviation Project”
- International Finance Corporation's transactional advisor also helped the Punjab Food Department in preparing a project proposal that help to address inadequacies in the wheat storage
- Memorandum of Understanding has been signed with the Asian Development Bank and the Government of Punjab to look into the energy sector and suggest bankable Public Private Partnership.

Analysis

Punjab Skills Development Fund being funded by DFIP and Punjab Economic Opportunities Programme is an example that the international donors are willing to fund and continue with the development programmes. A number of UN agencies are also continuing with the projects that were initiated in Punjab prior to the 2013-2014. The operations of UN Women are one such example, through UN Women, UN is funding a number of initiatives that promote women rights such as reproductive health, labour rights etc. The International Finance Corporation (IFC) is also in collaboration with the Lahore chamber of Commerce is working on introducing the importance of alternate dispute resolution such as mediation and arbitration in business cases where time could be save.

June 6, 2013 – June 5, 2014

Management of Unemployment

Legislative and Policy Interventions

None.

Key Steps Taken

The Akhuwat Group and the Government of Punjab planned to provide interest-free loans to unemployed skilled people in the Province under the Chief Minister's Khud Rozgar scheme. Rs. 2 billion has been allocated by the Government, which, in collaboration with Akhuwat, ensures transparency and merit. The main aim is to empower youth and provide opportunities to put their skills to use.

The Punjab Youth Internship Programme was launched in 2012–2013 and 20,000 students and new graduates in 2013–2014 went through an internship programme after which 50% of interns were recruited into the private sector and 50% into the public sector. The second phase of the project was launched to train 20,000 interns. The second phase saw an increase in both internship duration and intern stipends. At the end of the internship, 80% of the interns were recruited in the private sector and 20% were recruited in the public sector.⁴⁴

Two phases of the Skills for Jobs scheme of the Punjab Skills Development Fund (PSDF) were introduced in 2012–2013 and 2013–2014. In the first phase, 30,000 men and women were provided vocational training and in the second phase, 7,000 individuals were trained.⁴⁵ The Skills for Farms scheme was initiated in 2013 to conduct 2,250 trainings.⁴⁶ The Skills for Jobs scheme

was re-launched in 2013–2014 to train 22,000 individuals through 63 training service providers.⁴⁷

The third round for skills market schemes was inaugurated in 2014. In 2013, 4,000 women were provided vocational scheme training. The cost of this project for this phase was Rs. 397 million.⁴⁸

In 2014, Skills for Garments was launched to train 9,000 men and women from seven districts in Punjab.⁴⁹

Under the Skills for Health scheme, 200 individuals were trained to enhance core skills in paramedics.⁵⁰

The Skills for biogas plants aimed to train 3,500 individuals in the energy sector. The total cost for this project was Rs. 16.8 million.

Some 7,644 trainees of the Technical and Vocational Training Authority were employed in the public sector and self-employed from June 30, 2013 to May 2014.⁵¹

Analysis

Table 12 shows that in 2013–2014, the overall rate of unemployment in the Province had increased from 6.38 per cent to 7.02 per cent. The unemployment rate was higher in urban regions at 9 per cent in comparison to 5 per cent in the Province's rural regions in 2012–2013.

No new recruitments were made in 2014. However, 102,394 individuals were hired in 2012–2013 in the private sector from June to December and 59,744 recruitments were made in 2013–2014 from January to April (Table 13).

Table 12: Rate of Unemployment in Punjab (%)

	2012–2013	2013–2014 *Projected rate
Unemployment rate	6.38%	7.02%
Rural unemployment rate	5.44%	-
Urban unemployment rate	8.70%	-

Source: Government of Pakistan. 2014. "Pakistan employment trends 2013". Islamabad: Statistics Division, Pakistan Bureau of Statistics. Available from http://www.pbs.gov.pk/sites/default/files/Labour%20Force/publications/Pakistan_Employment_2013.pdf.

Table 13: The Number of Jobs Created in the Private Sector

	2012–2013 (June–Dec)	2013–2014 (Jan–Apr)
Number of jobs in the private sector	102,394	59,744

44. Government of Punjab. 2014. "Punjab Youth Internship Program". Lahore: Punjab Information Technology Board. Available from <http://pitb.gov.pk/pyip>. Accessed 24 February, 2015.

45. Government of Punjab. 2014. "Skills for jobs 2014". Lahore: Punjab Skills Development Fund. Available from <http://psdf.org.pk/skills-for-jobs-2014/>. Accessed 24 February, 2015.

46. Ibid.

47. Ibid.

48. Ibid.

49. Ibid.

50. Ibid.

51. Government of Punjab, Technical and Vocational Training Authority.

June 6, 2013 – June 5, 2014

Merit-Based Recruitment and Promotions

Legislative and Policy Interventions

The 18th Amendment devolved federal powers to the Provinces. This meant the appointment of former federal civil servants working in devolved ministries to provincial civil services. The Punjab Civil Servants (Amendment) Act, 2014 was passed in Punjab to streamline this process and allow the transfer of services to the Provinces.

Key Steps Taken

The position of the Chairman of the PPSC had been vacant as of June 2014, as the previous Chairman relinquished charge.

The total number of tenured positions held by acting officers from June 2013 to April 2014 was 11,137.⁵² The average service period for departmental secretaries as determined for 2013–2014, was a year and one month.⁵³

Some 1,204 government servants were recruited in 2013–2014.⁵⁴ The number of Government servants recruited through the PPSC was 368 during the period June 2013–April 2014.⁵⁵ Government servants recruited without NTS-managed tests from June 13 to

The total number of tenured positions held by acting officers from June 2013 to April 2014 was 11,137. The average service period for departmental secretaries as determined for 2013–2014, was a year and one month

April 13, 2014 numbered 315.⁵⁶ Another 162 Government servants were appointed on an ad-hoc basis during the period June 2013–April 2014.⁵⁷ Finally, there were nine senior-level positions in autonomous bodies during the period June 2013–April 2014.⁵⁸

Written tests/examinations are held between January and March 2014 (Table 14).⁵⁹

Table 14: Examination Details for Recruitment and Promotions

Basic scale	No. of posts	No. of examinations/ tests	No. of candidates appeared
BS-18	13	4	609
BS-17	250	22	26,951
BS-16	15	2	12,415
BS-14	702	3	36,791
BS-11	2	2	52
Total	982	33	76,818

52. Data provided by the Government of the Punjab.

53. Ibid.

54. Ibid.

55. Ibid.

56. Ibid.

57. Ibid.

58. Ibid.

59. Government of Punjab. 2014. "PPSC newsletter". January–March 2014, Vol. 3, Issue 9. Lahore: Punjab Public Service Commission. Available from [http://www.ppsc.gov.pk/ppsc_publications/9th%20Edition/index.html] Accessed 20 February, 2015

June 6, 2013 – June 5, 2014

Peace, Stability, and Order

Legislative and Policy Interventions

The Government of Punjab passed the Punjab Strategic Coordination Ordinance, 2014 to establish the Provincial Security Council to take steps in countering terrorism and to devise a security policy on the subject.⁶⁰

Key Steps Taken

A comprehensive security strategy was mapped out by the Punjab Police to ensure the safety of polio workers across the Province.⁶¹ A capacity building training workshop for senior-level police officers was also held in collaboration with the Police School of Information and Analysis.⁶² In the aftermath of sectarian attacks, a delegation of Punjabi Shia leaders met with the Inspector General of Police to discuss the terrorist attack in Rawalpindi during Muharram processions. A working group⁶³ session was held on November 6, 2013 under the guidance of the Turkish Police Force to build the capacity of the Punjab Police.⁶⁴ In September 2013, the Prime Minister approved the Punjab Government's decision to recruit 2,000 individuals for the new counter-terrorism force.⁶⁵ Lastly, the Inspector General of Police, Punjab approved the recruitment of constables and lady constables in 14 districts of Punjab in August 2013.⁶⁶

Analysis

During 2012-2013, the total criminal cases reported in the Province were 283,649, whereas 274,706 cases were reported during 2014. The number of convictions increased from 63,845 in 2012-2013 to 66,378 in 2013-2014. The success rate in contested cases increased by 0.5% in the given time span. Table 15 gives a comparative analysis of the status of the criminal cases prosecuted in the year 2013 and 2014. According to the Public Prosecution Department, Punjab, in 2014 the rate of convictions increased by 4%, case decided increased by 3%, success rate increased by 1 percentage point, uncontested cases decreased by 22%.

Table 16 shows the comparison of number of crimes

committed in Punjab in 2012–2013 and 2013–2014. The number of murders committed in the Province has decreased; 6,030 murders were committed in 2012–2013, whereas 5,900 were reported in 2013–2014; a 2% decrease. The number of assaults on public servants and the number of armed robberies both decreased. Gang rapes, however increased from 193 cases in 2012–2013 to 247 in 2013–2014; a 28% increase.

The number of kidnappings for ransom decreased by 12% in 2013–2014 in comparison to the previous year. Kidnappings/abductions increased by 2%; 103 cases were reported in 2012–2013 and 91 cases were reported in 2013–2014. Robberies increased by 33% in 2013–2014 and the percentage of motor vehicle thefts increased by 21% (Table 16).

According to the figures in Table 17, there was a considerable rise in the number of bomb blasts and suicide attacks in Punjab during 2013–2014 in comparison to 2012–2013. Bomb blasts increased by 67% and suicide attacks by 50%. Statistics show that the number of security forces personnel killed by insurgents decreased by 35% in 2013–2014 compared to the previous year. Despite the significant increase in attacks by insurgent terrorist organizations, the number of terrorists killed in encounters fell by 26% in 2013–2014. Punjab witnessed 4 sectarian attacks in 2012–2013 and 19 in 2013–2014; a 5-fold increase.

60. Iqbal, Javed. 2014. "Punjab establishes provincial security council". The Nation. 11 June. Available from <http://nation.com.pk/national/11-Jun-2014/punjab-establishes-provincial-security-council>. Accessed on February 25, 2015.
61. Punjab Police. 2014. "Press release, 28 February, 2014". Available from <http://punjabpolice.gov.pk/node/3225>. Accessed 25 February, 2015.
62. Ibid.
63. Ibid.
64. Ibid.
65. Manan, Abdul. 2013. "Punjab security: PM clears plan to hire 2,000 men for anti-terror unit". The Express Tribune. 15 September. Available from <http://tribune.com.pk/story/604520/punjab-security-pm-clears-plan-to-hire-2000-men-for-anti-terror-unit/>. Accessed 25 February, 2015.
66. Punjab Police. 2013. "Press release, 26 August, 2013". Available from [<http://punjabpolice.gov.pk/26082013pr>] Accessed 25 February, 2015.

June 6, 2013 – June 5, 2014

Table 15: Comparison of Prosecution of Criminal Cases in Punjab for the Year 2013 and 2014

Year	Contested			Uncontested	Consigned by Court
	Convictions	Decided	Success Rate		
2013	63,845	70,441	90.64%	67,957	145,251
2014	66,378	72,832	91.14%	53,058	148,816

Source: Data provided by the Public Prosecution Department, Government of the Punjab

Table 16: Crimes Committed in Punjab

	2012–2013	2013–2014	Per Cent Change
Murders committed	6,030	5,900	-2%
Assaults on public servants	1,800	1,705	-5%
Gang rapes	193	247	28%
Kidnappings for ransom	103	91	-12%
Kidnappings/abductions	14,592	14,879	2%
Number of robberies	10,784	14,343	33%
Motor vehicle thefts/snatchings	19,121	23,162	21%

Source: Government of the Punjab.

Table 17: Acts of Terrorism Committed in Punjab

	2012–2013	2013–2014	Per Cent Change
Suicide bombings	2	3	50%
Bomb blasts	9	15	67%
Suspected terrorist killed	19	14	-26%
Security forces killed	23	15	-35%
Sectarian attacks	4	19	375% or 5 folds increase

Source: Government of the Punjab.

June 6, 2013 – June 5, 2014

Poverty Alleviation

Legislative and Policy Interventions

None

Key Steps Taken and Analysis

19% of Punjab's population lives below the poverty line, which is the lowest among the four Provinces.⁶⁷ However, in Southern Punjab, approximately 35%–40% of households live below the poverty line.⁶⁸ The Government introduced various social protection programmes for poverty alleviation during 2013–2014. These included schemes for wheat subsidies, *Ramzan* packages, and public transport that amounted to Rs. 13.61 billion.

The Government of the Punjab in collaboration with the Department for International Development (DFID), UK launched the project “Punjab Economic Opportunities Programme”- (PEOP) in 2010-2011 in four poorest districts of Southern Punjab i.e., Bahawalpur, Bahawalnagar, Lodhran and Muzaffargarh. The Programme initially focused on poverty alleviation through provision of marketable skills and enhancing the quality and quantity of livestock in the region. During 2013-2014, out of 164 selected trainees, 139 trainees have completed 2 years Livestock Assistant Diploma (LAD) programme.

The Government has an on-going programme, the Southern Punjab Poverty Alleviation Project (SPPAP) to reduce the poverty of 80,000 households in Southern Punjab. The total Project costs, including physical and price contingencies, are estimated at Rs. 4,126.062 million equivalent to US \$ 49.120 million. IFAD financed 81.8% of the Project costs (US \$ 40.2 million) through a loan to GoP on highly concessionary terms. The Government of the Punjab is Co-financing 11.5% of Project Cost (US \$ 5.6 million). The beneficiaries will contribute 6.8% of Project Costs (US \$ 3.3 million) through in-kind contribution. The Loan became effective on September 30, 2011 with the signing of Financing Agreement. The SPPAP is to be completed by September 30, 2016 and closed by March 31, 2017. The amount allocated for this purpose in 2013–2014 was Rs. 900 million. The main objective of the project is to reduce poverty level in rural areas of the project districts through Asset Transfer, Vocational & Entrepreneurship Trainings, Productivity

The Government has an on-going programme, the Southern Punjab Poverty Alleviation Project (SPPAP) to reduce the poverty of 80,000 households in Southern Punjab. The total Project costs, including physical and price contingencies, are estimated at Rs. 4,126.062 million equivalent to US \$ 49.120 million

Enhancement Initiatives (PEI), and small scale Community Physical Infrastructures (CPIs) Schemes. Furthermore, under the Khidmat Programme, further development programmes were started in Southern Punjab at a total estimated cost of Rs. 15.9 billion in 2013–2014.

67. Arif Naved and Nizam Ali, 'Clustered Deprivation: District Profile of Poverty in Pakistan': Sustainable Development Policy Institute, 2012. Available online <http://www.sdpi.org/publications/files/Clustered%20Deprivation\district%20profile%20of%20poverty%20in%20pakistan.pdf> Accessed on May 20, 2015

68. Id.

June 6, 2013 – June 5, 2014

Public Procurement

Legislative and Policy Interventions

The Punjab Procurement Rules, 2014 were passed, repealing previous laws and rules on the subject. Like all government departments and public sector corporations using public funds, city district governments, district governments, Water and Sanitation Authority (WASA) and development authorities have to follow the Rules for the procurement of goods, works, services, and consultancy services.

The Punjab Procurement Regularity Authority (PPRA) established under the Punjab Procurement Regulatory Authority Act, 2009 has been further strengthened by the Punjab Procurement Rules, 2014. Clauses 15, 40, 42, and 50 were amended in the former.

Key Steps Taken

The PPRA Management Information System (MIS) testing phase meeting was held in June 2013 with the aim to ensure that target departments were briefed about the system. Their feedback was received and incorporated into the system. Some 22 capacity building workshops on the Punjab Procurement Rules 2014 were conducted during the period June 2013–June 2014.

24 private firms were blacklisted in 2013–2014.

'Resource management' was introduced under the Punjab Public Management Reform Programme (PPMRP). The target departments under the programme are required to use PPRA MIS for contracts. In addition to this, e-procurement modules will also be designed in collaboration with the PPRA to improve procurement systems.

All public procurement is carried out through an online bidding system. The PPRA website is informative and comprehensive. All sorts of bidding forms, tender announcements, pre-qualifications, and evaluations are available.

Analysis

There have been frequent violations of the Punjab Procurement Rules, 2014 due to a lack of capacity. The most frequently violations are related to:

- Procurement planning.
- Formulation of specifications.
- Delegation of powers to downstream officers to create procurement mechanisms.

- Response time.
- Pre-qualification of bidders.
- Blacklisting of suppliers and contractors.
- Bid security.
- Formulation of evaluation criteria.
- Announcement of evaluation reports.
- Selection of relevant procurement procedures.
- Understanding of the difference between emergency procurement and procurement in urgency.

In addition to the above, 1,454 irregularities were detected in public procurements from May 2013 to May 2014. Some 484 advices were issued during the period, 63 of which were sought through summaries.

More private firms were blacklisted in 2013–2014 (24 firms) than in 2012–2013 (16 firms) for procurement violations. This could either mean that there was more violations in 2013–2014 or that the Government of the Punjab became strict in application of the rules.

June 6, 2013 – June 5, 2014

Public Transport

Legislative and Policy Interventions

None.

Key Steps Taken

The Chief Minister of Punjab and the chairman of a Chinese company, NDRC, signed the agreement during a ceremony held in Shanghai in May 2014. The new project has been named the 'Orange Line Metro Train', which will be completed with an investment of US \$ 1.6 billion. The train track will be 27.1 km long.

The Government of Punjab has inducted new buses in the urban transport system through subsidy payments to operators.

The Transport Department has taken action against substandard CNG cylinders and removed 17,441 cylinders from PSVs in the larger public interest and safety of passengers. It also took action against PSVs using restricted dual fuel, which is strictly prohibited.

At present, public sector or public-private partnerships have not provided any intercity transport in the Province (June 2013–April 2014).

The Government initiated a customer complaint/suggestion centre (111 582 111 and 0331 444 0582) and SMS information portal (0332 582 0582).

The Government has introduced a route permit facilitation centre at the railway station.

On going initiatives include women-specific transport, senior/disabled citizens' cards and timely subsidy disbursements on a monthly basis.

Analysis

The total number of buses employed by the public sector or public-private partnerships for city transport in the Province from June 2013 to April 2014 was 5,883. The total number of buses employed by the public sector or public-private partnerships for city transport on dedicated tracks/lanes in Punjab from June 2013 to April 2014 was 64. The total number of passengers who used intercity transport provided by the public sector or private partnerships in the Province from June 2013 to April 2014 was Rs. 69 million.

The total number of passengers who used city transport provided by the public sector or public-private partnerships on dedicated tracks/lanes in the Province

was 150,000 passengers per day (42 million in 2013).

The computerization of the Transport Department in Lahore has been implemented and DRTS operations have started in five districts.

In 2012–2013, the successful completion and launch of the MBS took place in Lahore, which aimed at addressing the transport problems of urban residents with a cost of Rs. 30 billion. The MBS has provided efficient, affordable, and comfortable public transport system to commuters. It is serving around 150,000 commuters a day and providing a mode of travel to low-income urban dwellers. Furthermore, during the period under report, work on Rawalpindi-Islamabad MBS was initiated to address transport issues of the urban populace.

In order to encourage private investment in the public transport system in urban centres, an allocation of Rs. 1 billion was provided for subsidies for the induction of diesel/CNG buses in the urban transport system. The subsidy has been introduced to motivate investment in the sector, which is not usually attractive. This scheme will continue in 2013–2014 with an allocation of Rs. 500 million. The total budgetary allocation for public transport systems in the Province was Rs. 103,78.54 million and the total actual spending was Rs. 219.194 million, which is 27.16% of the total budget.

June 6, 2013 – June 5, 2014

Safe Drinking Water Supply

Legislative and Policy Interventions

None

Key Steps Taken

The Government of Punjab has launched a *Saaf Pani* (clean water) company. It was initially being handled by the Provincial Housing Department, but is now registered as a company under Section 42 of the Companies Ordinance, 1984. The company is to run a Rs. 12 billion project aimed at installing 1,479 filtration plants in 33 districts in Punjab where groundwater is either brackish or contaminated. The allocation for 2013–2014 was Rs. 500 million and was to be completed during the next fiscal year. RO filtration plants will be installed in the brackish water zone and UF plants in the contaminated water zone. Rs. 10.86 billion for water supply and sanitation schemes has been announced for 2013–2014, and the amount was slightly higher than the previous year's allocation of Rs. 10 billion.

The new schemes include the rehabilitation of non-functional rural water supply schemes in brackish water and *barani* areas, and the provision of services in 15 districts.

Under on-going programmes, 68 water supply schemes—37 urban and 31 rural—and 89 on-going programmes are under execution at a total cost of Rs. 8,593 million.

Major projects initiated were the Kasur Environmental Improvement Project and the Comprehensive Water Supply and Urban Water Supply Scheme, Toba Tek Singh, with a cost of Rs. 815 million.⁶⁹

Analysis

69% of the population in Punjab have access to safe drinking water this includes 95% of the urban population and 52% of the rural population. In 2013–2014, 274 safe drinking water supply schemes were implemented, which included 145 on going schemes and 129 new schemes. Out of these 274 schemes, 132 were completed; a 48% completion rate.

In order to achieve the targets to provide safe drinking water, an allocation of Rs. 10,868 million has been made in the ADP 2013–2014 out of which Rs. 2,811.50 million was for on going projects and Rs. 8,056.5 million was for new programmes.⁷⁰

Punjab has the lowest rate of access to water to its citizens and vast areas of South Punjab lack clean drinking water.

The various departments that are engaged in water and sanitation in Punjab are the Local Government and rural development, the Urban Unit, WASA in Lahore, Faisalabad, Multan, Rawalpindi, and Gujranwala, as well as municipal corporations in all other districts

Table 18: MTFD targets and MDGs⁷¹

Subsector	Population coverage (baseline year = 2001) (%)	Population coverage (2007–2008) (%)	Population coverage (2011–2012) (%)	MDG targets (2015)
Urban water supply (piped water coverage)	56	71.9	87	80
Rural water supply (piped water coverage)	25	32.7	48	65

69. Government of Punjab, ADB 2013–2014.

70. Government of Punjab, Development Programme, 2013–2014.

71. Ibid.

June 6, 2013 – June 5, 2014

Table 19: Water Supply and Sanitation: Summary of ADP 2013–2014 (Rs. in millions)

Subsector	Capital	Revenue	Total	Foreign aid	Total
On going schemes					
Rural water supply and sanitation	0	816.686	816.686	0	816.686
Urban water supply and sanitation	0	1,963.752	1,963.752	0	1,963.752
Punjab basis	0	31.062	31.062	0	31.062
Total	0	2,811.500	2,811.500	0	2,811.500
New schemes					
Rural water supply and sanitation	0	0.000	0.000	0	0.000
Urban water supply and sanitation	0	56.500	56.500	0	56.500
Block	0	8,000.000	8,000.000	0	8,000.000
Total	0	8,056.500	8,056.500	0	8,056.500
Total (on going and new)	0	10,868.000	10,868.000	0	10,868.000

June 6, 2013 – June 5, 2014

Sanitation

Legislative and Policy Interventions

The Punjab Sanitation policy is currently awaiting approval of the Government. This policy aims to provide access to safe and affordable sanitation in the Province.

Key Steps Taken

Under on going programmes, 74 sanitation schemes—31 urban and 43 rural—are being executed at a cost of Rs. 101,84.700 million. Major projects initiated include the Kasur Environmental Improvement Project with a total outlay of Rs. 2,273 million, the Urban Sewerage Scheme in Pattoki at a cost of Rs. 436 million, the Urban Sewerage Drainage Scheme in Muridke at a cost of Rs. 489 million, the Comprehensive Water Supply and Sewerage Scheme in Mianwali at a cost of Rs. 350 million, the Comprehensive Sewerage Scheme in Bahawalnagar at cost of Rs. 200 million, and the Urban Water Supply Scheme, in Toba Tek Singh at a cost of Rs. 815 million.

Community participation and mobilization has been made mandatory in project identification and execution for sustainability. Quality has been assured through third-party validation and the engagement of consultants.

Analysis

93% of the urban population and 60% of the rural population has access to sewerage systems in the Province. A high percentage of households in rural Punjab—with the exception of rural Islamabad (three %), Gujranwala (seven %), and Sialkot (nine %)—lack toilet facilities. District Rajanpur has the highest percentage of households lacking toilets (78%).

The Government has allocated Rs. 10.86 billion for water supply and sanitation schemes for 2013–2014 and the amount is slightly higher than the previous year's allocation of Rs. 10 billion. In 2013–2014, the Provincial Government allocated Rs. 4,047 million specifically for the sanitation sector.

In the budget 2013–2014, Rs. 2.81 billion has been allocated for 145 on-going schemes and Rs 8.056 billion for 11 new schemes. The on-going schemes include 31 urban sewerage and drainage schemes. The

on-going schemes also include 43 rural sewerage and drainage schemes.

Some 274 schemes were implemented in 2013–2014, which included 145 on-going schemes and 129 new schemes. Of these 274 schemes, 132 were completed, which represent an almost 48% completion rate.

The various departments that are engaged in water and sanitation in Punjab are the Local Government and rural development, the Urban Unit, WASA in Lahore, Faisalabad, Multan, Rawalpindi, and Gujranwala, and various municipal corporations in all other districts.

There is no water treatment facility in Lahore, and the Lahore WASA is admittedly dumping untreated water in the Ravi River through sewerage drains. According to official data from the Punjab Irrigation and Power Department,⁷² the largest of these drains are the Shadman drain (162 cusecs of discharge), the Farukabad drain (106 cusecs), the Buddha Ravi drain (44 cusecs) the outfall drain (128 cusecs), the Gulshan-e-Ravi disposal (177 cusecs), the Babu Sabu drain (165 cusecs), and the Hudiara drain (430 cusecs). Raw sewage from Lahore's municipal drains is also discharged untreated into the Ravi River at various points.⁷³

Other than raw sewerage from the whole city and its adjoining areas, there are thousands of cusecs of untreated industrial and municipal toxic effluents being discharged into the irrigation system, which has far-reaching social and environmental implications. Heavy metals and poisons eventually end up in fields along the river and degrade soil quality, thereby reducing yields and contaminating crops. It is a major source of groundwater pollution and degradation. Effluents contain large amounts of toxic chemicals, heavy metals, and microbial contamination. The water is even unfit for washing and bathing.

72. Government of Punjab, Irrigation Department.

73. Government of Punjab, Punjab Irrigation and Drainage Authority (PIDA).

June 6, 2013 – June 5, 2014

Tax Collection

Legislative and Policy Interventions

Punjab Sales Tax on Services (Enforcement) Rules 2014 passed in September 2014 to increase the sales tax of Services of Construction to the standard rate of 16% instead of the reduced rates and to decrease the sales tax applicable to Services of Property Developers to reduced rates.

Key Steps Taken

Punjab has created the Punjab Revenue Authority with the mandate to administer and collect sales tax on service.

The Excise and Taxation Department has provided property tax calculator and motor vehicle tax calculator on official website. Computerisation of property tax record for 6 districts has been completed. It has also provided online verification of the particulars of vehicles. Toll free helplines were activated.

Analysis

In the year 2013-2014, the Punjab Government

collected taxes of Rs. 111.7 billion against the budget target of Rs. 126.7 billion.⁷⁴ This illustrates that the Provincial Government was Rs. 15 billion short of meeting its target for the fiscal year. Having said that, in the previous fiscal year 2012-2013, the tax revenue of collected by the Punjab Government was Rs. 78.4 billion; which is 29.81% lower than the amount collected in the year 2013-2014. In addition, during 2013-2014, the fixed estimated target of collection of agricultural income tax was Rs. 830.00 million only against the fixed target of Rs. 2 billion. Whereas, the revised estimates of the tax collected from profession, trades and callings was Rs. 684.711 million, which is Rs. 101.35 million more than the budgeted estimates. The Table 20 demonstrates that indirect taxes collected during 2013-2014 fiscal year increased by 22.39% in comparison to the previous fiscal year.

The Government increased the tax collection target in 2013-2014 for Board of Revenue and Excise and Taxation departments and they missed their targets of tax collection by 7% and 15% respectively. (Table 21)

Table 20: Details of Receipts 2013-2014 (Revised)⁷⁵ (Rs. in millions)

Head of Account	Accounts 2012-2013	Budget Estimates 2013-2014	Revised Estimates 2013-2014
Tax Revenues	78,386.663	126,702.799	111,788.994
Direct Taxes	19,641.616	31,076.815	27,453.875
Tax on Income	827.344	2,018.938	830.000
Property Tax	4,495.931	11,952.120	9,964.110
Land Revenue	9,778.133	11,583.643	11,036.299
Tax on Profession, Trades	504.868	583.359	684.711
Indirect Taxes	4,035.340	4,938.755	4,938.755

Table 21: Comparison of the Budget Estimates for Board of Revenue and Excise and Taxation 2012-2013 and 2013-2014*

Head of Account	Accounts 2012-2013	Budget Estimates 2013-2014	Revised Estimates 2013-2014
Department	Budget Estimates 2012-2013	Budget Estimates 2013-2014	Target Achieved** / Per Cent Change
Board of Revenue	30,588.603	37,918.950	35,390.659 / -7%
Excise & Taxation	18,836.122	20,946.905	17,831.776 / -15%

*Source: White Paper Budget 2013-14, Finance Department, Government of the Punjab, Available Online [http://punjab.gov.pk/system/files/White_Paper_2013-14.pdf] Accessed on June 1, 2015

**Source: White Paper Budget 2014-15, Finance Department, Government of the Punjab, Available Online [http://punjab.gov.pk/system/files/WP2014_15.pdf] Accessed on June 2, 2015

74. Huzaima Bukhari and Dr. Ikram ul Haq, 'Punjab: Tax collection performance Business Recorder online [http://epaper.brecorder.com/m/2015/01/16/3-page/479915-news.html] Accessed on January 29, 2015

75. Id.

June 6, 2013 – June 5, 2014

Transparency

Legislative and Policy Interventions

The Punjab Transparency and Right to Information Act 2013 was enacted in Punjab.⁷⁶

As per the Punjab Transparency and RTI Act, 2013, a public body shall publish in electronic form or otherwise an annual report of its activities during the previous fiscal year by 31 August, each year. The report must be made available for public inspection free-of-charge and for purchase at a reasonable cost.⁷⁷

Information Commission Punjab was also established under the Act and 3 information commissioners were appointed during the reporting period.

Key Steps Taken

One of the intervention areas under the PPMRP being executed by the PRMP, P&D in collaboration with the World Bank is 'transparency and access to service'. Under this area, target departments and attached organizations are required to furnish updated information on their websites, which includes information regarding the institution/organization, services, operations, and budgets, etc.

Analysis

So far, just 400 of 800 requests for information have been responded to by the Information Commission of Punjab.⁷⁸ However, the Commission has not been allocated any budget under the current budget allocation of 2014–2015 and the information commissioners have yet to be allotted office facilities. However, already existing office spaces provided to them by the Government of Pakistan are being utilized.⁷⁹ A supplementary budget was, however, allocated to this cause.⁸⁰

The Commission has allocated 600 public information officers. These officers are generally Grade 16 officers.⁸¹

Under the law, only one person has been penalized for not abiding by the Punjab Transparency and RTI Act, 2013. 30 people have been given show-cause notices. However, these individuals have not been penalized.⁸²

76. Punjab Laws Online. Undated. "The Punjab Transparency and Right to Information Act, 2013 (Act XXV of 2013)". Available from <http://punjablaws.gov.pk/laws/2547.html>. Accessed February 9, 2015.

77. Ibid.

78. Government of Pakistan, Punjab Information Commission.

79. Ibid.

80. Ibid.

81. Ibid.

82. Ibid.

June 6, 2013 – June 5, 2014

Use of Technology for Better Governance

Legislative and Policy Interventions

None.

Key Steps Taken⁸³

The Punjab Government undertook the following initiatives during 2013-2014:⁸⁴

- IT based solution for improvement of various business processes in key departments including Police, Health, Transport and Public Prosecution Departments as well as Lahore High Court.
- Police Reforms in 100 Model Police Stations of Punjab through Information Technology
- Computerization of land records in Punjab is an on going programme and so far lands of 15 districts have been computerized till June 2014. Computerization of Lands Records for 7 Districts was completed in 2013-2014. Service delivery of computerised land records is available at 37 tehsils of Punjab.
- Incubation Centers for IT startup firms to provide IT Training, manpower development for latest tools and technologies and IT awareness.
- Introduction of Citizen E- Services aiming at automation of service delivery component of Government.

“Punjab E-Gateway Project” was completed under which a Data Centre was established to shares resources among departments. Punjab Information Technology Board (PITB) developed and maintained various websites of the Government departments.

The Transport Department was computerized by giving all District Regional Transport Authorities (DRTAs) the technology to issue automated route permits, certificates of fitness, bus stand licenses, and goods forwarding agencies. This became operational in ten districts in 2013-2014.

In order to address the rise in unemployment in the Province, especially the urban districts, the PYIP was launched in 2012–2013 to build the capacity of 20,000 youths in computer proficiency and communications skills. This programme was re-launched in 2013–2014 to further train 20,000 individuals and help them find jobs in the private and public sectors.

Furthermore, the website on Public and Strategic Planning Unit was launched. During 2013, approximately 150,000 applications were processed through the Online College Administration System across the Province for Intermediate Admission Cycle in over 200 colleges. Plan 9 TechHub was launched in January 2014 to provide freelancers a platform to connect and progress.

Analysis

The allocated budget for 2012–2013 was revised from Rs. 2,400 million to Rs. 5,167 million in 2013-2014.

Table 22: Allocated budget for the Punjab Information Technology Board (Rs. in millions)

Year	Budget estimate	Per Cent Change
2012–2013	2400	115% increase
2013–2014	5167	

83. Government of Punjab. 2014. “Punjab Information Technology Board”. Lahore: Punjab Information Technology Board. Available from <http://www.pitb.gov.pk>. Accessed February 15, 2015.

84. White Paper Budget 2013-14, Finance Department, Government of the Punjab. Available online [http://punjab.gov.pk/system/files/White_Paper_2013-14.pdf] Accessed on February 15, 2015.

June 6, 2013 – June 5, 2014

Water Resource Development and Management

Legislative and Policy Interventions

None.

Key Steps Taken

Key steps included the lining and remodelling of distributaries and minor canals in Sadiqia, Dera Ghazi Khan, and the Jhang Branch canal commands.

The construction of small dams took place. These included dams in:

- Shahbazpur, Taja Bara, Sadrial, Haji Shah, and Sowra in district Attock.
- Arrarar Mughlan dam in district Chakwal.
- Chahan dam in district Rawalpindi.
- Pindori dam in district Jhelum.

Analysis

Water management covers the programmes and projects relating to irrigation, drainage, groundwater, flood management and mitigation, development of small dams, energy, and environment. The stated goal of the Government is to provide adequate, equitable, and reliable irrigation supplies to the cultivable lands of Punjab, aiming at enhanced agricultural productivity with a focus on broad-based institutional reforms.

The allocation for the water sector increased from Rs. 11,250 million in 2012–2013 to Rs. 22,401 million in 2013–2014; an increase of almost 100%. This constitutes about 12% of the ADP, 2013–2014 budget under the MTDF, 2013–2016.

Project outlays for the sector in 2014–2015 and 2015–2016 are Rs. 30.845 billion and Rs. 31.935

billion, respectively. Out of the total 59 schemes included in the MTDF, 2013–2014, 19 schemes—15 on-going and 4 new schemes—have been targeted for completion by allocating 90% of the outlay to the on-going ones and 10% to the new ones.⁸⁵

The ADP, 2013–2014 includes the rehabilitation of Jinnah Barrage, Khanki Balloki, and the Slemanki Headworks with estimated costs of Rs. 12.7 billion, Rs. 23.4 billion, and Rs. 2.4 billion, respectively. Substantial allocations have been provided in the current fiscal year to launch the execution of these important projects, including the construction of a subsidiary weir at Jinnah Barrage and undertaking preparatory works at the Balloki Headworks.

Other than development schemes, overall expenditure on the irrigation sector has also increased from Rs. 8,718.297 million in 2012–2013 to Rs. 9,552.284 million in 2013–2014, which is a marginal increase.

Table 23: Budgetary Allocation for Water Resource Development and Management, 2013–2014 (Rs. in millions)

Sector		Capital	Rev	Total	Foreign aid	Total
	New	1,197.0	0.05	1,197.5	900	2,097.5
Irrigation	On going	4,205.5	137.00	4,342.5	15,961	20,303.5
	Total	5,402.5	137.50	5,540.0	16,861	22,401.0

85. Government of Punjab, Annual Development Programme.

June 6, 2013 – June 5, 2014

Appendix A

Members PILDAT Governance Assessment Group (GAG)

(List of members from Serial No. 1-25 is sorted in alphabetical order by last name)

No.	Name & Designation
1.	Mr. Ahmed Rafay Alam Lawyer; Vice President Punjab Pakistan Environmental Law Association; Director Lahore Waste Management Co. Lahore
2.	Mr. Abdul Hakeem Baloch Political Analyst/Formal State Minister for Railways Quetta
3.	Mr. Salman Bashir Former Foreign Secretary of Pakistan Islamabad
4.	Mr. Mohammad Feyyaz Peace & Security Expert Lahore
5.	Lt. Gen. (Retd.) Moinuddin Haider Former Governor Sindh; Former Interior Minister Karachi
6.	Mr. Shahid Hamid Senior Advocate, Supreme Court; former Governor of the Punjab & Federal Minister Lahore
7.	Dr. Tariq Hassan Former Chairman SECP, Senior Lawyer Islamabad
8.	Mr. Javed Ashraf Husain Former Chief Secretary Sindh Karachi
9.	Mr. Nohman Ishtiaq Public Finance Management Expert Islamabad
10.	Mr. Arshad Saeed Khan Senior National Specialist (Education), (UNESCO) Islamabad
11.	Dr. Zulfikar Khan Coordinator (Health System), World Health Organization (WHO) Islamabad
12.	Mr. Shamsul Mulk Former Caretaker Chief Minister; Former Chairman WAPDA Peshawar / Islamabad
13.	Dr. Niaz Murtaza Development and Political Economist, Senior Fellow UC Berkley Islamabad

June 6, 2013 – June 5, 2014

14.	Dr. Hafiz A. Pasha Former Advisor to the Prime Minister Lahore
15.	Mr.Saeed Ahmed Qureshi Former Chief Secretary Sindh Islamabad
16.	Mr. Salman Akram Raja Advocate, Supreme Court Lahore
17.	Dr. Aziz urRehman Faculty Member, International Islamic University Islamabad
18.	Mr. Ghazi Salahuddin Senior Journalist/Analyst Karachi
19.	Mr.MujiburRehmanShami Editor in Chief, Daily Pakistan Lahore
20.	Dr.ShoabSuddle Former Federal Tax Ombudsman / Former I.G. Police Islamabad
21.	Ms.Rabia Sultan Director, Farmer's Association Pakistan Lahore
22.	Ambassador (Retd.) AyazWazir Former Ambassador Islamabad
23.	Mr. Abdullah Yusuf Chairman IPPAC, Former Chairman FBR Islamabad
24.	Syed Ali Zafar Advocate Supreme Court Lahore
25.	Dr. S. Akbar Zaidi Economist Karachi
26.	Mr. Ahmed Bilal Mehboob President, PILDAT Islamabad / Lahore
27.	Ms. Aasiya Riaz Joint Director, PILDAT Islamabad / Lahore



Islamabad Office: P. O. Box 278, F-8, Postal Code: 44220, Islamabad, Pakistan
Lahore Office: P. O. Box 11098, L.C.C.H.S, Postal Code: 54792, Lahore, Pakistan
E-mail: info@pildat.org | Website: www.pildat.org